

Whigham, S

'Anyone but England'? Exploring anti-English sentiment as part of Scottish national identity in sport

Whigham, S (2014) 'Anyone but England'? Exploring anti-English sentiment as part of Scottish national identity in sport. *International Review for the Sociology of Sport*, 49 (2). pp. 152-174.

doi: 10.1177/1012690212454359

This version is available: <https://radar.brookes.ac.uk/radar/items/7106e6a7-cefc-4354-a557-77e2bca7c45d/1/>

Available on RADAR: December 2016

Copyright © and Moral Rights are retained by the author(s) and/ or other copyright owners. A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge. This item cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission in writing from the copyright holder(s). The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holders.

This document is the postprint version of the journal article. Some differences between the published version and this version may remain and you are advised to consult the published version if you wish to cite from it.

‘Anyone but England’? Exploring anti-English sentiment as part of Scottish national identity in sport.

Abstract

This article explores the reasons behind the expression of anti-English sentiment by Scots in relation to both sporting and wider social contexts, whilst also considering the impact of migration to England on the attitudes expressed by members of the Scottish diaspora. Drawing upon the conceptual framework of ‘narrative identity’ proposed by Somers (1994), data was generated through semi-structured interviews which focused upon the ‘ontological’ and ‘public’ narratives of Scottish identity as expressed by Scots living in England. The findings demonstrate the influence of a wide range of personal, social, historical and political factors in highlighting the cleavage between Scotland and England within the context of sport and society, allowing for a more nuanced understanding of the complex relationship between these two nations in the context of sporting rivalry. This relationship is argued to be heavily influenced by the existence of an ‘underdog mentality’ grand ‘public narrative’ for Scots in relation to their English neighbours, based on perceived differences in economic and sporting resources between the two countries. This ‘underdog mentality’ therefore acts as a legitimating force for the expression of anti-English sentiment in both a sporting and wider social context for some individuals as part of their ‘ontological narrative’, although the extent of such sentiment was found to vary significantly between individuals and contrasting contexts.

Key words – anti-English, Scotland, national identity, sport, narrative

Introduction

Analyses of the relationship between national identity and sport have been considerably prevalent within academic discussion in the sociology of sport, with numerous writings highlighting the potential of sport for engaging individuals with the concept of the 'nation', whether on an emotional or political level (Bairner, 2001; Duke and Crolley, 1996; Maguire, 1999; Smith and Porter, 2004; Tomlinson and Young, 2006). The topic of Scottish national identity and sport has also been critically examined in a plethora of academic studies (Bairner, 1994, 1996, 2001; Blain and Boyle, 1994; Giulianotti, 1991, 2005; Jarvie and Walker, 1994; Kelly, 2007; Kowalski, 2004). Such studies have often discussed the sporting rivalry between Scotland and England, and it has been argued that one aspect of Scottish national identity is the display of anti-English sentiment in sport. Such sentiment has been argued to be most evident during major sporting events (Blain and Boyle, 1994; Watson, 2003), and received significant media attention and debate during the recent 2010 FIFA World Cup following controversy regarding the sale of 'Anyone But England' T-shirts in stores in Scotland for fans who wished to clearly express their support for England's sporting opponents (BBC News, 2010; Collins, 2010; Hassan, 2010; Kelly, 2010). However, the specific topic of anti-English sentiment has often only been discussed as part of a wider consideration of Scottish sporting identities, and has only acted as the central focal point of discussion in the work of certain authors (Bairner, 1994; Moorhouse, 1984, 1986, 1987, 1995). Furthermore, there are only a few studies which have sought to frame this topic in the context of the wider sociological, historical and political factors which underpin the relationship between the Scots and the English.

This article aims to critically examine the reasons why certain Scots express anti-English sentiment during sporting events. In order to address this central topic, the investigation adopts a narrative analysis approach to unpick the stories, myths and influences which shape ideas of the Scottish nation

and national identity for Scots. Specific consideration is given to the ways in which experiences of migration impact upon Scots' identification with their home nation by focusing solely on Scots living in England as the research sample. Scots living in England provide a particularly interesting case study given that their relocation to England is likely to impact upon their own notions of national identity, due to their assimilation into a social environment with differing predominant identity forms and the potential challenges faced for maintaining and expressing a 'Scottish' identity. Given that out of the estimated 1.25 million native Scots living outside of their home nation approximately two-thirds (circa 800,000) of them live in England (Ancien, Boyle and Kitchin, 2009; Sim, 2011a), this section of the Scottish diaspora represents a group of significant interest in understanding the complex nature of contemporary Scottish national identity.

Scotland, Identity and 'Narrative Identity'

In order to produce a more nuanced discussion of the national identity of the Scottish diaspora in England in relation to sport, it is important to consider different conceptualisations which exist in relation to the term 'identity'. The importance of this task for understanding Scottish national identity is further underlined given concerns expressed regarding the reifying use of the term 'identity' in academic circles, with particular attention given to the risk of displacing the wider claims for national or political 'recognition' within which such identities are fostered (Fraser, 1997, 2000; Jarvie, 2009, 2012; Parker and Harris, 2009). It is therefore important to examine the relationship between Scottish identity, political nationalism and sport in an attempt to avoid the problems of 'displacement' and 'reification' (Fraser, 2000) which may result from a superficial focus on Scottish identity as an end in itself. Although it is not the aim of this study to fully explicate the intricacies of such a debate, later discussion will attempt to briefly contextualise the political, economic and social factors which may

impact upon contemporary notions of ‘Scottishness’. However, before turning to this task, discussion will focus upon providing a necessarily limited overview of three major conceptions of ‘identity’ which have been predominant in academic discussion, before focusing upon one specific theorisation of identity which will be applied in the current research.

Hall (1992) identifies three different conceptions of identity which have loomed large in theoretical analysis of the self and identity in different eras – the ‘Enlightenment’ subject, the ‘sociological’ subject, and the ‘post-modern’ subject. The ‘Enlightenment’ subject position views the individual as fully unified with an essential core identity which remains stable throughout life, whereas the conceptualisation of the ‘sociological’ subject developed out of an awareness of the impact of significant others, societal values and culture in shaping an individual’s sense of self. The final conception is that of the self as the ‘post-modern’ subject, which contrasts with the singular view of identity espoused through the ‘Enlightenment’ and ‘sociological’ subjects. The ‘post-modern’ conceptualisation argues for the existence of multiple identities which are historically and temporally defined, and which can be transitory, shifting and fragmented. The importance of appreciating the multifarious and shifting nature of these complex, multiple identities has received significant support in recent thinking on the relationship between sport and social identity (Parker and Harris, 2009). However, Hall (1990) argues that in order to counter the destabilising nature of multiple identity forms for an individual’s notion of self, an individual may need to construct a stable ‘narrative of self’ which synthesises the contrasting multiple identities into a more coherent form.

Hall’s (1990) discussion of a ‘narrative of self’ closely links to Somers’ (1994) conceptualisation of ‘narrative identity’, which acts as the guiding conceptual framework for the current study. Somers’ conceptualisation epitomises both a post-modern conceptualisation of self-identity and the ‘narrative turn’ which has had a significant influence on the social sciences since the 1980s (Reissman, 1993). Somers uses the concept of ‘narrative identity’ as a means of moving away from narratives and stories

as merely representational forms in literature, reinforcing the argument that narratives are the means by which individuals are able to make ontological sense of their various isolated life experiences by forming a coherent narrative which synthesises these fragmented experiences. Importantly, Somers (1994; Somers and Gibson, 1994) also argues that the concept of 'narrative identity' allows for a relational and historical approach to identity which has analytical value in understanding the complex dialectical relationship between the self at an agency level and society at a structural level.

To explicate this argument, Somers identifies four dimensions of narrative which occur at different sociological and theoretical levels. 'Ontological narratives' signify the narratives used by individuals as the means by which to make sense of their experiences on a personal level. However, Somers also identifies 'public narratives' which are attached to external social formations, ranging from informal networks of family and friends to formal institutions such as the media, education, government and religious organisations. These two dimensions encapsulate the sociological duality that individual social agents are at once impacted upon by external social forces and institutions, whilst also being the very constituents which create these forces and institutions. It can be argued that the same dialectic exists between the ontological narratives which accumulate to shape and recreate public narratives, which in turn influence ontological narratives, and so on and so forth. On a more abstract theoretical level, Somers also identifies the existence of 'metanarratives' and 'conceptual narratives'. 'Metanarrative' is the concept used to identify the narratives "in which we are embedded as contemporary actors in history and as social scientists" (Somers, 2004: 619), exemplified by grand sociological, philosophical and historical theories and ideologies such as 'Progress', 'Enlightenment', and 'Capitalism v Communism', amongst others. She also argues that 'conceptual narratives' are required to develop a social analytic vocabulary which can accommodate the temporal, spatial and historical nature of narratives, be it 'ontological' or 'public'.

The synergy between Somers' (1994) conceptualisation of identity in narrative form and the study of national identity per se is underlined by Hall (1992). Developing his discussion of the 'post-modern' subject, Hall argues that national identity is in part due to an individual participating in the narrative idea of the nation. He identifies five elements of the imagination of the 'nation', including a narrative of the nation (as exemplified in Somers' (1994) notion of 'public narratives'); an emphasis on origins, continuity and tradition; the 'invention of tradition' (Hobsbawm, 1983); foundational myths; and ideas of a 'pure' original people or folk belonging to that nation. Hall argues that national culture is a discursive device which is used to reinforce and maintain adherence to ideas of the nation. It is therefore of interest to examine how these elements of the imagined nation and national culture, with its associated 'public' narratives, may impact upon the 'ontological narratives' which influence an individual's sense of identity in relation to their nation, thus allowing for a consideration of the analytical utility of Somers' (1994) conceptual framework for investigating Scottish national identity.

Scottish National Identity and Sport

The case of Scotland provides an additional layer of analytical challenge in relation to major perspectives on nationalism. Although most theorisations of nationalism take the 'nation-state' as the starting point for analysis, Scotland is a prime example of a 'submerged nation' wherein a shared community has a clear notion of itself as a distinct nation on a social, cultural and political level, without having a parallel representation in terms of sovereign statehood. As noted earlier, it is important to appreciate the complex relationship between 'Scottish' identity, nationalism and the Scottish political context in order to avoid the 'reification' of identity by studying it in isolation from its wider political, social and historical foundations (Jarvie, 2009, 2012; Parker and Harris, 2009). Although it is beyond the scope of this study to unpick all of the complex characteristics of the Scottish

nation, it is clearly useful to provide an overview of some of the distinctive sociological and political features which inform thinking about the Scottish nation and identity.

McCrone (1992) provides one of the most wide-ranging attempts to produce a sociological analysis of the complexities of the contemporary Scottish nation, and acts as a useful resource for producing such an overview. Whilst accepting that notions of Scotland as a nation have indisputable links with territory and landscape, McCrone also argues that Scottish identity has a somewhat forged nature in its association with symbols such as tartanry, 'Kailyard' literature, and Clydesidism. Similar arguments were offered in the analysis of Scottish national identity and culture by Trevor-Roper (1983), although his stance regarding the extent to which these traditions are 'forged' without any historical roots has been widely disputed (McCrone, 1992; Jarvie, 1991, 1993). McCrone also highlights a number of commonly held myths in relation to distinctive ideas of Scottish nationhood and identity, such as Scottish egalitarianism and the idea of mobility through education for all. Furthermore, McCrone (1992) emphasises the importance of Scottish civil society and its 'holy trinity' of independent church, legal and educational systems (as retained within the terms of the 1707 Act of Union which created the United Kingdom) for maintaining perceptions of Scotland as a distinct 'submerged nation' within the United Kingdom. However, McCrone is quick to clarify that the notion of a distinctive Scottish identity is not indicative of a singular Scottish identity per se, highlighting the divisive effects of multiple regional, religious and class-oriented identities which would undermine such a claim.

Drawing upon wider literature on nationalism and national identity, one of the most frequently cited concepts is Anderson's (1991) 'imagined community'. Given that ideas of shared cultural and social bonds with fellow inhabitants are central to forging a Scottish identity as a 'submerged nation', the concept of the 'imagined community' remains useful for analysing the resonance of the Scottish nation as part an individual's identity. However, Anderson's definition of the 'imagined community'

of the nation leads to an interesting debate about the status of Scotland. The 'imagined' nature of the Scottish nation through ideas of common cultural, social, ethnic and political bonds has been argued to be evident in Scotland (Trevor-Roper, 1983; McCrone, 1992), as is an idea of a clearly 'limited' spatial character in terms of its shared borders with England and the existence of 'Scottish' islands. However, Scotland's lack of full political self-determination causes problems in fully endorsing Anderson's conceptualisation of the nation as 'sovereign', despite the devolution of certain political powers since the re-establishment of the Scottish Parliament in 1999 and the nation's relative autonomy within the terms of the 1707 Act of Union due to its independent civil society (Kellas, 1995; McCrone, 1992; Paterson, 1994). However, given the success of the pro-independence Scottish National Party in securing an overall majority in the May 2011 Scottish Parliamentary Elections and thus the opportunity to hold a referendum on Scottish independence (expected to be held in autumn 2014), there is potential for Scotland to further reclaim its political sovereignty as an independent nation-state in the near future if a 'Yes' vote supporting independence is returned.

Turning to the specific link between Scottish national identity and sport, many authors have argued that sport is one of the most common spheres for expressing ideas of the nation in the contemporary era. Kellas (1998) claims that sport is the most popular form of nationalist behaviour in many countries, and Bairner (2001) suggests that the prevalence of sport in expressions of nationalist sentiment lies in part in the opportunity it provides to bring the 'imagined community' of the nation to life, providing it with both physical form and voice. Drawing upon the work of Forsyth (1992), Bairner (1996) argues that sport represents the most popular manifestation of Scottish national identity within Scotland. This claim is supported with reference to the fact that certain sports operate as distinct elements of civil society within Scotland in much the same way as McCrone's 'holy trinity', with independent teams representing Scotland (rather than the United Kingdom) reinforcing the notion of a distinct Scottish nation (Bairner, 1994; Jarvie and Walker, 1994; Duke and Crolley, 1996; Moorhouse,

1987). However, numerous analyses of the links between Scottish sporting national identity and political nationalism have found little correlation between the two (Bairner, 1996, 2001; Jarvie, 1993; Jarvie and Walker, 1994; Kelly, 2007). Such arguments appear to add credence to the concerns expressed by Fraser (1997, 2000) and Jarvie (2009, 2012) regarding the ‘displacement’ of claims for material redistribution and political recognition for an independent Scottish state due to a greater emphasis in Scottish sport on a patriotic national identity rather than a political, separatist movement. Bairner (1994, 1996) argues this may be due to religious and regional fissures within Scotland which eliminate the possibility of adhering to a singular Scottish identity, suggesting that it may be safer to be a ‘90-minute patriot’ rather than a political nationalist in Scotland given the divisions caused by these fissures. The divides within Scottish society and Scottish sport have been discussed at length elsewhere, with particular attention paid to the impact of ethnic, sectarian and racial discrimination in destroying the notion of a coherent ‘Scottish’ identity (see Bradley, 1995, 2002, 2006; Dimeo and Finn, 2001; Finn, 1991a, 1991b; Horne, 1995).

Nonetheless, Blain and Boyle (1994) highlight the fact that media coverage of Scottish international sport, especially football, contains a significant prevalence of national-symbolic ideas, stories and narratives in relation to the Scottish nation and identity as a whole. Prevalent narratives of football include representations of Scotland as an underdog, a schizophrenic tendency between scepticism and optimism, and notions of distinct Scottish styles of play. Other team sports such as rugby are also clearly associated with Scottish national identity, as are individual sports to the extent that individual Scottish performances are valorised over other British successes. However, football has tended to dominate discussions of Scottish national identity in sport given its level of popularity (Bairner, 1994). It is within the context of football where particular consideration has often been afforded to the relationship between Scotland and England, and the specific topic of current scrutiny – anti-Englishness.

Anti-Englishness and Scottish Identity in Sport

The relationship between Scotland and England as part of the United Kingdom is complex. Miller (2005) attributes the complexities of this relationship to the relative population sizes of the countries and the realpolitik of island union which has led to asymmetric migration patterns to England from Scotland. This asymmetry is also reflecting in the political economy of the United Kingdom regarding the relative distribution of wealth, resources and political control between Scotland and England, given England's historically superior position with regards to all three of these aspects. Miller (2005) also argues that whilst England represents the 'significant other' for Scottish identity in comparative terms, this comparison is seldom reciprocated towards Scotland. One particular aspect of this complex relationship revolves around the expression of anti-English sentiment on a personal, social, cultural or political level (Hussain and Miller, 2005a, 2005b; McIntosh, Sim and Robertson 2004a; Watson, 2003). The extent of this sentiment can range from comical remarks (whether off-hand, benign, or deliberately provocative) to more violent and abusive actions, although McIntosh, Sim and Robertson (2004a: 44) argue that academic discussion of this phenomenon has tended to emphasise the "overwhelmingly benign nature of much anti-Englishness". Importantly for this study, sport represents one particular domain of Scottish identity expression where this sentiment is most openly expressed (Bairner, 1994, 1996).

The work of Moorhouse (1984, 1986, 1987, 1994, 1995) represents the most comprehensive consideration of the existence of anti-English sentiment in Scottish sport. He identifies the dependent relationship between Scotland and England as the primary factor in the expression of anti-Englishness. He also argues this relationship results in a 'repressed nationalism' for Scots in sport (Moorhouse, 1986), notions of superiority and inferiority between the two nations (Moorhouse, 1987), and resentment due to significant migration flows of Scottish footballers to England (Moorhouse, 1987,

1994, 1995). Summarising the extent of this anti-English sentiment, Moorhouse (1987: 200) went so far as to identify “what binds Scots together – a dislike of the ‘English’ which has historical, material and cultural roots and which is given colour and circumstance, among other things, in the regularities of the structure of British football”. Moorhouse (1986, 1987) develops this argument by highlighting the importance of football fixtures between Scotland and England, arguing that these events were often associated with nationalist symbolism and references to historical battles. Moorhouse (1986) argues that for Scots to overcome the problems of their ‘repressed nationalism’ they need to avoid referring to England as a significant other for comparison. However, it is important to note that the work of Moorhouse was produced prior to the establishment of the Scottish Parliament in 1999, and thus requires a note of caution regarding the position of his arguments in a post-devolution Scotland which has altered the political ‘dependency’ of Scotland in relation to England.

Other works on Scottish sport and identity have also considered the existence of anti-English sentiment, whilst avoiding the more polemical stance adopted by Moorhouse. Bairner (1994) argued that anti-Englishness is one of the main ingredients of Scottish sporting identity, and later suggested that this part of Scottish identity has remained salient as it offers the opportunity to foster a sense of unity in Scottish identity, overcoming other religious, socio-economic or regional schisms within the country (Bairner, 2001). Dimeo and Finn (2001: 30) take a more cautious position regarding the extent of anti-Englishness, arguing that “anti-English attitudes of varying importance and intensity are displayed in, and through, Scottish football... however anti-English sentiments have not been a constant feature of Scottish society and Scottish football, despite uninformed comment to the contrary (e.g. Moorhouse, 1984, 1986, 1991)”. Kelly (2007) also discusses mixed findings regarding the extent of anti-Englishness in Scottish sporting identity, highlighting that although England is often identified as the significant other in relation to Scotland and some fans express a degree of anti-English sentiment in specific sports, none of his interviewees expressed anti-English sentiment in a wider sense. He

summarises his arguments on this subject by aligning with Giulianotti's (1991: 522) assertion that Scotland is abandoning its "cultural dislike" of England. However, in their study of English migrants living in Scotland, McIntosh, Sim and Robertson (2004b) found that sport remained a major outlet for the expression of 'tribal' anti-Englishness. To further understanding of this aspect of Scottish sporting identity, we will similarly turn to the consideration of a diasporic group who can shed a great deal of insight into the complexities of Scottish national identity – Scots living in England.

The Scottish Diaspora in England

Study of the Scottish diaspora has attracted increased academic interest in recent years, boosted by diaspora engagement initiatives supported by the devolved Scottish Parliament since its establishment in 1999 (Sim, 2012). Whilst the majority of studies of the Scottish diaspora have focused on emigrants in farther-flung regions of the globe such as North America, the Caribbean, the Asian sub-continent and Australasia (e.g. Devine, 1992; McCarthy, 2007a, Sim, 2011b), some studies have also considered the migration of Scots to England (McCarthy, 2005, 2007b; Sim, 2011a). McCarthy (2005) argues that the extent of Scottish migration to England is comparable to the migration rates to overseas locations, but that there has been a lack of study of the Scottish diaspora in England, partly due to the conceptualisation that Scots moving to England is simply an example of internal migration within a nation-state. In contrast with her findings on the Scottish diaspora in North America and Australasia (McCarthy, 2007a) which involved more institutionalised types of Scottish cultural association in the form of Scottish societies, cultural associations and customs, McCarthy (2005) argues that Scots in England adopt a more implicit, social-mental Scottish identity whilst integrating more fully with the local culture. Although later studies (McCarthy, 2007b; Sim, 2011a) have considered the important role of societies for the Scottish diaspora in England, the memberships of such societies has declined

significantly in recent decades in comparison to similar societies in farther-flung locations. McCarthy (2005) argues that this difference is partly due to the contrasting historical eras in which such forms of migration took place, but is also due to cultural similarities between Scotland and England which ease assimilation into society. Nonetheless, Scots living in England still use a number of strategies to maintain a Scottish identity and links with their Scottish home, such as the development of personal networks to maintain links with home and with other Scots in England, as well as the use and maintenance of accent and/or dialect as a form of distinction (McCarthy, 2005).

Studies of the relationship between sport and the Scottish diaspora have also tended to look beyond England as a geographic context; however, they still offer significant relevance for the current discussion. Jarvie's work (1991, 2000, 2005) provides a detailed historical and sociological account of the development of the Highland Games in Scotland and overseas. Jarvie demonstrates that a number of Scottish and Highland societies were established in the USA and Canada to assist Scottish émigré in their integration to their new home, allowing for the establishment and maintenance of a number of customs associated with Highland culture, including Highland gatherings and games. However, Jarvie (1991, 2005) also reflects upon the different culture of North American Highland Games compared to those held in Scotland, arguing that the North American Highland Games have retained a romantic and mythologising view of the 'authentic' traditions and symbolism of Highland and Scottish culture. Giulianotti's work (2005; Giulianotti and Robertson, 2006, 2007) again focused on the Scottish diaspora in North America, based upon the study of a number of North American Supporters' Clubs (NASCs) for Rangers and Celtic fans. Giulianotti (2005) argued that football represented a key social activity for members to retain their sense of identity by recreating sporting cultures from Scotland. He argues that football has added importance for the Scottish diaspora given the status of Scotland as a stateless nation, providing the opportunity to foster national pride, express cultural and politicised anti-English sentiment or non-English distinctions, and foster identities related to religious divisions

associated with the Old Firm in Scotland. Giulianotti and Robertson (2006, 2007) further develop their analysis of NASCs and the Scottish diaspora in relation to the concept of ‘glocalization’, asserting that the development of such clubs represents an example of transplanting a local culture from ‘home’ to a new global context. They also highlight three issues which face the Scottish diaspora in terms of maintaining national identity in face of a culturally cosmopolitan environment, arguing that such a situation results in selective identification with Scottish cultural national identity by migrants, a process of ‘banal relativization’ of Scottish culture vis-à-vis North American culture, and the existence of alternative translocal associations which can undermine and compete with the importance of national identity to the Scots diaspora.

Although the finding of these studies shed some light on to the importance of sport for the Scottish diaspora, the significant contrasts between the social and cultural contexts experienced by the Scottish migrants in North America from previous studies compared to those in England underline the importance of the current study. Given that the focus of her study was on ideas of national identity and the Scottish diaspora in general, it is telling that McCarthy’s (2005) data makes direct reference to the relationship between Scottish identity, anti-Englishness and sport. Whilst a number of interviewees argued that anti-English sentiment was bred in Scotland before relocation to England, one specific interviewee gave consideration to the argument that Scots are anti-English in football. He argued that the English “claim that when England are playing another team at football that we in Scotland will support the other team against England and it doesn’t matter how much I tell them that is complete nonsense they still insist that that is the fact” (interview with Doug Black, cited in McCarthy, 2005: 177). This exemplifies aspects of the debate which will be evaluated in depth throughout the forthcoming discussion.

Methodology

Before turning to the central theme of this article, it is important to explain that the conceptual framework underpinning the current research is narrative analysis, with emphasis placed on identifying and analysing the predominant narratives which underpin Scottish national identity. Specifically, the narrative dimensions framework proposed by Somers (1994) of ‘metanarratives’, ‘public narratives’, ‘ontological narratives’ and ‘conceptual narratives’ outlined above has been utilised as a organising principle, with particular emphasis placed upon the relationship between ‘public’ and ‘ontological’ narratives. Somers (1994) asserts that engaging with the ontological dimension of narratives allows studies of identity to avoid crude categorising of identity forms, highlighting that incorporating dimensions of time, space and relationality allows for a more nuanced understanding of the shifting and individualised nature of an individual’s notion of identity.

The key focus of this methodology is to identify and exemplify the core narratives in each dimension, and to examine the ways in which they consciously or unconsciously influence identity formation at an ontological narrative level. The emphasis of the application of this conceptual framework is to explain how individual subjective identities are shaped by external factors such as civil society institutions, media discourses, and historical myths and narratives in relation to Scotland (Blain and Boyle, 1994; Kellas, 1998; McCrone, 1992; Smith, 2001). ‘Public’ narrative analysis involves examining the role of the media, education and other social institutions in Scotland, whilst ‘ontological’ narrative analysis revolves around understanding the stories constructed by individuals in understanding and perpetuating a ‘Scottish’ identity alongside other forms of self-identity, concepts and factors which social researchers have applied to this area of study. In the current study, particular consideration is given to the potential impact of such narratives for the expression of anti-English

sentiment by Scots by shedding light on the range of attitudes expressed by Scots towards England, the English population and English sport.

Data was generated through 13 semi-structured interviews conducted in 2011, ranging in length from 35 to 135 minutes. A theoretical snowball sampling strategy was used, attempting to identify respondents who provide a range of different age groups and sufficient gender representation. The only criteria specified for participation in the study was that the participant must have been born in Scotland and must currently reside in England. Initial contact was made with 5 personal acquaintances in various geographic locations in south east England and the East Midlands known to meet the above criteria. The 8 further participants were recruited through secondary contact with personal and professional acquaintances of the original 5 participants. A particular interest in sport was not deemed a pre-requisite for participation in order to examine a wider range of stances on the central topic of anti-Englishness in sport, although the majority of participants did express a level of interest in sport which assisted extended discussion of these issues.

Given the relatively idiographic nature of this project and its sample, attempting to claim any degree of 'theoretical saturation' is beyond the remit of the current study. However, the starting point for the following analysis is that any search for a singular Scottish identity is futile. To argue such a stance would be to ignore the subjective and unique nature of an individual's notion of self, as well as the shifting nature of identity, both temporally and contextually. It is therefore of more analytical interest to produce rich data which prioritises the importance of each respondent's unique opinions, attitudes and personal experiences in relation to Scottish national identity, as well as the central topic of anti-English sentiment expressed by Scots.

To this end, the interviews adopted the 'life story' approach discussed by Atkinson (1998), aligning with similar studies of the Scottish diaspora (McCarthy, 2005, 2007a; Sim, 2011a, 2011b, 2012). The aim of these interviews was to explore the development of each individual's ideas of

national identity as part of their personal narrative in depth. This style of interview allowed for an analysis of the development of national identity in differing personal backgrounds, as well as an appreciation of the alternative ways in which each individual maintains their national identity since their migration to England. All interview data was recorded and fully transcribed, with each respondent given a pseudonym to protect their anonymity. The data was analysed using a thematic narrative analysis strategy. This strategy aimed to identify themes linked to personal and public narratives in relation to Scottish national identity and anti-English sentiment, as well as identifying commonalities between the different respondents in their opinions and attitudes.

Narratives of Scotland, England and Anti-Englishness

Scotland v England and the 'Underdog Mentality'

Summarising the perceived differences between Scotland and England within the political economy of the United Kingdom is a crucial step in understanding anti-English sentiment, as this helps demonstrate the way in which England acts as the significant other against which Scots compare their worth, as argued elsewhere (Kelly, 2007; Miller, 2005; Moorhouse, 1986). One contrast cited by a majority of respondents was the view that England was financially richer than their neighbours in Scotland, positioning Scotland as an underdog in the relationship between the two countries. The perceived differences in wealth and lifestyle were also deemed to impact upon certain characteristics of the stereotypical English persona, such as a sense of superiority and entitlement. In addition, differences in prevailing political opinion were frequently discussed, with Scotland argued to hold more egalitarian and socialist political leanings in comparison to England. These perceived economic, cultural and political differences reflect a number of the 'myths' of the Scottish nation discussed by

McCrone (1992), and were often argued to stem from prevalent narratives emanating from family, educational institutions and the media.

One particular element of Scottish identity which was repeatedly flagged up was the prevalence of an ‘underdog mentality’ in Scotland, and this narrative clearly has relevance to understanding the existence of anti-English sentiment in sport. The prevalence of this mentality was particularly referred to with regard to Scotland’s relationship with England, and feature was discussed by 9 respondents in various different ways:

“We’re, whether rightly or wrongly, perceived to have limited resources, y’know, it’s a little sort of David against Goliath kind of thing, y’know. So I’m rooting them on because they’re the underdogs” (Richard)

This ‘underdog mentality’ tended to be portrayed as a positive quality, with emphasis on the common bond felt with other nations who were felt to possess similar positions within global society. It could be argued that the existence of this ‘underdog mentality’ narrative acts as something of a legitimating force in relation to the potential expression of anti-English sentiment, justifying such behaviour with recourse to Scotland’s inferior status in its relationship with its larger neighbour (McIntosh, Sim and Robertson, 2004a).

The ‘underdog mentality’ narrative appears to take the form of the ‘public narratives’ proposed by Somers (1994), and was argued to be transmitted in a number of different fashions within Scottish society. Frequent references were made to the prevalence of this mentality in family interactions as well as in popular cultural narrative forms such as print media and films, as found in Blain and Boyle’s (1994) analysis of Scottish sports media coverage. It was argued that this also resulted in persistent myths about England and the English:

“...if I hadn’t went away, I’d still have a chip on my shoulder, like “the English are all out to get us”. And it’s such a prevailing myth in Scotland. I mean, teachers tell you it.” (Bert)

The role of education, both formal and informal, in transmitting narratives of the Scottish nation also provoked considerable discussion amongst the interviewees. A number of respondents identified ways in which the content of the Scottish education system concentrated upon studying various subjects in relation to distinct Scottish topics. The frequency of such comments may be viewed as somewhat surprising, given frequently expressed concerns regarding the lack of primacy given to Scottish history and culture in the Scottish curriculum (Mycock, 2012), although this could be explained due to the important role of informal, family-influenced education regarding Scottish historical events. Nonetheless, education did appear to be one sphere in which ‘banal’ nationalist flagging, as discussed by Billig (1995), was prevalent. In particular, topics covered in Scottish history education were argued to place particular emphasis on the historical events, dynamics and alleged exploitation which shaped the relationship between Scotland and England:

“And like everything that we learned was to do with battles. It was a lot to do with like Scotland overcoming England, which I feel like it affects a lot of people and how they view sport and that sort of thing, because it was always like the underdogs against big, bad England... like all of the sort of like battles that were like hundreds and hundreds of years ago. Like, people still bring that up, y’know, the invasions and all that sort of stuff. People sort of feel like they have to defend Scotland, and like England need to go down, and that sort of feeling still exists I think.” (Michelle)

Anti-English Sentiment in Sport

To what extent does, as argued by Michelle, this feeling still exist? Starting in the realm of sport, a variety of different stances in relation to the question of anti-Englishness were expressed by my participants. However, the majority of interviewees did provide evidence for the existence of Scots' support for England's sporting opposition:

“I just don't want to lose to England. It's not so much the winning, it's just not wanting to lose. And it's the same when they play someone else. I don't actually want them to lose. I just don't want them to win.” (Scott)

“For some reason, you seem to support the other team... (laughs)... when England are playing!” (Mark)

Whilst this view was shared by 7 of the 13 interviewees, a number of others demonstrated more supportive views for their English neighbours in sport, some in all circumstances:

“I'm very much for England, whoever they play. I like to see them do as well as they can... living here for all this time, I don't really have any issues with the English.” (Paul)

And others in more selected or strategic situations:

“I kind of try to formalise a bit, which is if England have a friendly, I want them to lose. Absolutely, I never want them to win a friendly, because I'm not harming England, it's just

funny. I love it when they lose to small teams... but in tournaments, my rule of thumb is that I support them providing they play well” (Bert)

Of particular note was a common view that football was the main sport in which anti-English sentiment was expressed. Although rugby was also seen to be a domain in which anti-English stances were voiced, this was viewed to be less intense and common than in football, with one respondent explaining this difference in relation to ideas of relative social class representation in the sports’ respective support bases. An interesting example in the debate on the extent of support for England involved the sport of cricket, where a number of respondents who expressed more intense attitudes of anti-English sentiment in football and rugby changed tack dramatically. Individual sports such as athletics, tennis and golf were also argued to be less afflicted with the issue of anti-English sentiment, although Scots were often given additional support over their English counterparts. One commonly cited reason for this was due to the existence of an inclusive British representative team at the Olympic Games in contrast to the separation between Scotland and England found in most team sports, with all participants expressing support for British athletes competing at such events. It therefore appears that the majority of any negative sentiment expressed by participants was ‘anti-English’ rather than ‘anti-British’ in nature in sport. However, given the controversy surrounding the possible participation of Scottish players in the ‘Team GB’ football team at the 2012 London Olympic Games against the wish of the Scottish FA (see Ewen, 2012), it will be potentially interesting to re-examine the extent of Scottish support for these Olympic athletes during and after the event, as this issue was not discussed in depth in the current research.

In terms of justifying the expression of anti-English sentiment in sport, one of the primary reasons suggested by a number of respondents was simple enjoyment at England’s failure. Such opinions were deemed to be particular strong during major sporting events. Whilst some describe the negative effects

of England winning a major event in a tongue-in-cheek manner, others expressed more strong sentiments:

“I just couldn’t cope with their celebrations, with the going on about it. I mean... it would just be horrible. It’s very hard to describe, I just know that... awwww... it’s already making me feel a bit sick just at the thought of it!” (Bob)

The role of the media coverage of English sport was another major factor cited in justifying an anti-English stance. This issue carries added significance for the Scottish diaspora in England in particular given that they are more likely to be exposed to ‘English’ or ‘British’ media coverage and narratives in comparison to their compatriots living in Scotland, who are more likely to consume media forms which are produced and broadcast from a ‘Scottish’ perspective. Of particular annoyance to a number of interviewees was the role of broadcasters and sporting commentators in overemphasising the quality of English teams, burdening them with unrealistic expectations. An even greater fear for some participants concerned the consequences of England’s sporting success in terms of its media coverage. A key word which was repeated by a number of interviewees in relation to the emotions experienced when England fail in major tournaments was ‘relief’, with numerous mentions of England’s success in the 1966 FIFA World Cup as an example of what can happen. Words such as ‘painful’, ‘horrible’ and ‘relentless’ were amongst others which described the celebrations and exhortations of English victories.

Although some argued that the levels of hysteria made England’s failures all the more enjoyable for them personally, most interviewees admitted that the expression of such feelings is rooted in a degree of jealousy in relation to the relative success of English sport in comparison with Scotland’s representatives. The importance of the Scottish ‘underdog mentality’ public narrative again comes to

the fore here, with a number of people arguing that England's position as the significant other for sporting comparison is one reason behind the stance of some Scots:

“You have this group mentality of... I think you have this feeling of Scotland's always the underdog, and you always want the underdog to do well, don't you? And England's always got so much more money, and so many better teams. And they have players here and there, and you don't want them to win, like.” (Morag)

A number of interviewees argued that the competitive principles which lie at the heart of sport's appeal also encourage people to take sides and express stronger feelings. When Scots take sides in relation to sporting fixtures featuring England, some argued that adopting the opposite team was a conscious or unconscious effort to derive more enjoyment from such events. Given that Scotland themselves has failed to qualify for a major football tournament (i.e. FIFA World Cup or UEFA European Football Championships) since 1998, it may be that such a strategy has grown in importance for Scots in recent years. This could also explain the view of the interviewees that rugby slightly less-inflicted with anti-English sentiment, given that Scotland is consistently represented at international events such as the Rugby World Cup.

One argument which was supported unanimously was that the expression of anti-English sentiment by Scots is in a large part a means by which fun rivalry and 'banter' is generated. For Scots living in England especially, this can be one strategy for creating enjoyable workplace dynamics and relationships in their English surroundings. Another interesting argument related to this point is the proposition that Scots even play up to the stereotypes of Scots being anti-English in sport, as discussed by McCarthy's (2005) respondent Doug. It was argued that, to a certain extent, Scots can perform the role expected of them by others in relation to the expression of anti-English sentiment, both

consciously and subconsciously. Finally, reference was also made to other factors which encourage anti-English sentiment in sport, such as perceptions and/or experiences of English football supporters and their association with hooliganism, a dislike of arrogance in certain English players, and frustration related to the use of national anthems at major sporting events.

Anti-English Sentiment in Scottish Society

The common explanations for anti-English sentiment provided above all relate to specific issues from the world of sport per se. However it is also important to consider whether such sentiment translates to a wider social context. In line with Kelly's (2007) findings, not one of the interviewees felt that they personally demonstrated any anti-English sentiment outside of sport, contrasting sharply with the context of sport where just over half stated they supported England's opposition at all times. Whilst demonstrating that sport appears to be 'fair game' for the expression of such opinions, this finding is relatively unsurprising given that it would be unusual for Scots migrants to convey negative feelings about the people who constitute the friends, partners, family and colleagues in their lives in England.

Nonetheless, there was wide acceptance of Hussain and Miller's (2005a; 2005b) arguments that elements of anti-English sentiment did exist in the attitudes and behaviours of fellow Scots, particularly those who live in Scotland. Although most interviewees argued that this tended to be a minority viewpoint, some argued that the extent of general anti-English feeling in Scotland was more widespread. They suggested that such attitudes were culturally accepted in Scotland on a wider basis, contrasting with the arguments of Giulianotti (1991) and Kelly (2007). This general anti-English sentiment was most commonly found to manifest itself in terms of verbal abuse directed towards England and the English. Others highlighted relatively low-level anti-English sentiment by providing

examples of poor attitudes towards English visitors by Scots, with English accents often argued to prompt such behaviour. This echoes the findings of McIntosh, Sim and Robertson (2004a: 48), who argued that the English accent acts a “*marker of difference*” which creates potential ill-feeling due to the negative preconceptions certain Scots may associate with a stereotypical ‘English’ identity and ascribed persona. Such preconceptions could again be argued to emanate from certain ‘public narratives’ which prevail in Scotland regarding England and English people.

A number of other interviewees referred to personal experiences and secondary knowledge of situations where anti-English sentiment resulted in more extreme, dangerous or violent attitudes from Scots. Some of these examples were again linked to the context of sport:

“...when Gascoigne scored, it all kicked off. We were in the pub, and it all kicked off. And I have to say, all the unpleasantness came from the Scots. And also, you see that rabid anti-Englishness at times and it’s not attractive, 'cause ultimately it’s about football” (Scott)

Whilst the majority of respondents argued that an extreme minority of Scots were involved in such situations and refuted the suggestion that elements of racism or xenophobia were displayed by Scots towards the English, some interviewees were more willing to accept potential accusations of more deep-seated negativity. These more extreme views were explained in relation to ideas of territorial defensiveness and a tribal mentality amongst Scots. Although the ‘underdog mentality’ of Scots was argued to be used by this perceived minority as a justification for some of these more serious attitudes and behaviours, such examples show that is important to avoid presenting Scots as innocent parties in a David-and-Goliath relationship with the English. However, this issue does demonstrate the manner in which the underdog ‘public narrative’ can potentially influence the ‘ontological narrative’ and

subsequent behaviour of certain Scots, whereby recourse to common public stereotypes is used as a means of justifying negative or deplorable actions.

Furthermore, it seems that the jealousy demonstrated by Scots towards the English in sport is also found to a certain extent in the wider social context, with the differences in relation to wealth and opportunities often cited as a justification. This sense of divide was again argued to lie in issues which predate contemporary forms of jealousy. Drawing upon earlier discussion of the teaching of Scottish history in both formal and informal educational settings, the references made to historical battles between the two countries was highlighted by the majority as an influence on notions of deep-seated rivalry and conflict stretching back for centuries. Although some interviewees expressed an awareness that narratives presenting these events as a straightforward case of Scotland versus England are often inaccurate, it was well-accepted that references to historical conflicts between the two nations still inform some ideas regarding their relationship.

The complex political relationship between Scotland and England was also suggested as a source of anti-English sentiment. Scotland's existence as a 'submerged nation' was held by many to cause resentment, with feelings of injustices founded in the sense of Scotland being politically ruled by an 'English' parliament at Westminster. The era of Margaret Thatcher's Conservative government was viewed as being particularly relevant in a growth of anti-English feeling. The increased devolved powers gained by the establishment of the Scottish Parliament in 1999 were viewed as helping to appease such feelings in recent times, and a number of interviewees noted that the current possibility of an independence referendum for Scotland posed interesting questions for the future of the relationship between Scotland and England. However, most interviewees felt that the expression of a Scottish identity in sport showed very little correlation with the expression of Scottish political nationalism despite the recent success of the SNP in Scottish politics, echoing the arguments of Bairner (1994). Whilst the position of Fraser (1997, 2000) and Jarvie (2009, 2012) may argue that this is symptomatic

of the problem of ‘displacement’ of claims for Scottish political recognition due to a focus on fostering a ‘Scottish’ identity, it appears there is an equal risk of over-politicising the issue of Scottish national identity in the context of sport given the opinions and perceptions of the interviewees regarding the lack of correlation between sporting and political nationalism.

Alternatives to ‘Anyone but England’

Discussion to this point has been heavily skewed towards exploring an anti-English position rather than a pro-English position. However, this runs the risk of misrepresenting the attitudes of the interviewees who clearly demonstrated a great deal of balance in their attitudes. This highlights the need to conclude this discussion by briefly presenting the numerous reasons cited by the interviewees for stances which avoid anti-English feelings. For example, it was argued that the expression of anti-English feelings in sport was part of conscious attempt to distance and distinguish the Scots from the English:

“It’s non-English rather than anti-English, I think, except in the realm of sport. And the non-English thing, I think again it links back to other things we’ve talked about, which is a sense of our own inherent superiority, that we’re actually better than them. Not in a concrete sense in better at anything, just more favoured in some sense by being Scottish. And also a feeling we have that English people are not liked elsewhere, which we like to believe in.” (Bob)

Alternatively, whilst the influence of parents was argued to influence negative stances towards the English for some interviewees, supporting the findings of McCarthy (2005), the same was true in encouraging stances which avoiding such sentiments due to the existence of a more tolerant approach

by some parents towards England. Other factors such as education levels and exposure to people from different cultures, particularly England, were also viewed as important for challenging negative preconceptions disseminated in potentially anti-English 'public narratives'. Given that all the interviewees are part of the Scottish diaspora currently residing in England, the challenges to potentially negative attitudes are likely to have been greater than their counterparts living in Scotland:

“I think the contact’s everything. I think the contact changes... I mean, I’m not saying... I’m not saying that everybody who doesn’t have that contact is going to be in a racist position, and everybody who does have that contact isn’t. But I think you... what contact does is it challenges any stereotypes that you might hold anyway, so it helps them to evaporate when you meet different people who don’t conform to your stereotypes.” (Michael)

The majority of participants stated that moving to England and their assimilation into English culture had considerably challenged any preconceptions or attitudes they had previously held. A frequent argument made was that the experience of living in England had resulted in a much greater appreciation, understanding and affection for the English people than had existed whilst living in Scotland. Furthermore, for those who had started a family in England the process of maintaining an identification with Scotland became significantly more challenging. The majority of those who had children highlighted that they encouraged their children to feel at least partly Scottish or hold connections with Scotland. However, the simple fact that their own children were English in nationality, and often in identification, clearly challenged the interviewees’ own feelings in relation to Scotland, mimicking the feelings of Giulianotti’s (2005; Giulianotti and Robertson, 2006, 2007) sample in North America. Regardless of whether their children opted to align with Scotland or England, the very fact that their own flesh and blood were English in terms of nationality and, for some, national

identity seriously undermined the attitudes the participants personally expressed regarding English sporting success:

“...wanting England to lose, that’s what I feel guilty about. Y’know, wanting England to lose at a sport, and I don’t think I should feel like that... it made me really challenge why I’m anti-English... why should I entertain anti-English ideas if my kids are English?” (Harry)

The frequency of such responses emphasises the importance of appreciating the fluid and evolving nature of identity, especially so for members of the Scottish diaspora aiming to maintain a strong identification with their homeland. As attitudes and behaviours previously held to be important markers of ‘Scottishness’ in common ‘public narratives’ are challenged by new experiences and events during an individual’s life course or ‘ontological narrative’, reflexive processes of evaluation and re-negotiation regarding the expression of one’s national identity can potentially result in significant shifts in attitudes and behaviours.

Conclusions

The quotes provided above exemplify the depth to which participants were able to explain and rationalise the existence of anti-English sentiment in sporting and non-sporting situations, and demonstrates that the phenomenon is one they have afforded prior consideration. Indeed, my own personal reflections of this nature are the very inspiration for tackling this topic through empirical investigation. Given my own position as a Scot living in England, the motivations behind the current study are at the very least partially due to a degree of ‘navel-gazing’. Aligning myself strongly with the arguments of Bourdieu (1988, 1990; Bourdieu and Wacquant, 1992) regarding the need for

'epistemic reflexivity' in sociological research, it would be remiss to fail to consider the impact of myself as the researcher on my findings. On the positive side, the similarity of my position to that of my interviewees allows for a great degree of insight and empathy in relation to the dilemmas they may face in expressing their opinions regarding this topic. However, there exists a danger that my own opinions, biases and interests may result in the neglect of certain views in favour of those which support my own explanations for these phenomena. I have attempted to overcome this by staying true to the responses of the interviewees by presenting their opinions in order of the frequency of their occurrence. Whilst demonstrating a reflexive awareness of these perils can help to consciously avoid these dangers, it would be disingenuous to claim any position of complete objectivity. Indeed, the very subjectivity of my own position as a fellow Scot may help generate more honest responses. It would be interesting to compare the responses offered by the respondents if the same questions regarding the expression of anti-English sentiment had been asked by an English researcher.

Nonetheless, the frank discussions held with my interviewees regarding the topic of anti-English sentiment have generated a considerable number of contrasting explanations. Whilst summarising the main findings regarding the topics runs the risk of painting this extremely complex phenomenon into a simplistic picture, it is sufficient to say that the expression of anti-English sentiment in sport is the result of the complex interaction of social, historical and political factors which act to reinforce a partial cleavage between Scotland and England. This relationship appears to be viewed in relation to a grand 'public narrative' of Scotland as the 'underdog' in an unequal relationship with its English neighbour which is often used to justify a number of the attitudes and opinions which are expressed as part of an individual's 'ontological narrative' of self when Scotland and England are juxtaposed in discussion. However, a danger exists in exaggerating or generalising the extent not only of this 'underdog mentality' but also the degree to which anti-English attitudes are expressed by Scots.

Instead, I will content myself by arguing that whilst evidence of anti-English sentiment was found in my interviewees' responses regarding both their own personal stances and that of others, it appears that this phenomenon is considerably more common in sport and for many only exists in the sporting domain. Its existence in sport tends to be rooted in rivalry, fun competition and 'banter' between the Scots and English, although the degrees of seriousness contrast significantly between different individuals. In certain sports, particularly football, feelings appear to be somewhat stronger, and are often stoked by the nature of media coverage of English sport which can exacerbate tensions by transmitting an air of superiority and arrogance in the opinions of their Scottish neighbours. Although this can result in heightened enjoyment and/or relief for Scots in situations where England fail to succeed in sport, in certain contexts the impact of heightened atmospheres and alcohol-lowered inhibitions can lead to more serious or violent reactions. These findings provide some support for the arguments of Moorhouse (1984, 1986, 1987, 1994, 1995), but seek to avoid over-exaggeration of the extent of anti-English sentiment. It was often felt that sport was 'fair game' and represented the most appropriate context for its expression. Outside of sport, the expression of more overt and serious anti-English actions were associated with the extreme minority of cases, and the participants who did express some anti-English sentiment in sport demonstrated very little cross-over with regards to such feelings in non-sporting situations.

The selection of Scots living in England as the sole sample for this study added an additional dimension of interest. By considering the personal narratives of each individual, it was possible to explore how the experiences of starting a family and social networks in England had challenged their preconceptions and feelings about where constituted their 'home'. The importance of having children in England appeared to have a particularly profound impact upon such interviewees' identification with Scotland, and it would be interesting to further study the dynamics of family identity for first and second generation Scottish diaspora members in England and elsewhere, as also suggested by

Giulianotti (2005). Given the lack of academic consideration given to Scots living in England highlighted by McCarthy (2005), this research has been able to demonstrate that the Scottish diaspora living in England face specific challenges for maintaining a ‘Scottish’ identity as do Scottish diasporic groups in geographic locations further afield. However, supporting McCarthy’s (2005) findings, the manner in which Scots in England maintain a link with their homeland contrasts significantly with those elsewhere, with no evidence in the current set of interviews of the institutionalised forms of engagement with Scottish society or sport through society membership, contrasting the findings of Jarvie (1991, 1995, 2005) and Giulianotti (2005; Giulianotti and Robertson, 2006, 2007). However, given the relatively idiographic nature of this study, this is an issue which merits further study.

This study has demonstrated that adopting a more rigorous approach in understanding a complex social phenomenon such as anti-English sentiment over a reversion to simple stereotypes allows for a much more nuanced and balanced understanding of the reasons for its existence. The use of Somers’ (1994) conceptualisation of narrative identity and narrative dimensions as a guiding conceptual framework has allowed for a more systematic yet nuanced approach to the complexities of the relationship between sport and national identity. The epistemological stance adopted by Somers (1994) argues that the narratives adopted by a given individual must be examined empirically given their individualised and shifting nature, allowing social scientists to avoid presupposing the narratives individuals create and use. Examining the dialectical relationship between ‘public’ and ‘ontological’ narratives of Scottish identity has demonstrated that the myths and stories which prevail in Scottish society and culture impact upon an individual’s understanding of what it means to be ‘Scottish’. For example, a number of interviewees highlighting the necessity to renegotiate their identification with their home nation following their relocation due to the negative preconceptions of England and the English which had been ‘bred’ during their upbringing in Scotland. Such insights are often missing in other portrayals of phenomena such as Scots adopting an ‘anyone but England’ mantra when it comes

to major sporting competitions, as these have tended to be more speculative or anecdotal in nature. It is therefore hoped that future analyses of contentious topics such as anti-Englishness in Scottish sport and national identity will also adopt rigorous empirical methods to help expand our understanding of such issues, whether complementary or contradictory to the numerous findings detailed in this research.

References

Ancien D, Boyle M and Kitchin R (2009) *The Scottish diaspora and diaspora strategy: Insight and lesson from Ireland*. National University of Ireland: Scottish Government Social Research.

Anderson B (1991) *Imagined communities: Reflections on the origins and spread of nationalism* (2nd ed.). London: Verso.

Atkinson R (1998) *The life story interview*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Bairner A (1994) Football and the idea of Scotland. In: Jarvie G and Walker G (eds) *Scottish sport in the making of the nation: Ninety minute patriots?* Leicester: Leicester University Press, pp.9-26.

Bairner A (1996) Sportive nationalism and nationalist politics: A comparative analysis of Scotland, the Republic of Ireland, and Sweden. *Journal of Sport and Social Issues* 20(3): 314-334.

Bairner A (2001) *Sport, nationalism and globalization: European and North American perspectives*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.

BBC News (2010) Police fears over 'Anyone But England' T-shirt. Available at: http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/scotland/north_east/8533791.stm (accessed 8th June 2012)

Billig M (1995) *Banal nationalism*. London: Sage.

Blain N and Boyle R (1994) Battling along the boundaries: The marking of Scottish identity in sports journalism. In: Jarvie G and Walker G (eds) *Scottish sport in the making of the nation: Ninety minute patriots?* Leicester: Leicester University Press, pp.125-141.

Bourdieu P (1988) Program for a sociology of sport. *Sociology of Sport Journal* 5: 153-161.

Bourdieu P (1990) *In other words: Essays towards a reflexive sociology*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Bourdieu P and Wacquant LJD (1992) *An invitation to reflexive sociology*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Bradley JM (1995) *Ethnic and religious identity in Scotland: politics, culture and football*. Aldershot: Avebury.

Bradley JM (2002) The patriot game: football's famous 'Tartan Army'. *International Review for the Sociology of Sport* 37(2): 177-197.

Bradley JM (2006) Sport and the contestation of ethnic identity: football and Irishness in Scotland. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 32(7): 1189-1208.

Collins N (2010) Exploring the Anyone But England phenomenon. *Telegraph Online*. Available at: <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/sport/football/competitions/world-cup-2010/7822857/Exploring-the-Anyone-But-England-phenomenon.html> (accessed 8th June 2012)

Devine TM (ed.) (1992) *Scottish emigration and Scottish society*. Edinburgh: John Donald

Dimeo P and Finn GPT (2001) Racism, national identity and Scottish football. In: McDonald I and Carrington B (eds) *'Race', sport and British society*. London: Routledge, pp.29-48.

Duke V and Crolley L (1996) *Football, nationality, and the state*. Harlow: Longman.

Ewen N (2012) Team GB, or no Team GB, that is the question: Olympic football and the post-war crisis of Britishness. *Sport in History*. Epub ahead of print 28 May 2012. DOI: 10.1080/17460263.2012.681357.

Finn GPT (1991a) Racism, religion and social prejudice: Irish Catholic clubs, soccer and Scottish society – I the historical roots of prejudice. *International Journal of the History of Sport* 8(1): 72-95.

Finn GPT (1991b) Racism, religion and social prejudice: Irish Catholic clubs, soccer and Scottish society – II social identities and conspiracy theories. *International Journal of the History of Sport* 8(3): 370-397.

Forsyth R (1992) Sport. In: Linklater M and Denniston R (eds) *Anatomy of Scotland*. Edinburgh: Chambers, pp.334-353.

Fraser N (1997) *Justice interruptus: Critical reflections on the 'postsocialist' condition*. Routledge: London

Fraser N (2000) Rethinking recognition. *New Left Review* 3: 107-120

Giulianotti R (1991) Scotland's Tartan Army in Italy: The case for the carnivalesque. *Sociological Review* 39(3): 503-527.

Giulianotti R (2005) Towards a critical anthropology of voice: The politics and poets of popular culture, Scotland and football. *Critique of Anthropology* 25(4): 339-359.

Giulianotti R and Robertson R (2006) Glocalization, globalization and migration: The case of Scottish football supporters in North America. *International Sociology* 21(2): 171-198.

Giulianotti R and Robertson R (2007) Forms of glocalization: Globalization and the migration strategies of Scottish football fans in North America. *Sociology* 41(1): 133-152

Hall S (1990) Cultural identity and diaspora. In Rutherford J (ed.) *Identity: Community, culture, difference*. London: Lawrence and Wishart, pp222-237.

Hall S (1992) The question of cultural identity. In Hall S, Held D and McGrew T (eds.) *Modernity and its futures*. Cambridge: Polity Press, pp281-290.

Hassan G (2010) To be Scottish should not be about being anti-English. *guardian.co.uk*. Available at: <http://www.guardian.co.uk/commentisfree/2010/jun/23/anyone-but-england-scottish> (accessed 8th June 2012)

Hobsbawm E (1983) Introduction: Inventing tradition. In Hobsbawm E. and Ranger T. (eds.) *The invention of tradition*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp1-14.

Horne J (1995) Racism, sectarianism and football in Scotland. *Scottish Affairs* 12: 27-51.

Hussain A and Miller WL (2005a) The Auld Enemy in the new Scotland. In: Miller WL (ed) *Anglo-Scottish relations from 1900 to devolution and beyond*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp.183-202.

Hussain A and Miller WL (2005b) Towards a multicultural nationalism? Anglophobia and islamophobia in Scotland. *Devolution Briefings: Briefing No. 24*. Economic and Social Research Council.

Jarvie G (1991) *Highland Games: The making of the myth*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Jarvie G (1993) Sport, nationalism and cultural identity. In: Allison L (ed) *The changing politics of sport*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, pp.58-83.

Jarvie G (2000) Highland Games. In Jarvie G and Burnett J (eds.) *Sport, Scotland and the Scots*. East Linton: Tuckwell, pp128-142.

Jarvie G (2005) The North American Émigré, Highland Games, and social capital in international communities. In Ray C (ed.) *Transatlantic Scots*. Tuscaloosa, AL: University of Alabama Press, pp198-214.

Jarvie G (2009) Identity, recognition or redistribution through sport? In Harris J and Parker A (eds.) *Sport and social identities*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, pp15-28.

Jarvie G (2012) *Sport, culture and society: an introduction* (2nd ed.). London: Routledge.

Jarvie G and Walker G (1994) Ninety minute patriots? Scottish sport in the making of the nation. In: Jarvie G and Walker G (eds) *Scottish sport in the making of the nation: Ninety minute patriots?* Leicester: Leicester University Press, pp.9-26.

Kellas JG (1995) Review: 'The Autonomy of Modern Scotland'. *Scottish Affairs* 10.

Kellas JG (1998) *The politics of nationalism and ethnicity* (2nd ed.). Basingstoke: Macmillan.

Kelly J (2007) *Flowers of Scotland? A sociological analysis of national identities: Rugby union and association football in Scotland*. Unpublished PhD thesis, Loughborough University, UK.

Kelly J (2010) What's behind Anyone But England? *BBC News*. Available at: <http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/8733373.stm> (accessed 8th June 2012)

Kowalski R (2004) 'Cry for Us, Argentina': Sport and national identity in late twentieth-century Scotland. In: Smith A and Porter D (eds) *Sport and national identity in the post-war world*. London: Routledge, pp.69-87.

McCarthy A (2005) National identities and twentieth-century Scottish migrants in England. In: Miller WL (ed) *Anglo-Scottish relations from 1900 to devolution and beyond* Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp.171-182.

McCarthy A (2007a) *Personal narratives of Irish and Scottish migration 1921-65*. Manchester, NY: Manchester University Press.

McCarthy A (2007b) The Scots' Society of St Andrew, Hull, 1910–2001: Immigrant, Ethnic and Transnational Association. *Immigrants and Minorities* 25(3): 209-233.

McCrone D (1992) *Understanding Scotland: The sociology of a stateless nation*: London: Routledge.

McIntosh I, Sim D and Robertson D (2004a) 'We hate the English, except for you, cos you're our pal': Identification of the 'English' in Scotland. *Sociology* 38(1): 43-59.

McIntosh I, Sim D and Robertson D (2004b) "It's as if you're some alien": Exploring anti-English attitudes in Scotland. *Sociological Research Online* 9(2).

Maguire JA (1999) *Global sport*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Miller WL (2005) Introduction: From last empress to First Minister. In: Miller WL (ed) *Anglo-Scottish relations from 1900 to devolution and beyond*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp.1-16.

Moorhouse HF (1984) Professional football and working class culture: English theories and Scottish evidence. *Sociological Review* 32: 285-315.

Moorhouse HF (1986) Repressed nationalism and professional football: Scotland versus England. In: Mangan JA and Small RB (eds) *Sport, culture, society: International historical and sociological perspectives*. London: Spon, pp.52-59.

Moorhouse HF (1987) Scotland against England: Football and popular culture. *International Journal of the History of Sport* 4(2): 189-202.

Moorhouse HF (1994) From zines like these? Fanzines, tradition and identity in Scottish football. In: Jarvie G and Walker G (eds.) *Scottish sport in the making of the nation: Ninety minute patriots?* Leicester: Leicester University Press, pp.173-194.

Moorhouse HF (1995) One state, several countries: Soccer and nationality in a 'United' Kingdom. *International Journal of the History of Sport* 12(2): 55-74.

Mycock, A (2012) SNP, identity, and citizenship: Re-imagining state and nation. *National Identities* 14(1): 53-69.

Parker A and Harris J (2009) Introduction: Sport and social identities. In Harris J and Parker A (eds.) *Sport and social identities*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, pp1-14.

Paterson L (1994) *The autonomy of modern Scotland*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Reissman CK (1993) *Narrative analysis*. London: Sage

Sim D (2011a) The Scottish community and Scottish organisations on Merseyside: development and decline of a diaspora. *Scottish Journal of Historical Studies* 31(1): 99-118.

Sim D (2011b) *American Scots: The Scottish diaspora and the USA*. Edinburgh: Dunedin Academic Press.

Sim D (2012) Scottish devolution and the Scottish diaspora. *National Identities* (14)1: 99-114

Smith AD (2001) *Nationalism*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Smith A and Porter D (eds) (2004) *Sport and national identity in the post-war world*. London: Routledge.

Somers M (1994) The narrative constitution of identity: A relational and network approach. *Theory and Society* 23: 605-649.

Somers M and Gibson G (1994) Reclaiming the epistemological 'other': Narrative and the social constitution of identity. In Calhoun, C. (ed.) *Social theory and the politics of identity*. Oxford: Blackwell, pp37-99.

Tomlinson A and Young C (eds) (2006) *National identity and sports events: Culture, politics, and spectacle in the Olympics and football World Cup*. New York: State University of New York Press.

Trevor-Roper H (1983) Invention of tradition: The Highland tradition of Scotland. In: Hobsbawm E and Ranger T (eds) *The invention of tradition*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp.15-42.

Watson M (2003) *Being English in Scotland*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.