EEUK RPF OBU UOB Student focus group transcripts

Contents

[**Student focus group 1: Oxford Brookes University students 2**](#_Toc109770212)

[**Student focus group 2: Oxford Brookes University students 19**](#_Toc109770214)

[**Student focus group 3: University of Birmingham students 34**](#_Toc109770216)

[**Student focus group 4: University of Birmingham students 46**](#_Toc109770218)

[**Student focus group 5: University of Birmingham students 67**](#_Toc109770219)

Disciplines/majors of focus group participants:

Focus group 1: Criminology; Medical Science; Geography and International Relations.

Focus group 2: Psychology; History.

Focus group 3: Computer Science, Biology and Neuroscience; Business Management; Biology; Computer Science.

Focus group 4: Sports Exercise Health Science; Business Management.

Focus group 5: Law; Chemical Engineering.

# 

# Student focus group 1: Oxford Brookes University students

**Introductory section**

Andrea Macrae: Hi Sam, hi Fiona, and hi Phoebe. Welcome. We'll just give it another couple of minutes to see if others can join us. I know there are some connection problems at Brookes today, so there might be a few issues, so we’ll just give it another couple of minutes. Feel free to have your cameras on or off - it doesn't matter - but for information, this is recording but it's only the audio that is recording. Any cameras, any visual stuff, isn't being recorded. Just the audio files are being recorded. I’ll just give it a couple more minutes to see… and see if the other two join us. OK, and that's four out of five… fingers crossed will get Simon joining us in a minute as well - we’ll just give another minute. Okay, perhaps Simon is caught up in the campus-based IT problems that are causing problems today, so let's get started. Firstly, let me apologise: I have bad cough and cold so I’m going to be snuffling my way through this, so please, please be patient. I’m glad this isn’t face to face, otherwise I would have felt the need to cancel. It's not COVID - it's just a cold - but it is irritating. And, secondly, thank you very much for making time to talk today. This focus group is really important to a research project that's been funded by an organisation called Enterprise Educators UK, and we're running a series of student focus groups at Brookes and at the University of Birmingham as well, talking to students about their attitudes to and perceptions of this strange thing called enterprise and entrepreneurship education. All of you have said that you either aren't sure whether or not you've had much experience of entrepreneurship or enterprise education or you're pretty sure you haven't, and that is fine. There are no right or wrong answers to the questions that I’m going to be asking in this focus group and there are no problems if you disagree with each other - that's also fine. The ideas that we're going to talk about are quite contested. There isn't really agreement about them and that's all perfectly fine. And so, just to run through a little… a few little practicalities before I ask you to introduce yourselves and to kick off with if that’s ok. As I said at the start, you're welcome to have your cameras on or off - it's entirely up to you. You might find it a little bit easier talking to each other if they're on but there's no pressure. And the video - the screen - isn't being recorded, but the audio is and that’s so that we can transcribe it. The audio recording will then be deleted and we’ll only have the transcription available. But in the transcription all the responses will be anonymized, so you'll be given a pseudonym in all the data. I haven't got any… your survey responses have no relationship to my knowledge about you, as in, the survey responses are anonymous. Your email addresses were detached from them, so I don't know who said what. And so I’m speaking to you today entirely ignorant of any responses you put in the survey and there may be a tiny little bit of repetition in the first couple of questions at least about… just in terms of some of the questions, really to enable us to dig a little bit deeper into the kinds of responses that students have been giving in relation to the survey. I’m going to be asking five questions. It probably won't take an hour and a half - it'll probably take less time than that. And that's fine - you will still be paid your 20 pounds Amazon e-voucher afterwards, irrespective of this probably taking a little bit less time. If any of you have any connection problems, please do try to rejoin. If I have any connection problems, please just wait and I will try and rejoin. And the only other thing to say, I guess, is just in terms of tone I’m sure you're all lovely people, but just to kind of set the tone, I’d really appreciate if everybody was just polite and respectful of each other's opinions and each other's views, because we probably will have different experiences and different views about some of this. It's not… the questions aren’t complicated and they're not, you know, moral or ethical, so it shouldn't create disagreement or anything, but it’s just to kind of do a little bit of safeguarding type stuff and… If any of the questions that I ask - and I will be doing some screensharing so you'll be able to see them as well - but if any of the questions I ask aren't clear, then feel free to just say ‘could you rephrase that’ or ‘I don't understand’ or whatever and I'll provide some kind of paraphrasing if that's okay. So can I start by asking you to introduce yourselves to each other? I'll introduce myself first and then invite you each, one by one, to just say who you are, what programme you're taking - what degree you're doing - and what year you're in currently if that's okay. So, I’m Andrea Macrae and I’m a lecturer in the department of English and Modern Languages. Sam, could you go next?

Sam: Yeah, so I’m Sam. I’m in my first year, studying Criminology.

Andrea Macrae: Thank you very much. Fiona?

Fiona: Hi everyone. I’m Fiona. I’m studying Medical Science and I’m also in first year.

Andrea Macrae: Thank you. Sunan? I’m not sure if I’m pronouncing your name correctly. Please do correct me if I’m not.

Sunan: Hi. It’s Sunan.

Andrea Macrae: Sunan

Sunan: Um, hello. I’m Sunan. I’m in my first year doing Geography and International Relations.

Andrea Macrae: Geography and International Relations – great. Thanks. I’m just going to turn my sound up because you're a little bit tricky to hear Sunan. And Phoebe last.

Phoebe: I’m Phoebe and I’m in my second year of Geography at the moment.

Andrea Macrae: Okay, I’m guessing you and Sunan may not know each other, despite being from the same programme, because that's the way our institution tends to work. It would be nice if you do! Okay, and so thank you all again for coming today. I’m going to start by sharing with you some definitions of enterprise and entrepreneurship, because these are the topics that we're going to be focusing on today, just to make sure that, when we discuss them, we have a shared understanding of what we mean. So what I’m going to do, briefly, is just work out how to share my screen, because I haven't done that in a while - share screen - right, I think I’m screen sharing, but I think it's being a little bit unhelpful. Could you verbalise that you can see the screen that says ‘Student focus group’?

Phoebe: Yes, I can see it.

Sam: I can see it.

Andrea Macrae: Great. Thank you very much. So the questions will all be visible on this as well and so that should help in case you miss anything I say, but I’m just starting with drawing on some definitions of enterprise education and entrepreneurship education that come from an organisation called the Quality Assurance Agency. And they're kind of a big, overarching organisation that inputs into higher education in the UK. That's not to say that these definitions are the only definitions out there, but they're just… they're just a good starting point to work with. And so, according to the QAA, their definition of enterprise education is that enterprise education is designed to provide students with an enhanced capacity to generate ideas, so focused on idea generation, and the behaviors, attributes and competencies to make them happen. So it's about coming up with ideas, and having what's needed to bring those ideas into reality somehow. So, they list a number of what they call enterprise competencies, and they say these include things like identifying opportunities, creative problem solving, innovating, which is quite similar, decision making, strategic thinking, flexibility, negotiating and influencing, and they argue that these - in terms of where these occur in higher education - these can be embedded in any discipline, so across lots of different kinds of subjects. And they can occur through activities which can range from things like what they call experiential learning - and they mention things like simulations and live projects. Simulations are where it's kind of like role play, where a non-university, non-academic type context, something that would happen in the world outside of… outside of university learning, is modeled and kind of reflected on. So, it might be kind of… some kind of role playing of a workplace problem or issue or situation. Live projects are where a project or task from the world of work is basically pulled into an academic classroom and investigated in an academic classroom. So, it might be something that, you know, maybe just a particular job that somebody does within an organisation - a particular task is picked up and dropped into a degree classroom and the students think okay, well, how would we go about doing this. Other activities that they mention is something called authentic assessments, which is where instead of an assessment like an essay or something a bit more standard within higher education, the assessment used within a module would be something a lot closer to the kinds of work that people do in the world of work. So, a report or what's called a white paper, or a policy brief thing, or a strategic plan, or something less traditionally academic and more likely to appear as an output of work in employment. And they also suggest things like small-scale, focused activities, and this could just be things like group work, solving a problem creatively, so it doesn't…. just as simple as that. The actual activity itself is developing those skills. So, it’s quite a broad definition and quite varied ways of doing that in the classroom. So that’s enterprise education and the other side of that coin is entrepreneurship education, which builds upon and applies the stuff within enterprise education, essentially. So, it builds upon and applies enterprising competencies specifically to the process of designing new business ventures or start-ups. So, it's applying enterprising competencies and behaviors and using them for the purposes of developing a business idea or a new start-up. So, enterprise competencies add on top of - sorry entrepreneurship competencies add on top of enterprise competencies - things like knowledge of business, finance, intellectual property and legal awareness, digital marketing, and any other kind of marketing really, risk management, negotiation skills, and influencing and networking skills. So, all of that… that kind of other layer of stuff that you would need if you wanted to use things like the ability to generate an idea and make it happen, and use that in a more business or start-up context. It doesn't mean that the business or start-up has to be economic, particularly - it could be a charity, it could be something environmental, it could be not for profit, it could be educational - it doesn't have to be profit-focused but… but some kind of some kind of venture is involved. And, as they say, in terms of where that kind of activity might occur in higher education, these can sometimes be found in standalone modules which are entirely focused on ‘well let's develop a start-up idea’, ‘let's kind of go through everything involved in developing a start-up’, or ‘let's think about self-employment and all the things we need to know if we wanted to be self-employed’, or actually, rather than coming up with an entirely new venture, just developing one that already exists, somehow, so working on a business venture… an organisation that already exists. So, they're very similar. One is sort of presented as building on top of the other one and… but like I say the distinction between the two is quite thin and often disagreed upon. So, a lot of people who actually work in this area will use the two terms enterprise and entrepreneurship almost interchangeably. But you get the idea, and particularly what I’m focused on is the kinds of skills and competencies that are involved in this. So, identifying opportunities, creative problem solving, innovation, decision making, strategic thinking, flexibility, and negotiating and influencing, on the one hand, which are probably more common, and then the business acumen, intellectual property, legal awareness, those other things within entrepreneurship that are probably slightly less common across a range of disciplines. So with that understanding in mind, do any of you have any questions about any of the language used there or anything to do with those definitions? OK people are staying mute so I’m reading that as a no. So, I’m scrolling down now to the first questions. So please bear in mind, as I said, that I have no awareness of what you responded to the survey and there is a little bit of overlap between the survey and the focus group with regards to a couple of these early questions, but it's so that we can get fuller responses really - more detailed responses.

**Question: In the light of the QAA definitions of enterprise and entrepreneurship education, what kinds of experiences of learning about entrepreneurship and/or enterprise, if any, have been available to you as part of your university course or your extracurricular activities?**

Andrea Macrae: So what I’d like to know from each of you is what kinds of experiences of learning about entrepreneurship and/or enterprise, if any, have been available to you as part of your university course or your extracurricular activities - so anything you've done within a module that might speak to things like creative problem solving, or decision making, or identifying opportunities, or something slightly more business-oriented, so finance, or intellectual property; any activity at all that you've encountered within your degree, so far, your degree learning, which has touched upon any of these things as far as you can remember. And I’m just looking for examples here, not an exhaustive list. Or extracurricular opportunities, as some of you might be involved in student societies which might involve some of this, or sports teams, or other kinds of ventures that are part of your university experience but aren't actually part of your credit-bearing learning. So, what we're interested in is if you've encountered any of this before. It may not have been called enterprise or entrepreneurship learning at all. That might have not been even part of how things have been framed in any way and might not have been in the mind of the module leader or anybody involved in that process, but just to happens to overlap with some of the competencies or kinds of activities that are involved. So, it might not have explicitly… probably won't have explicitly mentioned enterprise or entrepreneurship. So please just feel free to unmute your mic and just share either a couple of examples of where you have experienced anything that kind of you think relates to this somehow, or, alternatively, can you unmute and say ‘Nothing - I’ve haven't experienced anything like this in my degree or any of my extracurricular experiences so far’. And can I invite - I’m not going to put people on the spot - can I invite you to just unmute at leisure and it doesn't matter if we accidentally interrupt each other.

Sam: Um, so, at the minute I have not done anything at uni that's do with enterprise or entrepreneurship, but for my second year one of the modules I’ve picked for my semester two is a work placement module, so I don't know if that would count, because it would…. I don't know whether it would come under, like, enterprise or entrepreneurship, going out into a place of work for my degree.

Andrea Macrae: Thank you - that's great and I should probably add that we used to talk about employability skills broadly, and enterprise and entrepreneurship skills are often considered a subset of broader employability skills, with a lot of… with not much of a distinction between things, so, thank you, that's it that's a really helpful response Sam. Phoebe you've also unmuted.

Phoebe: Um, I remember, we did a first year module which had a slight, like, marketing side to it, but because of COVID we only had about two or three lectures of it. And we had to create a poster for, I think, a wine shop and use some prompts to like decide, you know, how much you're going to pay people for this, like that, but because COVID hit we did only have about two or three lectures of it, so we really didn't go into very much depth at all.

Andrea Macrae: Okay, sure, and do you remember what module that was or what the main focus of the module was?

Phoebe: It was definitely a business module. I can't remember exactly what it was called, but I could probably try and find out, but it was definitely a business management module.

Andrea Macrae: No, no, that's okay, that's fine. Thank you. And what about Fiona - have you encountered anything like this before in your degree?

Fiona: So, I’ve encountered probably a few of the things mentioned. So, in the first semester, as we did lab reports for our lab stuff, that, you know, I think falls under… like you said, in enterprise, maybe. We also did, like, a group poster. With the entrepreneurship stuff, we did do a little bit on CV stuff and how to make one and identify what's out there. There was a seminar on work placements as well. Other than that, not so much - more just sort of coming across it here and there.

Andrea Macrae: Okay that's great. Thank you. I hope you can see, in your responses to this already, you've already given me richer responses than it's possible to give in a survey. A survey is a very limited form of gathering information, so you're already giving me richer information which is really helpful. Thank you. And what about Sunan?

Sunan: I’m not sure if I’m sort of reading into this too much, but in first, like, semester there's… some of the modules we had, particularly for Geography, we had a portfolio to do, and even this semester we also had a portfolio which was, like, 100% of the module marks. And towards the end there was questions about the samples we'd used, like, if using the data that you've got from, you know, this dataset, how would you recommend the government predict the rest of the locations and levels of carbon dioxide and peat within your like soil sediment. So, I guess questions like that sort of a link to enterprise education, but they are quite small – like, it wasn't a major part of it, but you can see them sort of creeping in. And I think something slightly similar with international relations too - sort of like if you were in a position of power, how would you, you know, respond to this situation - like that kind of thing emerges quite a lot within our seminars.

Andrea Macrae: Great. Thank you. And all of the examples that all of you have given would absolutely fit under the term - the ideas - about enterprise and entrepreneurship so that's reassuring to me that you have a good understanding of these ideas, and it also gives me a clear picture of some of the ways in which you have encountered things either kind of directly or indirectly associated with some of these ideas so far. Thank you.

**Question: What kinds of activities would make entrepreneurial education opportunities more appealing for you?**

Andrea Macrae: And moving on to question two… One of the challenges we have is engaging more students with the kinds of learning opportunities that do focus on these things, either implicitly or explicitly. And what I’d be really interested to know from each of you is, if the objective was for you to learn and develop your skills in things like identifying opportunities, creative problem solving, innovation, decision making, strategic thinking, those kinds of things… if that was the goal, the kind of focus of the education, along with your discipline obviously, what kinds of activities would make those kinds of opportunities more appealing for you? Is it that some kinds of activities are more appealing than others? Is it that, actually, if they feel more relevant to your degree, they're more appealing; or if there's more creativity involved, they're more appealing; if there's group work involved, they're more or less appealing? And so, we're interested in both the kinds of learning opportunities that might be attractive to you as ways of making you more likely to engage with these kinds of areas of development, but also what might be good… kind of… effective levers in making you think ‘oh, yeah, yeah, I’d like to do that’. So, for example, other students or alumni explaining what value those learning experiences have had for them. So it's both the kinds of activities and, in some ways, what would convince you of their value. Maybe if I go the other way around the screen, for me, in asking for responses to this question… And if you're not sure that’s absolutely fine – just say ‘I’m not really sure’ - or if you only have, kind of, one slight, vague thought, that's also absolutely fine. But yeah, it's really about what would make this kind of thing more appealing. And you could think about which of the little things that you have experienced in the past - or the things that you're interested in experiencing in the future in your degree or outside of your degree, but still within the university experience - what has attracted you to that or what did you enjoy most and what did you enjoy least perhaps and so… Sunan, could you… sorry.

Sunan: Oh, can you hear me?

Andrea Macrae: You're a little bit muffled, but we can make out what you're saying.

Sunan: I think I’d probably quite like to do more creative work and a lot more group work, but not forced because I think when they put you into groups, it just makes it a bit worse. But also, with the group work, I’d quite like a focus on digital skills, because I think a lot of it as expected to be done, like, you'll sit around the table and do it together on campus, but I think it'd be nice for them to encourage us to, sort of, work remotely, because that is quite… what quite a lot of jobs make us do anyway nowadays. And I would really like - I don't know if this applies to your question, but - to know how things like different opportunities relate to other parts of my course in terms of, like, other subjects and things - not strictly to maybe Geography alone, but how Geography can also link to other subjects through enterprise and entrepreneurship.

Andrea Macrae: That’s a really interesting point and one that I don't think many people have considered actually. Thank you. Can I just check on the group work - when you say ‘not forced’, you mean that you, kind of, you are forced to do group work but you're not forced into a particular group, like you get to choose your own group - is that what you mean?

Sunan: Yes, but also if you feel like the tasks can be done individually and you have your own idea, you also have the option to do that.

Andrea Macrae: Great. Thank you. Thank you - that's helpful. Thanks. And Fiona, what about your thoughts about what might make this kind of learning more appealing?

Fiona: I’m not really 100% sure, but I mentioned - last question - that there was a seminar on sort of CVs and job placements and stuff, and for that they actually got back some students that had done those, and that, for me, it was really interesting. Because rather than someone who, you know, did it a long time ago, or, you know, not in the immediate sort of time frame, and, you know, it made it a lot more probably tailored to me because it's not ‘oh, I went with my CV to [inaudible]’ or anything sort of like, you know, ‘I emailed these people, yeah [inaudible]’. I’m not really sure what… where my point’s going. But yeah, I think showing relevance and getting people in that are about the average age of the group, and, you know, being quite tailored to current events would be really appealing for me.

Andrea Macrae: Well, that's interesting – that it's not just relevance to you and your discipline, but also kind of tailors to current events that kind of helps make things more interesting Thank you. What about Sam - what are your thoughts on this question?

Sam: I mean, so as Sunan said, with, like, the group work, I’ve had a few assignments where I definitely could have done it myself, and I know that's not necessarily the point but I feel like that having the opportunity to have assignments that could either be done as, like, a group or a pair or on your own will definitely kind of help with those skills. But I’ve just been thinking, while everyone else has been talking, and we've also had some talks from people who are out in the field. Like, we've had some Police workers come in and give us talks about their careers and how what they do relates to Criminology. And I think stuff like that, not just in Criminology but across, kind of, all degrees can probably be quite helpful when looking at entrepreneurship and the other one, enterprise, especially because if they explain… So if there's like a TV show or something that's really related to your field - that relates to your field that you're really interested but it's fictional - if someone would, like, come and talk and explain how you could start up that sort of business or type of thing to do what they do in the TV show will probably be quite good?

Andrea Macrae: OK, so again sort of some… some overlap with what you were saying with Fiona, with, kind of, external speakers and relevance and, kind of… and Sunan too, talking about like how things can be applied across different… different contexts.

Sam: Yeah

Andrea Macrae: Great. Thank you. And Phoebe, what about you, lastly on that question of what… what might make learning about enterprise and entrepreneurship more interesting or more appealing?

Phoebe: I’d say I definitely agree with the others on group work, but I think there's, like, a nice, like, medium between group that's, like… doing it in a group is certainly more fun and made me want to do a lot more. But an individual write up, I think, would then be beneficial, so you've got the group work to, like, urge you on to do it and that's more fun. Then you're not also reliant on other people for, like, a write up or, like, things like that. And also, I think I just any… any more emphasis on entrepreneurship I think would be… I’d value that so much because I do feel like there's just a push at the moment, in uni degrees, for a nine… just a nine-to-five job. Like, you’ve just got to go out, get a nine-to-five job. There's no alternate options. There's no, like, ‘Oh, you can create a business. You can do this. You can start this.’ It's just…. it's just what job will you fit into when you leave. So, I think that would be really, really helpful, to just have some other options.

Andrea Macrae: Thank you. That's good, and I’m just making a note for me to mention something to you all, at the end, which I wouldn't have otherwise registered, but now that you’ve… now that you’ve flagged that… Thank you.

**Question: What puts you off engaging with entrepreneurial education opportunities, if anything?**

Andrea Macrae: Right. We're almost halfway through the questions. This is a shorter question and I’ve outlined enterprise and entrepreneurship… and some students…. it's kind of the flip side of the previous question, but… what puts you off engaging with these kinds of learning opportunities, again, if anything? And I appreciate some of you are coming to this without having had all that many opportunities to engage with this kind of stuff, but sometimes you might have seen opportunities and gone ‘Oh, that's not for me’, for one reason or another, or might have just preferred to do other things if given a choice between this or that. Are there any particular kinds of enterprise and/or entrepreneurship opportunities which really wouldn't be attractive to you, or any specific ways in which they might be communicated, or anything about them, that that really puts you off? How about you just unmute at leisure this time?

Sam: I think, for me, when I [inaudible] I’m 23 this year, so I’m, like, a little bit older. When I was at school and had kind of been thinking about going to uni, it was kind of like you did business, or you went into certain degree, because it was to start up a business. There wasn't as much focus on what else you can do with entrepreneurship and enterprise. And for me, just having, like, that in the back of my mind from when I was a bit younger, it kind of really puts me off looking into it, because it's kind of like, well, I don't really want to start my own business - why would I need entrepreneurship enterprise?

Andrea Macrae: Okay, thank you - so a kind of close association between entrepreneurship and enterprise and starting up your own venture, and you feeling like that…. that's not your goal, therefore enterprise and entrepreneurship is not your goal, because of that kind of historical, narrow conception of it?

Sam: Yeah

Andrea Macrae: Thank you - and that's quite a common experience. Thank you. Who else has thoughts on this? Phoebe.

Phoebe: Yeah, um, I think I’d absolutely love any entrepreneurship thing like that, to be honest. I think it, it’s just, like, more fun than anything and just something a bit out, you know, out of what you normally do as an opportunity like that. I don't think… or… I don't think I would turn down anythings like that, because this is the sort of thing where I feel like you’d regret saying no to. And, no, nothing negative is going to come from that. And it would just be really, really valuable skills. And when it's this competitive, when… when we get out of uni, I think any added benefit… I’d really appreciate it.

Andrea Macrae: Thank you. Sunan.

Sunan: Yeah, I totally agree with Phoebe on that one. I was going to say, also, when it's not explicitly called enterprise and entrepreneurship and they kind of mask it as something else or don't even name it, it kind of puts you off because I feel like the… sort of… those two words alone do you give the idea that it’s something a bit different and innovative compared to just your usual degree and the goal of a nine-to-five job.

Andrea Macrae: That's really interesting. And Fiona, what are your thoughts?

Fiona: Yeah, so, um, yeah, I think Sam made a very good point actually. Admittedly, I’m a little younger - I’m turning 20 in a few months - but back when I was in, like, sixth form in secondary school, there was a quite high emphasis on going off and not joining someone else - doing your own thing. And I’m not that interested in that - I’m quite happy to just go in, nine-to-five, do my job, enjoy it, and leave out the stresses of how all the business is doing - any of that. And, like, they’d always send us things like… like… there's these, like, 10 tips for wellbeing and stuff and one of them was always ‘start a side hustle’ and I never understood that because that's not something that interests me at all. I can see how it interests other people. Yeah, so, yeah… I think more explanation, as well, into why these skills are important, not just if you want to start your own thing, and how they can be used if you just want to go into something that’s already been started.

Andrea Macrae: Thanks. So, there's interesting bits and bobs about communicating the rationale behind doing this stuff more broadly than to start-ups, but also some interesting conflicting feelings, I think, about framing. So, some students are really keen on this kind of stuff and… and… value it being badged explicitly as enterprise and entrepreneurship, and others…. and… well, we have experienced students being really put off by the terms enterprise and entrepreneurship and… and having that association with business and thinking ‘oh, that's for business students or people interested in business, therefore that's not for me’, if they’re not business students, and so it's really interesting to hear, kind of, slightly more diverse, kind of, responses and reactions and different reasons for those responses and reactions to the framing of these kinds of activities.

**Question: Which of these examples of entrepreneurial education opportunities are more attractive and which are less attractive and why, and does anything about the ways in which they are communicated make them more or less appealing?**

Andrea Macrae: Thank you. The last two questions look at.. look at… well the next question looks at some examples of enterprise and entrepreneurship education opportunities - some specific examples, and they're predominantly from Birmingham, but one of them is from Brookes. And... they’re… I’ve made them a little bit more vague than they are in reality so… and, in most cases where they appear, they are slightly more tailored to a specific degree programme in one way or another, but they are very easy to adapt and make a bit more general. So, I’m just going to scroll the screen down to… to some examples. But the question here is, in presenting these examples to you, I’d like you to share with me which you think are more appealing and why, and which are less appealing and why. And there was a question towards the end of the survey which did a similar thing - it asked you to rank a couple of opportunities - but these are slightly different, and it goes into slightly more detail, and they vary a little bit more in the presentation of them. So, it's a similar sort of question but allows us to get slightly more detailed responses. So, that question is which of these are more appealing and why, and which is… which are less appealing and why. And the first… so, I’m going to run through all four of them and then I’m going to come back to each one. So, the first is an entrepreneurial start-up model. So this is… this would be a kind of whole module approach where the whole module is dedicated to this thing. The concept is that students work in groups to come up with an innovative digital start-up specifically - a digital start-up solution to specific problem statements. And it's working in partnership with Oxford City Council. So, it's working to respond to problem statements that are offered by Oxford City Council - their priorities. So, they have priorities around children, around housing, around jobs and skills, and around health, and those problems are pitched at the bottom, like these are our goals, essentially - these are the things that we're going for because we're not doing very well so far and we want students to come up with an innovative digital start-up solution to one of these issues - one of these issues, around making the best of our diversity and creating a safe and secure city for our children and our young people to learn; provide housing in a range of types and 10 years to meet the housing needs of the current and future citizens of – sorry, I adapted it from Birmingham, to make it more local, but I missed the word Birmingham off the bottom, so imagine this is speaking about Oxford specifically; to jobs and skills to build upon our assets, talents, and the capacity for enterprise and innovation to shape the market and harness opportunity - so it's about job creation and… and building the capacity; and the final problem statement is around health…. so, we want to help people become healthier and more independent, with measurable improvement in physical activity and mental wellbeing. So, four areas of problems, and students work in groups to choose one of them and come up with some kind of innovative digital start-up solution. And their assessment for their work in doing this is in three parts. So, their assessments would be a business pitch, a business plan, and a mock job interview. And the brief describes that all stages of a business cycle would be covered by this, so ideation - so all the design thinking strategies that are involved in coming up with and refining a good idea, optimization -and that covers something called the business model canvas, which is a very basic template to map out a business idea - and financial modeling for the first three years; IP which stands for intellectual property, and patenting; rapid prototyping, so very quickly designing your... designing a prototype version of what you're doing and testing and refining it in a very speedy process and using some software to do so; digital marketing involving learning about website design and online advertising; and pitching, so the very practice and skill of pitching, so training on what's called a pitch deck, and using formats and business plans to do so. So, that's what the whole… the whole module would look like. So that's just one… the first example. And I will come back to them, so you don’t need to remember them - I’m just talking you through them to give you a good understanding. The second two examples are more, kind of, consultancy models. So that's where I mentioned live briefs or live projects before where a specific thing within industry or within a sector - a problem or a task - is picked up and taken into a module. So, it's not likely to take up a whole module, but it might be a project within a module. So, it's quite similar to the one before, but you're not being asked to design a business, design a start-up - you’re just being asked to find a solution that doesn't necessarily need to be a whole new organisation or a whole new business or a whole new start-up venture. So, one of these live project ideas would fall into a professional research skills module. So it would be a project within that kind of module. And here we have a task presented by the West Midlands Police where they say how do we rebrand the West Midlands Police and our positive action team in order to make it more appealing to our BAME communities and younger generation, as current entry roots are certainly more preferable to the younger applicant? This is to recruit 1000 more BAME officers for the West Midlands Police. So, effectively it's a branding exercise. They want to understand how they can brand themselves better to be more attractive as an employer to a particular segment of society. And the brief here says the module… the task description clarifies that students will apply research skills along with creative problem solving, through design thinking methodology, to conduct a piece of research and analyse data in a problem-oriented manner, to provide innovative solutions. So kind of this long string - a sentence that tells you everything that it will involve, and draws out the skills and competencies that… that are included. And the assessment for this kind of practice will be a group employer report with findings of the research, so basically you report to the West Midlands Police and you say this is what our research suggests you should do, in a in a group report, but also an individual digital presentation, so a presentation where you also put your own ideas forward. That's one example of where effectively the students are serving as consultants to help address a problem from a sector or an industry. And a different version of that would be… This is a global enterprise project. This happened to be drawn from a modern languages degree but it wouldn't need to be, necessarily. This is where students work in partnership with the Department for International Trade, just in a kind of hypothetical fashion - you're not doing anything real but you're planning how you would do if you were going to be doing this. Although, having said that, the solutions, when employers do present them, they sometimes do take away the ideas and say ‘that's brilliant, we want to use it, thank you’. But the global enterprise project idea is where students would support a small or medium sized enterprise business who are looking to export their product or their idea or their service. So, they’re national at the moment but they're looking to export to international markets. And it would be group work, and it would be what they call experiential or inquiry-based learning, basically where you're kind of… you're experiencing an issue live and it's a problem-based or research-based task. And you work together to creatively formulate a project plan, including things like scope, costing, communications plans and the business case basically for how they would export - where they would export to and how. And the assessment format for this would be what's called a white paper report and a consultancy client presentation. And again this little outline really foregrounds the learning outcomes that would be involved, so applying creative thinking, utilising resources, finding information and presenting findings. Those are all the kinds of things that will be involved. That's number three. And I'll quickly move on to number four and then we'll just roll back and see - just get some general thoughts on what appeals less, what appeals more, and why. So, just a final one before we do that is the authentic assessments model, whereby basically a fairly, sort of, standard module in your discipline uses an assessment format which is, kind of, from the real world, so something that you would potentially be doing in the world of employment. So, here the assessment format is an NGO-style advocacy briefing. And what this brief does is it outlines what advocacy briefings are, and it also gives you the gist of how to write one. So, it says a number of development NGOs – so, NGOs are non-governmental organisations; they’re usually nonprofit; they usually focus on a social or political cause or environmental issue - so a number of NGOs carry out advocacy work. So, they're kind of campaigning or they're advocating around an issue. And, in doing so, they use advocacy briefings - they create advocacy briefings. Advocacy briefings often have a direct aim of changing national and/or international policy, or they can be more broadly concerned with raising awareness. So, they can be about changing policy or raising awareness and that's the purpose of this… of this document that you produce. So, one or the other or both aims. And it says ‘How do I write an advocacy briefing?’ and it just give some details about the kinds of things that you would generally find in an advocacy briefing - the fact that it does need to be based on research in order to be credible and persuasive as a… kind of… an argument or a position paper, and that it needs to be analytical. And it just clarifies that you would be given samples of advocacy briefings in order to do this kind of assessment. So we've got a start-up type module – that’s number one - then we've got two A and two B which are consultancy style live projects, and then the third is a kind of authentic assessment. And they're just examples. So I’m just interested in the views of each of you on which of those are more attractive and which are less attractive and why, and also on the presentation of them. Are there other certain things about the ways in which they're communicated - the things that are foregrounded, the things that are backgrounded, the level of detail that's provided, that kind of thing - which makes them more or less appealing or which, if adjusted, would potentially broaden the appeal? So, again, feel free to just unmute and reflect. And if you want me to scroll down or up, please do just say. Who's going first? Sam, thank you.

Sam: So, I think, for me, either of the consultancy ones would probably be quite interesting, just because I’m not really like interested in starting up my own business, but especially just because the examples used was like policing and international trade, which is [inaudible] deals quite heavily within my degree. It's just something that would be quite interesting with me, especially if it was, like, a BAME-targeted thing. That's something I really want to work in when I’m out of uni. So, just, I know those were only examples, but that, sort of, like, consulting someone as to how they can run their business - that sounded quite interesting.

Andrea Macrae: Okay, thank you. It's good… it's interesting that you can see the relevance to both you personally in your future career interests and your own degree there, and they're contributing to the drivers that make that make this slightly more interesting for you. Thank you. What about other people's thoughts on this? Sunan?

Sunan: I kind of like the entrepreneurial start-up model. I like the way it’s communicated with the little bullet points, because you see exactly what you're gaining out of it, and I think a lot of the skills there, for example, website design and the training on pitch decks, is very transferable skills either way. So, I quite like that one because, even if you're not starting up your own sort of thing in the future, you'd probably need that in a job, regardless. And I did have a bit of a pause - I can't remember which one it is - the one that's a hypothetical situation and then you sort of find a solution to it. I think it might have been…

Andrea Macrae: Yeah, you mean these two – yeah?

Sunan: Yeah, I don't know, I think the concept of it being hypothetical kind of put me off, because I was, like, well, we're not really… like, it feels still quite uni and you're sort of theoretically doing something, but you're not really achieving anything. So, then, if it was communicated where the skills are sort of more of the emphasis there, and sort of whatever you gain from that is sort of more of the focus, I probably would have been a bit more interested.

Andrea Macrae: So, if the skills were foregrounded or if it was…. you knew that it was a real world problem where your responses might have direct application, rather than just to a kind of hypothetical example...

Sunan: Yeah.

Andrea Macrae: Okay, thank you – thanks, that's helpful. What about Fiona and Phoebe? Phoebe, go ahead.

Phoebe: Yeah, I agree, I think the first one did look really good in terms of transferable skills and stuff. I think that would be so useful. I like the… more… the job interview - things like that - I think that is really, like, useful things. And I also quite like the third one, the global enterprise project, because I think working with small and medium sized businesses is so important. I’d really like anything that will support, like, small businesses and things like that. And I, just, yeah, I think that would be really, really helpful and useful.

Andrea Macrae: Thank you. This is really interesting to hear - a kind of diverse range of responses and different reasons for those responses as well. Thank you. And, lastly, Fiona.

Fiona: Yeah, so can you scroll onto the last one please, so I can see?

Andrea Macrae: Absolutely, yeah, sure.

Fiona: Thanks. Yeah, I kind of agree with what Sunan said about it being real. I said earlier in semester one we did like a group poster thing. The prompt was ‘please create a scientific poster for conference’, and whereas like before the conference would just be fake and it would just be the teacher sort of assessing it, whereas here it was a real conference made of posters we'd all done, so if felt a lot more real. I think that if there's a… some briefing… if this company’s looking for this, but we know it's not real, it sort of takes away a bit of the experience, I think, whereas if it's, like, the conference that we all made together, then that feels like it's taking it a lot more seriously.

Andrea Macrae: Right - that's interesting that that has an influence over how much… kind of… investment students might put into it. There are some students who hesitate about not feeling confident or knowledgeable enough for their for their work to be valuable in real world contexts, so hypothetical scenarios are a bit like a practice run, but I can absolutely understand how that can be a bit of a disincentive and make it feel inauthentic rather than authentic, and potentially have the opposite of the desired effect. Okay, thank you.

**Question: If you were given the freedom to design your own entrepreneurial education activity in a way that you felt would be appealing to both you and others, and how might it be most effectively communicated?**

Andrea Macrae: I’ve one more question for you all, and it's a bit more creative, hopefully, in the sense that I’ve given you some examples of some of the ways in which some education opportunities that speak to these kinds of skills and competencies have been framed, and different ways in which they can crop up in modules or as whole modules, and you've obviously got your own experiences of variations of that as well, but we're interested in what students might do if students were tasked with designing these kinds of activities from scratch. So, kind of putting aside all the examples you've seen in a way - don't let them colour your thoughts too much. But if you were to create your own your own learning activity, to speak to these kinds of skills and competencies - and it could be just one of the skills or competencies involved in enterprise and entrepreneurship, so, for example, it could be a spotting problems or problem solving or innovation - or it could be a whole range of them, or it could be, you know, digital marketing or... So, it can be narrow or broad in terms of the kinds of competencies that are addressed. It could be a very small activity that you might just do in one seminar, or it could be a project you would do over a few weeks, or it could be a whole module. But we're interested in, kind of, if you were given the freedom to design your own learning activity in a way that you felt would be appealing to both you and others, what kinds of ideas you might come up with, and also how might it most effectively be communicated. We're quite limited in the ways we can communicate learning opportunities to students. We can't go into a lot of detail in the ways in which we present module choices, for example. But we never know what's more effective, and what’s less effective. Do students want to know exactly what the assessment is going to involve? Do students want to know whether it's a real scenario or a hypothetical scenario? Is it helpful if we have other students speaking, who did the activity to last year, and they talk about what they gained from it? Do you like bullet points? One of you mentioned having the bullet points with the skills drawn out as really helpful. So, it's a two part question in the sense that we're interested in what kind of activities… what advice would you give us about what kinds of activities this learning could involve in order to be most broadly appealing, but also what are the more effective or more enticing, more appealing ways of communicating opportunities to students about this. And one of those issues really is, for example, do we include or exclude the words enterprise and entrepreneurship and do you think they put people off more than they attract people, or do you think they might attract people more than they might put people off, or is it a really mixed picture? So, yeah, this is the last question, and you don't have to answer both parts, but your thoughts on any of the issues kind of wrapped up in them would be really welcome. So, who would like to start?

Sam: Um, I’ll go. So, I think, for me use of the words enterprise and entrepreneurship… it's not bad, but I feel like if it's not necessarily a business degree I feel like there needs to be some explanation as to, like, the context of what you'd be learning. In a module that… say it was the work placement module, but it said in like the description you'll learn enterprise and entrepreneurship, I feel like you'd need to just explain a bit more of the context. But then, also, like with in curricular stuff, is have that sort of… have, like, enterprise and entrepreneurship learning available, but make sure it's accessible to someone. So, like, with the workplace module in my degree, I know that there are people who haven't done it because they need to work to earn money to put themselves through uni. So, I feel… whereas I was like, ‘but it could be so helpful’, but people won't necessarily see that, so I think there needs to be more than one opportunity for people to learn it, especially in non-business degrees.

Andrea Macrae: Thank you - that's useful. Weirdly, I’m now the faculty employability and enterprise education lead, for our faculty, and one of my chief concerns is the kinds of ways in which work-integrated learning opportunities do exclude some students, just because of the way in which they are offered, where they fall in degrees, and the limitations on the range of opportunities offered and the way they can exclude certain group of students for lots of different reasons. So thank you - that's quite useful information in lots of ways. Thank you. Did you have anything more to add or does anybody else want to contribute? Fiona?

Fiona: Yeah, so I think I agree. I think that the name might throw people off a little bit. As I said at the start, I’m doing a science-based degree, and if I saw that on my timetable I think I probably think it was a big mistake with timetabling, because, like, ‘why is there a business thing here?’, whereas, you know, it obviously it goes a bit deeper with skills and that. I think probably the name would probably need to be a bit different. With activities, I think it could probably be a range of what we've seen just above - of different things - perhaps optional which one you do depending which one maybe the student feels is in… you know… which one they’d want to do. But it’d still be in-curricular. I think that sort of thing could be quite helpful.

Andrea Macrae: Thank you. So, choice, clarity of communications, careful about framing things, and yeah, I think, optionality in terms of the kinds of activities available Thank you. Phoebe.

Phoebe: Yeah, I agree about the name entrepreneurship, just for the simple fact that when I see it in my emails my brain just kind of switches off if I see something like that, just because I know it doesn't apply to me, and, you know, when you get so many emails from the uni, it’s just like ‘oh, that's not…’… because you do often get emails that aren't for you. I think having someone in from the year above whose done it would be so, so, so helpful, and just… so you can actually get, like, a conversation with them - just see how they've done it. Because sometimes you get a project which hasn't really been done before, and it's really, really difficult because you just… it hasn't been done. And I was thinking a mix of coursework and examinations would be nice, because I know some people really, like, I do not… I’m really not good in exam conditions, whereas I perform so much better with coursework, so I think if there was a nice mix of that, that'd be really, really helpful.

Andrea Macrae: Okay, thank you. And lastly Sunan?

Sunan: I think I’d quite like this kind of thing to be integrated within modules and kind of across the whole year, or even the whole degree, rather than just one module in first year and maybe one in second, like so of every single thing that we do to sort of have an element of this in it, because I think the skills are really transferable and really useful. And, but also to have the choice within a module to take a more entrepreneurial and enterprise route or to keep it very academic would be quite nice. So, have maybe like different pathways that you could take. And also, I don't know if this applies but I’d quite like a competitive element as well because that's what the workplace is like and I don't think we sort of see that – it’s quite a safe environment within our degree, so I would quite like that to come through too.

Andrea Macrae: Thank you so much.

**Closing**

Andrea Macrae: It's really heartening to hear all of your responses, because there are quite a few people around the university who have been trying to argue for exactly the kinds of things that you have suggested that would be valuable to you and are of interest to you. And so, when students actually say ‘yes, we want that’, that is so much more of a powerful argument for us to be able to then go ‘look, students want it, so let us do it now, please’. And so thank you - that's been really helpful and really enlightening. We're at the end of the focus group now, in just under an hour, which is great. And I want to say thank you so much for putting aside time. I know some you are still doing assessments and some of you are just in the wake of having handed everything in, and so you must be quite tired. I really appreciate you putting the time side. I'll send you your e-vouchers this afternoon as a thank you. But just to let you know what happens to the data - so your data will be completely anonymised and if it is quoted in any of the resultant research reports, it will be given a pseudonym. It may be quoted. And the outputs for this are that we're going to be producing a report for Enterprise Educators UK, which will be made available online, providing a picture of student attitudes to and understanding of, and experiences of, enterprise and entrepreneurship education in their degrees at the moment - just a snapshot from two universities - but also what students are interested in, how we can do it. Basically, your input will help us shape some of these opportunities more attractively and design them more effectively to be able to help build up provision within degrees to better support students in their learning in these areas, where they want to be supported. So, I’m very much hearing the optionality thrust within a lot of your responses. So, it will have practical value - what you've… what you've given in terms of in terms of your time and your insights will have practical value in terms of how lots of institutions might go ‘okay, so there's some interesting evidence that we can use to make arguments to do this kind of thing’. So, it's, yeah, really, really valuable stuff that you've shared with us today, and thank you so much for taking part, too. And do any of you have anything else you want to add before I close down the meeting? Nope - you’re all staying mute. So, just to say thank you again - it was really lovely to talk to you. I wish you all the best in your degrees if I don't cross paths with any of you, and I'll be sending you your email vouchers later this afternoon. So, I’ll close down the meeting now. Thank you very much.

# Student focus group 2: Oxford Brookes University students

**Introductory section**

Simon: Hello, how are you?

Andrea Macrae: Hi. I’m alright thanks. How are you?

Simon: I’m doing pretty good.

Andrea Macrae: We’ll just wait for Pete to join us. We’ll just wait a few minutes. If for any reason Pete doesn't turn up, we can still conduct this just one to one, and you'll still get the voucher so it will be fine. It will just take less time.

Simon: Okay it's fine yeah. How many people were there last time?

Andrea Macrae: Four. I’ll just grab my phone to check my emails incase he’s emailed me. We’re conducting focus groups at Brookes and at the University of Birmingham so they're just small but kind of collecting little small focus groups from different parts of the two universities. Small is good when it comes to focus groups - it makes it much more manageable. So, we'll give it another couple of minutes. I’ve dropped him a quick email just to give them a nudge. Hi Pete. Are you there? Can you hear us?

Pete: Yeah, I’m here. I’ll just see what's wrong with my camera – somethings… Hmm. Now it just won't let me start video, for some reason. Um…

Andrea Macrae: It’s not a problem - it's absolutely fine. So long as we can hear you, that's the crucial thing, as long as you don't mind.

Pete: No, no, no that's fine.

Andrea Macrae: Great, so yes, Simon I don't know if you caught that Pete’s camera's not working so he's going to keep his camera off. You’re welcome to the same if you want to - it's entirely up to you. I should clarify that although this is recording, it's only the audio that's recording. The screen isn’t recording at all, and so it's only your voices that will be captured in the recording. Okay, so, thank you both for making the time this afternoon. I really appreciate it, especially as you've already filled out that survey. I’ll be sending you…. This will probably take an hour or a bit under and I’ll be sending you your 20 pound Amazon e-voucher pretty much straight afterwards, so you’ll get that this afternoon, so keep an eye out for it. I’m just going to start with a little bit of blurb for me and then I’ll get you to introduce yourselves to each other and to me and then we'll just crack straight onto the questions if that's okay. And so, as you probably saw from the kind of information around the study, this focus group and the survey are part of a broader study between the University of Oxford Brookes and the University of Birmingham whereby we're trying to talk to staff and students in the arts, humanities, sciences and social sciences about their experiences of and attitudes towards this funny thing called Enterprise and Entrepreneurship education. It is the study is funded by an organisation called Enterprise Educators UK, so they've given us the money that we're using to pay you for taking part in the survey and taking part in focus groups. That's where the money's coming from and that's also where the findings will go. So we're going to be writing up a report to them about our findings, and we may also write an academic journal article or two, me and the two researchers at the University of Birmingham. So that's just a little bit about the context. A couple of practicalities for the focus group are I’ve got a bit of a sore throat and cough, so please excuse the coughing and if you don't quite catch anything I’ve said, apologies - just ask me to repeat myself and I’ll clarify. If for any reason I disappear off zoom, if you don't mind just waiting and I will try to get back on and if for any reason I can't back get back on I’ll email you both and say ‘sorry, we're just gonna have to abort’. You will still get the vouchers, don't worry, and I don't expect that… Oh dear, now Pete’s gone. Oh dear. We’ll hang on a second and see if he comes back. I was about to say if either of you drop off the internet, then we will just wait until you come back again so that's timely that he's disappeared. Hi again Pete – are you there? Sorry, you're on mute. Can you confirm you can hear me? Yay - good work. We can see you now as well. Well done. Thank you. I was just in the process of saying if either of you drop offline we will just wait and you can rejoin and not to worry. I was also going to say just quickly, there are no right or wrong answers to the questions and they're fairly formulaic questions and some of them repeat some of the content in the survey and the point of that is that in a focus group we can get much more detailed responses than a quick survey will allow us to gather. So, some of them kind of go over some of the same ground but allow space for you to give fuller responses. And, yeah, that's pretty much it. There are just five questions. It shouldn't take too long, but any and all sorts of responses are welcome. Oh and just, you know, I don't think I need to say this, but if we could all be polite and respectful about each other's opinions… If they differ, you know, that's fine - everybody's opinions and views are welcome, and that would be appreciated. So, if I just briefly introduce myself, and then I’ll invite you both to do the same… So, you know my name is Andrea Macrae and I’m one of the members of staff in the English and Modern Languages department, but that's sort of irrelevant to this study, because this study is more connected with another aspect of my role, which is a principal lecturer for student experience, so I have a kind of broader remit across the faculty working on other things that enhance students’ engagement and experience of their degree, more broadly. Pete, perhaps you'd like to introduce yourself and maybe tell us which subject you're studying.

Pete: Yeah, so I’m Pete. I’m studying Psychology. I’ve just finished my first year so I’m just waiting for exam results and things like that. I’m obviously a mature student. I’ve worked until about 60 and decided, about two years ago, just to stop and start doing things that I actually like doing, so that's led me to yeah to Brookes.

Andrea Macrae: Fantastic and it's really valuable for the study to have to have the voices and opinions of different kinds of students, so to have a mature student in the mix is brilliant. I didn't know that when you signed up! Simon, what subject are you studying and what year are you in?

Simon: I’m studying History and I just finished my second year.

Andrea Macrae: Right, you don't… do you have exams in History?

Simon: No, we just do coursework.

Andrea Macrae: Right so yeah sure, unluckily for Pete you have just been through the exam period. Most of the students just kind of sailed through the last two weeks and took a breath. But so, yeah, thank you for making the time to you when you're probably quite tired, having just kind of got to the end of the academic year. Okay, I’m going to share my screen, or I’m going to try to – we’ll see how this goes. So, I’m trying to share a file that says at the top of it ‘Student focus group’. Can you confirm that you can see that?

Pete: Yep.

Andrea Macrae, Great. Now all this file is… it's got the questions on so you can see… read them, as well as hear them. I will be verbalising them, but you'll have them in front of you should want to kind of see them too. But an important starting place for the focus group is sharing some definitions of Enterprise education and entrepreneurship education. This isn't to suggest that you have to agree with these definitions, but it's just to provide us with a kind of shared starting point so we're kind of discussing roughly the same thing. Feel free to voice disagreement with these definitions if you want to. These definitions come from the QAA - that's the Quality Assurance Agency which has a kind of broad remit that… advising and steering higher education institutions. So, according to QAA, they define enterprise education as providing students with a) an enhance capacity to generate ideas, and b) the behaviours, attributes and competencies to make those ideas happen. So, that's their view of enterprise and enterprise education - what it's what it's supposed to do. They list some enterprise competencies in which they include identifying opportunities, creative problem solving, innovating, decision making, strategic thinking, flexibility, negotiating and influencing. So, quite a wide range of competencies under the auspices of enterprise competencies. And they argue that these kinds of competencies… the teaching of them can be embedded into any subject - any discipline. And so they're not specific to one discipline and they can be embedded through activities like: experiential learning, which involves things like simulating real world environments, workplace contexts, that kind of thing; live projects, which is the use of workplace tasks within a degree context; what they call authentic assessments, whereby assessments mirror the kinds of activities that might be done outside of university, so report writing, strategic planning, or things that aren't essays or exams if you see what I mean, and more kind of real world relevant; and… but they can also include a small-scale focused activities which might be things like group… a group creative problem solving task, so something that might… you might encounter fairly regularly within class time but might not think about it in these terms. Entrepreneurship education they kind of almost envisage as the layer on top of that. So, it builds on and applies enterprise and competencies specifically to the process of designing new business ventures or start-ups. And, as I say, this is just their conceptualization of these terms. Not everybody shares their views on how these terms… what these terms mean or how they relate to each other. But could the QAA, entrepreneurship education applies enterprise competencies to designing new business ventures or start-ups. And they list entrepreneurship competencies. So, they say entrepreneurship competencies build on enterprise competencies by adding knowledge of business, finance, intellectual property and legal awareness, digital marketing, risk management, negotiation skills and influencing and networking skills. And you can see that there's a direct overlap there already because we get negotiating and influencing at the end of enterprise competencies as well. But it's a bit more business focused, basically. It's a bit more about business acumen. And they argue that, again, like, well, they argue that entrepreneurship competencies can be found, or taught, basically, is their argument, in standalone modules which are more focused on innovation or start-ups or self-employment or potentially growing an existing venture, so not creating a wholly new venture, but actually developing or enhancing one that already exists. So that's their kind of vision of enterprise education and entrepreneurship education and how they relate to each other, just… just as a kind of starting point.

**Question: What kinds of experiences of learning about entrepreneurship and/or enterprise, if any, have been available to you as part of your university course or your extracurricular activities?**

Andrea Macrae: So, now, we're going to move into the questions. And you don't need to remember that, but if you want me to refer back to I can. And, as I say, you don't need to necessarily our answer in line with those definitions - you can have your own ideas about what these things are and talk about them in your own terms and that's fine. But the first question really directly repeats one of the survey questions, but gives you the opportunity to answer more fully. And I’ll just take this moment to remind you that I don't have access to whose survey responses are whose, so I’m not having this conversation with you with your survey responses in mind - I don't know which ones are yours. So what I would like to know from each of you, in turn, is what kinds of experiences of learning about enterprise or entrepreneurship, if any have been available to you as part of your university course or your extra-curricular activity. So, that's part of your degree-based learning for the modules that you've done, or anything extra-curricular that you might have taken part in, whether that be a student society or a sports team or volunteering that you've done in association with the university. And these kinds of activities might have been… might have explicitly mentioned enterprise and entrepreneurship, or they might have just involved some of those competencies that were listed so in reading those competencies, you might have felt ‘oh yeah, I’ve done a bit of that, in that module over there, or in that activity over there, it wasn't necessarily called enterprise that, when I was doing it, but, but I have done a bit of that’. And, so, it may have explicitly framed some of the learning - in these terms - or it might not have used the terms enterprise and entrepreneurship at all, but it might have nonetheless… have kind of spoken to, in some way, these kinds of competencies. So, Pete, how about we start with you? What kinds of experiences of learning about enterprise and/or entrepreneurship, if any, have been part of your university experience so far?

Pete: Okay, well, I think we've kind of touched on a bit of legal awareness, as in kind of codes of conduct and codes practice for counselors and for that type of thing, but that is very…. very broad strokes. I wouldn’t say that we actually drilled down into what constitutes this and what constitutes that and what the… what the fallout will be or the punishment if you…. if you went against that - just a very kind of broad mention, just so that everybody knows that you are in, what, well, within that side of psychology, dealing with very vulnerable people, and your responsibilities, therefore. So that's… from looking through everything else, that's about it. It may be a tenuous link, but that’s the only link I can actually make at the minute.

Andrea Macrae: Sure, yeah, that's fine, and also the answer ‘none at all’ is also all fine. That's great. That's helpful. Thank you. And what about you, Simon? What about…. what kinds of experiences of enterprise and entrepreneurship education have you had in your degree so far, if any?

Simon: Well, not really in my course I wouldn't say. I can think of… I suppose if there was like a sort of link, some of the History Society lectures might have had some about entrepreneurship. I think I remember a couple. But I can't be certain. I think there was some.

Andrea Macrae: Okay, and can you… is the History Society a student society or is it a staff-led society?

Simon: I think it's a mixture…. I think it’s staff.

Andrea Macrae: Okay, thank you. That's the kind of thing that we would class as kind of co-curricular, and that's often where stuff like this can crop up so, yeah - thanks.

**Question: What kinds of activities would make entrepreneurial education opportunities more appealing for you?**

Andrea Macrae: Okay that's one question down already, and so the second question is: what, if anything, do you think would make learning about enterprise and/or entrepreneurship more appealing for you? So, if things like this were offered within your degree course or as part of your university experience more broadly, what would make those learning opportunities attractive to you? What would give you an incentive to engage with them? For example, would particular kinds of learning opportunities or experiences be more attractive than others, or things like alumni - you know, previous graduates - talking about how valuable those experiences might have been for them, or hearing from other students, or what kinds of things might make this kind of learning more appealing? And Pete, shall we start with you again?

Pete: Yeah, yeah, by all means. Well, I think, obviously, having people come back in and explain how it's benefited them would be, as I say that'd be a big selling point for me - to actually… to see the results of why… why… what happens when you go through those processes. I’ve been an employer for quite a long time, and a lot of the people I got in straight from university have not worked at all. Their understanding of profit and loss of businesses is negligible. And I think, to be honest, when you go in, even if you're not talking about entrepreneurship or enterprise, to have a grounding in how businesses actually work and, do you know what I mean, even just that little bit more knowledge, I think would benefit everybody coming out of the gate. So, I’d say, for me, it's something that… I am looking to be self-employed the second I graduate, so I would take everything and anything that would be on offer. Even if that wasn't the case, then I’d still like to have an understanding of what my employer would be doing and how they function, so… one, to make me a better employee, and two, just to give me that confidence in interviews, say, where it could actually broach larger subjects, and talk about things more in depth, rather than just ‘my collection of this’ or ‘my hobbies are that’, to actually get down to the nitty gritty with an employer and talk about bottom lines and talk about all of these… these things that are their concerns. I think, in an interview situation that would be, yeah, put you far ahead of anybody else.

Andrea Macrae: Thank you - that's really helpful. I’m just going to jot… All of all of this is being recorded, but I’m nonetheless gonna jot just a couple of notes down. Thank you. And Simon, what about you? You might have different kinds of feelings about Enterprise and Entrepreneurship education and what might make it more appealing, again, if anything. It might be completely deterrent, but there might be some things that might make it more attractive.

Simon: Yeah I feel… because usually… my week… I had about only three days that I went into uni and two days off, so I feel that in those days we have off, we could have, like, some kind of optional extra module in learning about kind of enterprise, just as… to fill out the time, because sometimes we feel like we we’re just focusing on the work, and we could, you know, work more on different skills, like meeting more people and working as a team, in addition to what we're learning in a core module.

Andrea Macrae: That's interesting. If you were to do that, do you think you would it would be more attracted to you if you were still staying with your History students - the people you were already learning with - or would you be… would you be interested…. would it be more or less attractive for you if it involves students from other degree programs as well?

Simon: I think it might be alright to have people from other degree programmess as well, as it might offer different ideas.

Andrea Macrae: Okay, thank you. Students sometimes have mixed feelings about whether they want to stay in their own cohort that they're comfortable with and they know, or they're up for kind of interacting a bit more and have different grounds for doing that, so thank you - that's helpful.

**Question: What puts you off engaging with entrepreneurial education opportunities, if anything?**

Andrea Macrae: Okay, so question number three, and these are kind of symmetrical questions… What, if anything, puts you off engaging with Enterprise and Entrepreneurship education? And it may be ‘nothing’, but there are opportunities for this kind of thing that are floated around the university, particularly that come from, for example, the career services and the section of the university that is called Enterprise Support. And they often promote opportunities for learning that sometimes speak to these kinds of competencies, and sometimes students don't… well, quite a lot of the time students don't engage with them, so we're trying to find out what put students off. And it may be about the ways in which these opportunities are communicated; it may be about where they fit within timetables, or how that pitched. So what…, what do you think, for you, would… either has been off-putting about opportunities like this, or would put you off opportunities like this? Pete, shall we start with you again?

Pete: Yeah, yeah, no worries. To be honest, I think I’ve missed any of this communication going around. I do get the careers emails through, and a lot of them… as I say, not particularly pertinent to me - a lot of stuff about writing CVs and doing all of that type of thing, which is absolutely fine. I totally understand why that is. But as for, yeah, the entrepreneurship kind of side, I’ve not… I can't recall seeing anything. So, I’d be more than willing to give everything… to give anything and everything a go, and it would depend, then, on the value of me taking part, whether or not I continue to do so. But I’ve not really seen those opportunities being offered. And I think possibly the clash with timetables and stuff like that. Again, I’m exactly same - say I’ve got three days in and two days off, and my two days off, I am a bit lost with what to do so I’d love to be able to fill a little bit of that time. So, yeah, as I say, if it was… if it was offered and communicated, yeah, then I’d be there. There’s nothing that would particularly put me off.

Andrea Macrae: Great. One of the things I noted down was to email you both, and the students in the focus group last week, to share information about the section… the bit of the university that's called Enterprise Support, because they provide training on setting up your own start-up, and you and lots of things involved with that, so I think that might be…. It's free, it's… there's loads of stuff offered every year, so, but yeah it doesn't seem to cut through to many students. So, I will send you an email about that, just so that you've got a link and you can go and explore it, just to make you aware of it. But Simon, what about you? What would put you off?

Simon: Well, yeah, I agree with what Pete said. I just didn't encounter any of this, so if it was advertised to me, I would definitely be interested. There would be nothing to… put me off. I think it'd be very useful to engage my skills in enterprise and entrepreneurship.

Andrea Macrae: Okay - that's really encouraging. Thank you.

**Question: Which of these examples of entrepreneurial education opportunities are more attractive and which are less attractive and why, and does anything about the ways in which they are communicated make them more or less appealing?**

Andrea Macrae: And the next two questions are related to the design of different enterprise and entrepreneurship education opportunities. So, the first one's quite similar to the final question of the survey in that it presents a few different examples of ways in which enterprise or entrepreneurship education can be embedded within a module - and so part of your degree learning, not extracurricular stuff, as part of your degree learning. So, I want you to kind of… I’m going to take you through them and show you them on the screen, and then I’ll be asking you specifically about which you think are appealing - more appealing and less appealing - to you, and why. But I want you to think about both the kind of… the nature of the activity that's involved, and the way it's being communicated, because, like, we're mindful that both of those things influence how… what decision students make about whether to take up an opportunity or not. So, the kinds of things that are emphasised in them, for example; the kinds of things that have been selected to be communicated at this at this point or not. So I’ll just… I’ll just go through the four opportunities, one by one, and then I’ll come back to you and say which do you think is more appealing and why, and ask you to speak a little about a bit about both content and the kind of ways in which they're being… kind of… the information is being presented to you. So, the first opportunity is… I’m just going to shrink the screen slightly… so the first opportunity is framed as a… the entrepreneurial startup model. So here you…. it's a bit more focused on the entrepreneurship side more than the enterprise side of things, if we're considering them as different sides. So, within this education opportunity the concept is the students work in a group to come up with an innovative digital start-up solution to a particular problem statement, and they're presented with a set of problem statements. So, they get these problem statements and they've been tasked with coming up with a digital… a new digital start-up that would help address that problem statement. And the assessment format for this… so it would be assessed, and it would be assessed via a business pitch, a business plan, and a mock job interview, and all stages of the business cycle are covered in the teaching to support this. So, ideation - so design thinking strategies, optimization, so the kind of… the development of the idea into a business using what's called the business model canvas, which is a very kind of streamlined way of mapping out a business idea; and financial modeling for the first three years of this venture; IP which is intellectual property and patenting; rapid prototyping, so kind of… quick… quick, basic modeling of what this would be, using 3D printing and AutoCad, so some training on some software; digital marketing as part of how it would eventually be launched, so that would include website design and online advertising; and also pitching, so how to pitch something, so training on a pitch decks and formats for business plans. And the statements themselves come from…. So the problem statements that you're being asked to address come from Oxford city council. And they are the four priorities for Oxford as a city, so you're working with some real problem statements out there that are currently going on in in the local city. I’ve stolen these from Birmingham, so you can still see the word Birmingham at the bottom of the housing one. And… but… so one of the problem statements relates to children and making the city more diverse for children; one relates to have providing a wide range of housing types to meet the needs of the citizens of that city; one relates to building up jobs and skills and the capacity for innovation within the local city… kind of employment context; and the fourth problem statement relates to help - to helping people in the city become healthier, and more independent and more physically active and with better mental wellbeing. So, you've got four different problem statements and, as a group, you work on a digital start-up to address one of them. So that is that as an example of what would probably be quite a big task - it would probably even be a whole module to kind of focus on this kind of thing. So that's number one, the entrepreneurial startup model. A number… numbers… we've got two A and two B and then we've got three. So, to two A and two B are a consultancy model. So, we've gone from an entrepreneurial start-up model to a consultancy model. Two A and two B both work around the idea of students as consultants, for industry or sector partners, working on specific projects, that are real projects out there in industry. So, one of these projects is A Professional research skills module project. And we get a problem, presented by West Midlands Police, and they say ‘how do we rebrand West Midlands police and our positive action team to make it more appealing to our BAME communities and younger generation, as current entry routes are most certainly more preferential to the younger applicant. This is to recruit 1000 more BAME officers to the West Midlands Police force.’ So, you've got their problem and you've got their target. They want to make themselves more appealing to recruit more BAME officers. So that that's their problem and they're kind of coming to students wanting students to function kind of as consultants to try to offer a solution to this problem. So, students apply…. the description here highlights the kinds of things that it would involve students. Students apply research skills, along with creative problem solving, through design thinking methodology to conduct a piece of research and analyse data in a problem oriented manner in order to provide innovative solutions. That's quite a long sentence, but it catches… it puts in bold all of the different kind of competencies that are involved in that task. But you can see it's kind of… its main focus is on research and then data analysis to really get to the root of the problem, and then to provide solutions on the basis of that research. And the assessment would be a 50% group employer report with the findings of the research and a 50% individual digital presentation. So that's one consultancy model. Another consultancy model type task is a global enterprise project, whereby… This works in partnership with the Department for International Trade and focuses on live - so live as in current, active, contemporary, real - small or medium sized enterprises that are looking to export their goods or services. So we've got these small or medium sized enterprises and they're looking to export and they're basically coming to students saying how do we do this? What would you recommend we do? And… and this little blurb about this activity explains that it would be group work and it describes it as experiential or inquiry based, but it also clarifies that the task and the solutions will be very much hypothetical. So you're not expected to actually solve these export problems for these businesses. You're working in… your working on this task in a hypothetical manner to come up with solutions that may potentially be absolutely valid, but you're not… but your solutions aren't likely to be taken up in real life by these enterprises. You just, kind of… it's almost like a practice or a simulation of this kind of activity. So, students create…. creatively formulate a project plan, including scope, costings, a communications plan, and a business case. And the assessment for this would be a White Paper report and a consultancy client presentation. And this brief outlines the learning outcomes in terms of applying creative thinking, utilizing resources, and finding information, presenting findings. So, those are the things that are highlighted in this brief about this learning opportunity. So we've had an entrepreneurship start-up model, we've had two consultancy models, and now we're moving on to the final one which is an authentic assessments model. So, for this final learning opportunity that we're reviewing here, the assessment for this this learning is an NGO-style advocacy briefing which would be a 2000 word written briefing, and it would be related in some way to your subject discipline and embedded within a module. So, it would be some kind of…. it would be something related to History for Simon and something related to Psychology for Pete. And this brief… it does two things: it explains what advocacy briefings are, and it explains a little bit about how you would write one. So, it explains that a number of non-governmental organizations – NGOs - usually nonprofit and they usually focus on social, political, or environmental issues - a number of them carry out advocacy work. So, they… they have the direct aim of changing national or international policy, or they can be more broadly concerned with raising awareness. So their advocacy briefings are about raising awareness, or changing policy at a national or international level. So, they are kind of campaigning documents - lobbying documents. And a lot of NGOs do this… do this kind of advocacy as part of their… part of their missions. And then, and then it gives a just a couple of paragraphs about how… how you would write an advocacy briefing, so things about who the audience would be, the need for clarity, the need for its be kind of aimed at a general audience but still research based so it points out that you should still include references to academic literature to… for it to be credible, and that it should be analytical not simply descriptive and needs to be persuasive. So, just a few little points about what that kind of thing is. And it also clarifies that samples are available for you to look at. So you've got four different educational opportunities there. I’m just going to go back up to the top and sweep back down again to recap. You've got the entrepreneurial startup model whereby you're actually creating a digital startup solution to address A problem statement for the local city council; you've got two examples of consultancy models, one for the West Midlands Police and one for international trade and export; and then you've got an authentic assessments model. So, of those four different kinds of learning experiences, and some of them sort of overlap in some ways, what I’m asking each of you is, which is more appealing to you, and why, and which is kind of less appealing and why? And, if you want me to… while I while you're answering if you want me to scroll up or down so that you can see any of them in particular again then just say. So, Pete are you alright if we start with you again?

Pete: Yeah, yeah, by all means. Again, from a personal point of view, the start-up one is the most... kind of… that ticks my boxes. There's quite a few things I’ve noted down here, though, that are kind of missing. For… I would say it is stuff that… if you're looking at starting a business, even just an awareness might be helpful, so, like, health and safety, business loans, HR, what do you do if one of your teammates are stealing stuff - all of these type of… the people bits, if you will, the social aspect. And then, with every start-up, bankruptcy - what's the process of going… what if it doesn't work? What's the risk assessments? Where could it go wrong? This, to me, reads as if the… whatever the start-up is, it’s going to be successful, and that's not how business works….

Andrea Macrae: That's a really good point.

Pete: … at all. Especially not as… where we are at the moment. So I think that the actual strategising – and I know it says financial modelling and stuff like that – but, um, yeah what to do if it starts to go wrong, if it just starts to veer off. How can you save it? How you catch it? I quite like the idea of the four clear priorities - that's bang, bang, bang, bang - that works for me as well. I think the two B and the three, with the other one being hypothetical and the other one being kind of very, very much kind of based on me just writing something that I’m passionate about - I don't think that… for me personally three is no use. I don't know how that would actually fit if that was to come into Psychology. I think we've got 130 of us in our year, so do we all write an essay about changing something? Well, who do we send them to? Where do they go? Do you just roll it up in a ball, throw it in the bin? Do you know what I mean? Its…

Andrea Macrae: Where does it go – what’s the value.

Pete: Yeah, what's the value to it. At the end of day, it just sounds like writing another essay, which I’ve got enough of, I think.

Andrea Macrae: Yep, absolutely, yep, that makes sense.

Pete: Yeah, the consultancy. Yep, research, carrying out analysing data, yep, again, incredibly useful. And that is transferable as well, I’d say - it's not just if you wanted to be a consultant within X, Y and Z. I think it's really useful for anybody who's got any interest in business to be able to actually look at, yeah, think, try and find solutions to problems, because problems will always raise their head, so it's the bottom line. So, anyway, to kind of make people aware of that, and make people aware of the fact that businesses generally don't work, is really beneficial. I think people would be quite surprised by that, but I think it's a very valuable lesson.

Andrea Macrae: Great. Thank you. What you pointed out about the first one is quite interesting. I think I think there's often a tension between worrying about putting students off engaging with some of these ideas and some of the research suggests that there's… the risk involved in start-ups is one of the things that put students off. So, maybe an effort to kind of minimize the risk, when introducing things, might be part of how to kind of get students to engage in the first place. But you're right - it's a really important element of what needs to be taught – really, training in what to do when things go wrong -yeah, yeah – is… it is a really important part of that to make that education kind of comprehensive and really doing its job.

Pete: My concern would be, yeah, if that's not being taught to them, whether or not it's just kind of rose- tinted glasses or, like, ‘oh, yeah, this can't fail’, you know what I mean, when realistically… I’ve been self-employed. I know it goes wrong. My mum was self-employed. I know how it works. And I think there is the responsibility that if we're going to teach people that side of it, and then set them off into the world, that they are well-rounded enough to know that they are taking the risk and they are borrowing money from people who will want it back, and you can go bankrupt, and it can affect X, Y and Z. And I know it's not a very positive message, but I wish I’d known the dark side before I just threw myself into things and started spending other people's money. So, I don’t know.

Andrea Macrae: Yeah, you’re right – it is a valuable part of that education. Thank you. What about Simon? What do you think of these four opportunities? Which one appeals to you the most and why and which appeals the least and why?

Simon: I think it's got to be the first one, again. I think, because I studied, in my final year secondary school, entrepreneurship - you know, like, starting up… starting up a business, learning about the ins and outs of what a business should run like… But I have the same kind of issues, whereas if, like, studying History or whatever, we don't have the prior knowledge to this subject. So, like, if you go in blind, like, how… what do you do? You can't just go - you have to kind of understand the background beforehand, I feel. So that's one of the things… one of the problems I have with it. But I like the aspect of working in a group, you know, pitching plans, and I think that's a very useful skill in the modern world, to work with people, and, you know, build up from each other's ideas. And I also think it's a very altruistic goal that will look good on any CV - if you put, like, this is what you worked on, I think it would look really good.

Andrea Macrae: Okay. Yeah, that's a good point – that, kind of, the local altruism, the community impact aspect of it, as a selling point. Great. So, if that's the most appealing one, but you can also see a problem with it, that's really helpful. Which of them is the least appealing and why?

Simon: The last one, because to me it just sounded like I was, like a 2000 word essay, like I’ve been doing. I don't really see how it would really help, if that makes sense? I felt like the first option was much more broad scope. This one felt very kind of basic - just writing your opinion, essentially.

Andrea Macrae: Right, yeah. Okay, thank you - that's helpful. Okay, great.

**Question: If you were given the freedom to design your own entrepreneurial education activity in a way that you felt would be appealing to both you and others, and how might it be most effectively communicated?**

Andrea Macrae: So, we are on to the last question which builds from this previous question. What we've shared with you, both in the survey and here, are a couple of examples of enterprise and entrepreneurship education activities that have been designed by staff. What we'd like to know is, if students were tasked with coming up with an enterprise and/or entrepreneurship education opportunity that would appeal to as many undergraduates as possible, so have that in mind, what do you think would work well? And you can imagine you've got all the resources in the world, completely blue sky thinking. You can completely ignore the things that you've just seen - don't… you know, don't necessarily think of them as guiding examples. If you were starting from scratch and designing an enterprise or entrepreneurship education activity - so, something that would help students develop some of those competencies, enterprise competencies and/or entrepreneurship competencies, and it can focus on or emphasiswhatever you like, but what… what do you think would… what advice could you give us about what kinds of activities you think would appeal to the most students, and also, how we can communicate those opportunities to students, because, well, for example, some evidence suggests that when we use words like enterprise and entrepreneurship, a lot of students go ‘oh, that's not for me’ because maybe they don't always understand what those words mean or they don't necessarily recognise the relevance of the competencies involved to lots of different walks of life - not necessarily just start-ups but any kind of careers and different aspects of life outside of work, even. But also, you know, we have kind of fairly standard ways of communicating about learning opportunities and that they're not always the ones that cut through to students. So, we're interested in what kinds of activities you think would be appealing and how can we best communicate these opportunities to students to excite them and make these opportunities feel inviting. I realize this is quite a challenge. Just to clarify, this would be an in-curricular opportunity, so it would be something as part of a degree course. It could be optional rather than compulsory, but it would be part of the degree learning ,so not extracurricular, not student societies or anything like that, but something that's part of degree learning so part of a credit bearing module. So, do you have any just kind of brainstorming style thoughts about what you think might be an attractive kind of activity or task for a fairly broad range of students, or do you have any thoughts about how we can best communicate these kinds of learning opportunities to students in ways which make them attractive to students? Pete, should we start with you again?

Pete: Yeah, by all means. I think something that me and Simon have both touched on is… kind of… meeting people. I think it will be the social aspect of actually being at universities is a big part of why people go to university. So, I think actually working with people, team building, all of these kind of… what you do on a team away day type thing, and problem solving - all of that type of thing, I… that'd be really beneficial for people to actually…. I think it'd be an attractive kind of prospect, because, as I say, yeah, it's… we don't… coming out of lockdown as well, I think that that would actually be a big sell – that you come in, and some kind of, even, I don't know I’m just spit balling as I say. To actually have something up and running, it could be at that, just, like, I was thinking about when people leave halls and when they finish, what they do with all of their belongings and stuff like that. Would it be worthwhile kind of… having like a charity, like a charity shop type thing, and then somebody manages it for X amount of time, the other people volunteer there, and they sell stuff. There's plenty of spare stores – empty stores – along the high street. And then, once they've finished that, yeah, they can hand them back, or they can hand that to the next year, and kind of mentor them through that. Or, I think, like an actual hands… rather than being hypothetical, an actual hands on experience will be a lot more worthwhile than just kind of ‘imagine what could happen’ and that type of thing. Obviously, once money starts coming into it, it all gets a bit difficult, and yeah, I appreciate that, but to actually put people through the whole gamut - so how do you advertise, how do you make a poster or a flyer, or… from very grassroots, all the way up to the top. It could be promoting local bands, it could be anything, you know… I’m just trying to think of people who need help, and we could consider the student body to be kind of a voluntary workforce in a manner of speaking. And again, just to gain that bit more experience to put on CVs, and to say that I’ve done X, Y and Z, and it was it was a total failure but I’ve learned from that, and this is what I’d do differently, and that there are really powerful things to be able to put your hand up and say ‘I was successful’ or ‘I failed but I know why’ - it's a big part of selling yourself, so...

Andrea Macrae: On that note, in terms of communicating these opportunities, sometimes we say things like ‘would look great on your CV’ or ‘adds to your CV’ or ‘boosts your CV’, but we’re never sure whether that helps or hinders, because some students are really interested in that, but some students… I think it put some students off. Do you think messages like that, that highlight that kind of value of an experience, are probably valuable in the kind of headline communications about learning opportunities, or do you think we should be emphasising other kinds of things?

Pete: For me, I’ve read a lot of CVs. My last job - the [business name], I was there for over 10 years - and every job that we had, we’d get around 100 applicants. So I’ve read a lot CVs. I had 80 staff, so, yeah, it was, yeah, pretty full on. And I don't really think that people take CVs seriously at all. And they will try, and the application forms and stuff like that are severely lacking a lot of the time. And you know these people are intelligent, and you know that they can do the job, but they just can't sell themselves. But I also understand that people do kind of… are dismissive of ‘this is a great opportunity to do X, Y and Z’ – ‘Yeah, whatever’. And I’ve seen that - I’m aware of that and I’ve spoken to people in interview who could have written 500 pages in their CV and didn't, and they got to interview because I read between the lines, but a lot of people wouldn't do that. If you get that influx, your CV needs to be the one that stands out. It needs to be the one that, yeah, sells you. So I think it's a double-edged sword because it's… if you go somewhere with the CV that is lacklustre or just, kind of, the very basics of name, address, whatever, you do need to fill it out and boost that up to be a viable employee.

Andrea Macrae: Yeah. I think students invest in that differently over the course of their degree. So, first year students often rightly and understandably are probably more interested in just focusing on the degree right now and worry about jobs later, but then towards the end of degrees, there is a little bit of an uptake in students thinking ‘Okay, I do need to think about how I’m going to frame myself, and the next step in my journey’ so maybe it's also about managing the messaging around the timing and relative to students’ different stages in their degrees.

Pete: Well, no, I get that, and so we're aiming this at undergraduates and yeah, as I say, the CV, it's not important – it’s a million miles away.

Andrea Macrae: Yeah, yeah, and I understand that from the students’ perspective.

Pete: Completely – yeah - completely. But I’m just trying to think if there's another angle to sell it, that isn't just teamwork and meeting people and some kind of competitive element - a league table.

Andrea Macrae: Yeah – I wondered about competitive elements because they do tend to be more successful in engaging students in extracurricular stuff. Yeah, okay, that's worth us think about. Thank you. that's really helpful. Simon, what about you? What about your thoughts on… If you were to come up with an enterprise or entrepreneurship education style task or activity, what do you think might work for appealing to lots of students and how could it best be communicated?

Simon: Well, I speak from experience when I say that all we really have is time, so if I was to incentivise people to do this... this type of education… I would try and, like, make it sound really important, as it is important. Maybe have some incentives, like you have with the Amazon vouchers, just to maybe get poor people in a bit, but sort of advertised as being like a crucial part to your future career and just to get ahead of the game. Because, like, the way I work, I have, like, some days it's just like I’m in for, like, three or four hours - not in for a full day - so I feel like I could do the lessons and after have, like, an extra module in this… in this field. And it would just help to put on my CV to show that I did some extra work - I did some extra thing more relevant to work as opposed to just on my module. Make sense?

Andrea Macrae: Yes, so there is value in it being on top of… like, you opting to do something beyond what's absolutely necessary for your degree and that it's about kind of presenting it as a really valuable use of time.

Simon: Yeah, and also, like, scheduling it around your course. So, like I said, we've got so much free time that some days are not even in. Maybe have it that day or even, as I said, after my lesson in the gaps. Also, maybe have work with local employers so… just to kind of get that feel of work… professional life. So, I feel like that would be a really good time, when you're at uni, to sort of get that experience before you graduate, so you're more prepared when you do graduate, instead of being, like, like, you don't know what to do - in that you at least have, like, some experience, even if, like, it wasn't a success, like you said. It's still valuable because it… you know the ins and outs, essentially.

Andrea Macrae: So some kind of interaction with local employers and some exposure to the ins and outs of businesses. Okay, thank you. that's really helpful. if. Make reminds me that students have lots of different timetables and some of our students are working part time as well, and we really struggle with that, but timetabling is such a factor in terms of making things accessible for the broadest range of students so, yeah, thank you.

**Closing**

Okay, that is everything, and we are under an hour so well done us. Thank you so much for giving such full and rich responses. I really appreciate it. What will happen now to the data is I’ll be transcribing it and completely anonymising it, so in the data, in the reports, all of the respondents are given pseudonyms and that's true for survey responses as well. As I said, the data will be fed into a report for the Enterprise Educators UK funding body but also it might end up being published as an academic article, and there may be some direct quotation, but it will all be anonymised. So that’s just to give you a clear indication of where the data is going. If you're interested in the outputs of the study, they should be written up by kind of September/October time so do just drop me an email. I can share the results with you if you're at all interested in it. But, just to say again, thank you for your time today. I’ll be forwarding you those Amazon the vouchers for 20 pounds, for your time, and I will also forward the link to Enterprise Support.

# Student focus group 3: University of Birmingham students

**Introductory section**

Helen Hook: So, the recording is started so, let's do the introductions - Alex?

Alex: Umm so, I’m fourth year, fourth year LANS [Liberal Arts and Natural Sciences], umm well actually it’s my fifth year at university because I deferred my year abroad because of covid and I major in computer science, biology and neuroscience.

Helen Hook: Thank you Alex.

Bob: So, I’m second year and I study business management.

Helen Hook: Thank you. Rosie?

Rosie: I’m third year LANS student majoring in Biology.

Helen Hook: Thank you and Victor?

Victor: Just completed my first year in computer science, thank you.

Helen Hook: Thank you. Okay, So, first question is: have you engaged in any way with enterprise and/or entrepreneurship opportunities?

Alex: So outside I did this thing called um, I did this time called NCS, which is a kind of national citizen service or something. And through that your sort of linked up with a charity and you come up with fundraising ideas, you kind of try and spread awareness of the charity. Umm we had a couple of things where we were in Norfolk town centre we had a store, everyone has stores up for the charities that are associated with it, umm we had to speak to people through that and then we have to develop ideas for fundraising, umm but it was quite sort of basic, surface level stuff, and I’m not sure if anything actually ever got implemented, I think it's just like yeah.

Helen Hook: That sounds really interesting though.

Alex: It was alright, honestly, I don't feel like I got a huge amount out of it to be honest.

Helen Hook: OK. Any other enterprise or entrepreneurship opportunities? From either yourself Alex or anybody else on call. Sorry, did you say no?

Victor: Er… Yeah, no I haven't engaged in any.

Rosie: Yeah, I also haven't really. I think I kind of thought they would be like limited to people studying business or that sort of thing so, like since I do biology, I didn't really think there would be much point or reason for me to get involved with it, but, like I’ve kind of started to change my mind on that now and see the value of a bit more, so I’m doing enterprise module next year

Helen: Okay, and what made you change your mind?

Rosie: Um, to be honest, I probably just didn't actually know enough about it before and I’ve never been interested in like going into business or anything like that, but then I think you can get a lot of transferable skills umm that will be useful in other areas as well.

Helen: Fantastic.

Bob: So, umm, I sort of briefly have within my degree, but I’ve predominantly chosen like marketing modules and so, I’ve not really had the chance to touch upon enterprise, but I’ve picked a few enterprise modules, so I’m currently on my placement year, but for my final year and I have picked a ‘how to start a small business’ and ‘the basics of enterprise’ modules up.

Helen Hook: Is that credit bearing?

Bob: Yeah. They are worth like 20 credits each.

Helen Hook: Sounds really interesting. So, they are final year modules?

Bob: Yeah.

Helen Hook: And what were they called again?

Bob: Um, I could find the exact like name and code and put it in the chat like while we go through this?

Helen Hook: Only if you don’t mind. Thank you, that sounds great, amazing. So, thank you for that. So now we're moving on to, you know, discussing really, what entrepreneurial education is. So, firstly we'll be looking at some of the for definitions which have been drawn from the QAA which is the Quality Assurance Agency and that pretty much regulates content that's used in higher education, essentially, and they break down the definition. Here you can see it talks about entrepreneurial education is a catch all term that encompasses both Enterprise and Entrepreneurship and may be used and discussed in the combination of both. And to give you sort of more of that detail then, so here, sorry can you still see my screen?

Bob: Yeah…

Helen Hook: So, it says here, it's the process of developing students in a manner that provides them with an enhanced capacity to generate ideas and the behaviours, attributes, and competencies to make them happen, these can often be contextualised into any discipline, so the subject remains paramount. And then here we've got some of the competencies that are typically associated with enterprise, so you've got creative problem solving, calculated risk taking, critical thinking, spotting opportunities, adaptability, and reflection. And here you see some of the pedagogical practices which typically complements, and you see come hand in hand with enterprise often they're experiential and that essentially means that students learning by doing and often authentic so it might be that you engage in something where the assessments are set in a real-world context, for example. Or it could also mean small scale focused activities where you do things in a group and you're doing some creative problem solving, so it could be like a boot camp or something like that. So that’s what we've got for enterprise education. So now we'll go and have a look at the entrepreneurship education, so what they're saying is it aims to build on the enterprising competencies that you saw on the previous slide. Students who can identify opportunities in developing ventures that could be through self-employment, setting up a new business or developing and growing part of an existing venture. And here are some of the entrepreneurship competencies. So, it's as for enterprise, so it kind of builds on the enterprise, but also now includes things like business and finance, intellectual property, legal, digital marketing, risk management, negotiation, influencing and networking skills. And some of the pedagogical practices typically tend to be your more like standalone modules some that are more focused around, umm business start-up, innovation, and things like that essentially. So, thinking about those definitions. What kinds of experiences of learning about enterprise and/or entrepreneurship, if any, have been available to you as part of your university course or even through your extracurricular activities so far?

**Question: What kinds of experiences of learning about entrepreneurship and/or enterprise, if any, have been available to you as part of your university course or your extracurricular activities?**

Alex: In the research to policy LANS [Liberal Arts and Natural Sciences] module in first year, it’s kind of like an element of entrepreneurship I guess, in that you're identifying an issue, working in groups, research it and then produce a solution, which relates quite a lot of entrepreneurship, but it's more on the social side and is less like a financially motivated thing.

Helen Hook: So, you could see a connection between some of the competencies then?

Alex: Yeah, there’s definitely skills which are relevant.

Helen Hook: Does anybody else had any of these experiences? It could be a module, it could be something you’ve done in your spare time, extra-curriculum. Anybody else?

Victor: No, sorry not me.

Helen Hook: That's fine. How about yourself Bob?

Bob: So far, I’ve not, but I think it's probably because the modules that I’ve chosen, but I think within my degree there is scope if you pick those modules, to have those opportunities.

Helen Hook: And, are there any particular modules that sounds like it could be an enterprise or an entrepreneurship one? Have you seen any or heard of any that sound similar to what I’ve just explained?

Bob: Umm, off the top of my head, I’m not too sure, but all of them do. The ones that are definitely enterprise do have the word entrepreneur in them and I’ve just chose not to like focus my degree on that, but I will be picking up some modules in my final year based on it.

Helen Hook: Okay, fab, and Rosie?

Rosie: Other than the LANS [Liberal Arts and Natural Sciences] Research to Policy one, which I think is related but like quite loosely, I can't really think of any, and definitely I would say, definitely not extracurricular activities, but maybe there would have been more umm like if it wasn't the covid and stuff but I haven't had any of those.

Helen Hook: OK, thank you.

Alex: There was also, I’m sorry, there was an entrepreneurship society and I never had really been to much of the stuff but there was another society I was in which did like a collaboration with it. It was like one of the computer science courses, it did, like a collaboration with the entrepreneurship society and they have like a, just like I can hardly remember what it was about, but it was like a sort of a presentation thing.

Helen Hook: Okay.

Alex: Yeah, that was like a second year or something I don't remember exactly what happened but…

Helen Hook: I kind of… did you enjoy it?

Alex: Umm honestly, I can't remember much. I remember it happened, but that’s about it.

**Question: What kinds of activities would make entrepreneurial education opportunities more appealing for you?**

Helen Hook: Yeah, that's cool, thank you. So next question then, what, if anything, do you think would make learning about Enterprise and/or Entrepreneurship more appealing for you? So, what would make you if you haven't really engaged with it at the moment, what would make you want to?

Alex: I think if it was more like practically focused and sort of developed, Umm I felt like a lot of the sort of things I’ve been exposed to so far have been very sort of like high level, theoretical like, more skills based of like working in a team, coming up with an idea, but once you've sort of done that initial thing, if you were just left, you would still have no idea how to actually turn that into a business. How to go and get like money for it, if you have like a product idea how you'd approach manufacturers or designers to get it into an actual product, so I feel like a lot of the skills to then take ideas beyond that.

Helen Hook: OK. So, you want something that takes you to that next step really?

Alex: Most of the things I’ve been involved in are more just about the idea and then presenting the research, they don't really take you into the actual business.

Helen Hook: Yeah. So, you want that kind of research into action piece then don't you really? Like what do we do with this idea so that we can see what's happened with it.

Alex: Yeah, more genuine business and financial skills, I guess. yeah.

Helen Hook: that's a really good point. Thank you, anybody else?

Victor: I don't know if it already happened so I’m not really sure about this, but if you had like actual entrepreneurs come into the university for a talk. If it can be advertised well with the people like me who are not in like these courses, I think that would be appealing to me.

Helen Hook: Yeah. Thank you. Bob, Rosie do you have any comments on this?

Rosie: And maybe. Maybe if it was like, umm more, I don't know what the word is, like more advertised to people who aren't just already in business, and if it was like applicable to like a wider range of people, because I feel like it feels a bit like you know, like a small group of people are involved in it.

Helen Hook: So more inclusive?

Rosie: Uhh, yeah, in a way.

Bob: I’d agree with what is he said about it may in may be for it to be more inclusive, as I know, for my course umm the University had the first winner of the apprentice and last week to give a talk. I wasn't able to go because I’m working full time on my placement, but I would have gone and like throughout the year they've had like people from the dragon's den come in and to like speak about their journeys into entrepreneurship. So, I think like on campus always get these notifications but I’m assuming it's probably only for like the students under the Business School, so like accounting and finance and economics and business, but I guess if they open that up to other university students, I think it would also gain a lot of interest.

Helen Hook: Okay - thank you that's a really good point so for us just to make sure that these opportunities, it's made clear that it's not just the Business School that can attend, that actually it's more about how we sell the benefits and broaden this out with our marketing to students from across all five colleges. Thank you. Does anybody else have anything you'd like to add to this point before we move on? Okay.

**Question: Reflecting on these examples of entrepreneurial education opportunities, if you were given the freedom to design your own entrepreneurial education activity in a way that you felt would be appealing to both you and others, and how might it be most effectively communicated?**

Helen Hook: So, we've got a couple of scenarios now, in the sense that will be giving you a couple of examples of the ways in which we have embedded enterprise, entrepreneurship, entrepreneurial education, so it's predominantly now just to get your feedback to see what you think the models that we're going to be sharing with you. So as just mentioned here are the examples. Here is an example of a standalone module - these modules belong to liberal arts and natural sciences, they are final year modules and they are worth 20 credits each, so there is one called Learning Entrepreneurial Skills and then there is one called Entrepreneurial Start-up. Students are working in groups and what they do is they come up with digital start-up solutions to problem statements which have been provided by an organisation called digital Birmingham, and the priorities for Birmingham are sort of the pictures that you see at the bottom, of what the problem statements are framed around, so it's looking at how to provide a digital solution to support, you know sort of housing or jobs and skills health or children, so really diverse and interesting projects that students get to work on. And here are some advanced stages of what's covered in this module so there's obviously an element of ideation coming up with those solutions, and then there's the optimisation, which is your more practical looking at how you would develop your business solution looking at business model canvas. Doing financial predictions and financial modelling for how you launch your business and sustain your business, there's also sessions on IP and patenting and digital marketing. So, it's about website design and online advertisement things like that, and then how you pitch your idea to like a Dragons’ Den essentially. That's one example. The other example that we have is more of the contextualised enterprise education. So, this is where the subject we try to keep it remaining paramount so you wouldn't necessarily know it's an enterprise module where you're developing enterprise skills. But this is just one way of doing it, so we've developed this consultation model, where we have industry projects embedded into the curriculum. So, similar to, I think what I think a few of you have already studied with your research to policy module, where it's an actual brief that you're working on. But the example we've got here is we had the West Midlands police provide a problem statement, that you can see here on the screen, and that's, they were asking our students, you know how do we rebrand the West Midlands police? Essentially, it was around the recruitment and selection, they wanted to appeal to more BAME communities to recruit more BAME officers. That was the problem statement our students worked on, so what they did, is they provided so group work solutions through the linguistic research skills, creative Problem-Solving through design thinking and then they came up with a solution which was presented them back to the employer. This was the assessment, so they provided a group employer report with the findings, and they also gave a presentation, so this is our contextualised model. And then we've got authentic assessments. This is another college of arts and law module, this one was actually ran fully by the Department of International Trade, so it was very authentic in the sense we had their trainers coming in to deliver content for us, it was around BREXIT and how we can support small businesses to explore which countries to actually export to essentially, And the authentic assessment, was students were designing a White Paper so it's taking them away from the traditional kind of essay response, but actually looking at how they would structure, a White Paper report to factor in what they've been taught and what they found out as a project group. So that's one example of authentic assessment. So, our question to you now is imagine that you know that we're tasked with creating an enterprise education opportunity that appeals to as many undergraduate students as possible. What advice would you give us about what kind of activities it could involve to be most appealing? And about how we could tell students about in the most engaging way. So, I appreciate this is quite a long question, and so we can spend a little bit of time on this and obviously I want to give you some sense of headspace to digest the question as well, but have you got any thoughts on how you might advise that we go about this? So, this is us coming to you, I guess, so if we were to design a module for you, what would you want it to look like? How could you make it appeal to as many students as possible.

Alex: um I definitely like the authentic assessment thing, having assessments that reflects what will you do in the real world. Yeah, I think this one is good.

Helen Hook: In what sense of what specifically do you like about that Alex?

Alex: um because I feel like the whole concept of entrepreneurship is trying to develop real world practical skills which you can then apply and so doing it in the same way that you would do it in the real world, makes a lot of sense. Like it's a less theoretical topic rather than like if you're studying some like module in biology, where you're learning about like the theory of knowledge, which could then be applied in many different ways, I feel, like, I suppose, they are skills that could be applied in many different ways, but it's more there's a more practical area.

Helen Hook: A practical concept. Anybody else have thoughts? So, if we were tasked to create a new enterprise education opportunity to appeal to as many students as possible what advice would you give? So, we've already had the authentic assessment, so definitely ensure the assessments are authentic from what Alex just said. Is there anything that would make it really appealing?

Victor: Yeah, so for me, I think the business pitch ideas like if we can practice our business pitches, I think for an entrepreneurship module I think that will be really great, rather than us having to write really long essays in the whole course. I don't think that sounds appealing to me what sounds well actually I my take is that I can have a group, I can teach my business, in as a part of my course work, I can actually reach the distributors on the people from the other thing that sounds more appealing to me personally. yeah.

Helen Hook: Did you say to reach the distributors?

Victor: Yeah, if you can have like any sort of like communication by the University. If possible, yeah.

Helen Hook: Okay, so we've got you like the idea of pitching, authentic assessment. Is there anything else, what advice would you give me? What activities would you find appealing on an enterprise module?

Alex: One of the things that stood out to me, and one of the ones you just showed us was the financial planning. So, like the costing for like the next, I think it was three years or whatever I like working out exactly what finances you need to start up the business how it would then be like funded going forwards and what profit but yeah, just like the financial costing sounded quite interesting. Because that's something I feel like, it isn't really enough. yeah. And, also, if the module was sort of like less, and if it was basically, actually making a start-up, rather than just sort of that more theoretical thing if that makes sense. I think the LANS existing entrepreneurship module kind of does this already in a way. Umm because I know some people who have done that, who are now planning on continuing this what they started in the module and actually turning into a proper business, but basically Yeah, to be able to whatever start you make in the module to then be viable as an actual business going forward, if someone decided to take it forward, but also for them to have the knowledge and skills from the module to be able to do that.

Helen Hook: Yeah, so some sort of pathway from doing the module, that if you actually have a business idea that you've developed across those, could be 10, 20 odd weeks, that you’d want to be able to pursue and carry on.

Alex: Yeah, well, you should hopefully, you should have gained the skills and knowledge of needs to then turn it into like a viable business - which might be a lot to ask for with one module, but you know what I mean.

Helen Hook: That now I mean it's just good to have these ideas, and it's something that we can certainly look into.

Alex: It could even be like a two-part thing like if there's a lot of content that people are expecting to fit in maybe like the first one could be like a more planning, starting, like ideation or more theoretical based module and then the second part could be more like taking an idea and then turning it into an actual business and then, if people just want to do the second part for instance, maybe they could just be provided with an idea. You can either like take an idea that you've developed, if you did the first like part one of the module then you could just use the idea that you've developed in that, and if you just came in and only want to do the second module you can just be like given an idea or like something and then you've been taken and developer.

Helen: Really good idea, Rosie, Bob, do you have anything you can do think of that would help me for example to create a new opportunity. What would appeal to you, or what do you think would appeal to your peers?

Rosie: I think that. If you were able to get some entrepreneurs, or like maybe investors to talk with while you're going through the process, especially if, like Alex said it was possible to, continue the business, then I feel like being able to speak to people who had done it before or were quite successful, then that would be helpful. And, also, I think just being able to work with someone like kind of mentoring you and a small group would be helpful, rather than rather than, you know, like sitting in a lecture and just listening, to actually be able to speak with someone quite a lot and get advice on your project.

Helen Hook: Yeah, that's a really nice point. So, if there was a module for example, where we actually had more externals coming in to do that co delivery piece with the academics, would that be appealing to you Rosie?

Rosie: Yeah, I think it would make it like more interesting to hear from different people each week as well. Yeah, that'll definitely be more appealing.

Helen Hook: Okay, and Bob you have anything that you can think of which would be useful for us to consider?

Bob: Yeah, I quite liked the module that you showed about like the police, because that's like a real-life example so definitely suggest like having real life scenarios that students can tackle. I feel like that makes you think you're involved in something that is actually going to make a change, rather than something like hypothetical. But even if it doesn't go any farther it's just knowing that you're working on something real if that makes sense?

Helen Hook: it's that element of giving back, is that what you like the idea of doing? So, learning, but, actually, also knowing it's making an impact somewhere?

Bob: Yeah.

Helen Hook: Yeah, and do you have any specific sectors I mean is there anything that you are particularly, if you could pick anything to be embedded, any type of project, from any type of industry or sector, do you have any that springs to mind that would be of particularly interest to you?

Bob: I’m not too sure if this is correct, but like maybe like the charity sector, particularly as it's like not for profit. So, I think most people think entrepreneurship is just about profit, but you could look at something as a contrast.

Helen Hook: Yeah, we've got social enterprise which is exactly that, it's kind of giving back. I think that's really important, I think designing modules and building in projects that actually mean something to students. I think that's a good point. Anything else? I mean how would, so if we’ve got this amazing opportunity, so we've embedded everything that you've all just said, how could we make this appealing to as many undergraduate students as possible, what could we do?

Alex: Umm potentially tutors suggesting it, I know I only heard about the LANS [Liberal Arts and Natural Sciences] entrepreneurship module through like people mention like lecturers mentioning it. During like other LANS modules, that like say oh Yeah, we just introduced this module. And I’m not sure whether they still bring that up now it's been around for a bit, but Yeah, basically just doesn't need to be like a presentation or a speech, but just saying like we've got this module is about this, if anyone wants to look at what check out.

Helen Hook: Just like word of mouth. prompting yeah?

Alex: Also, another thought I had was, it might be worth differentiating between social entrepreneurship and the more financial based entrepreneurship. I feel like you approach them in quite different ways, they're reasonably different things, and they appeal to different people. Because like with the research to policy module, I think already kind of leans towards social entrepreneurship and the existing LANS one kind of leans more towards financial entrepreneurship – so to distinguish between the two.

Helen Hook: Yeah. Okay.

Alex: And it might also um there's um a start-up fund, an idea funds through B-Enterprising. So, I’m not sure whether they could be like incorporated in some way, so that if you're developing ideas through the module or if you like actually start a business through the module, umm you could, you might, like have applying for these grants as a part of the module.

Helen Hook: Yeah, that's a really good idea. So, the link to the B-Enterprising?

Alex: or if there's any connections with like investors who are genuinely interested in. Like investing in student ideas. I don't know whether like how easy it would be to get those connections, though.

Helen Hook: I mean we can certainly ask. Obviously, I am part of the B-Enterprising Team, so I sit in the curriculum, but my colleagues who work on the boot camps and, who run these start-up funds, I’m sure they’ll be able to point us in the right direction. So yeah, I have made a note of that, so really good, really good point. OK. Anything else? How can we make this appeal to students? Is there anything on, somebody before mentioned the, about the skills that you develop. Is that something that would sell do think when it comes to students picking modules?

Alex: I think earlier on maybe, it depends on what year these modules are in, because by the time people reach third year, they’ve done plenty of working in teams, leadership, group projects, developing different ideas and stuff so a lot of the ideation side and the teamwork side, we've already done quite a lot. And so, I think a lot of the time, those sorts of skills are less appealing. Not the module wouldn't still be able to include those, it’s probably a less interesting sales point for a lot of people.

Helen Hook: OK. So, thinking about activities, are there any activities that you would like to see embedded in a module? Anything you’ve seen happen elsewhere, where you’ve thought “actually, I’d quite like to do that in a module and wish I could do that” Is there anything in particular that you would think is valuable to include in an enterprise module that you've not seen happen elsewhere, even? Okay. So, the last part of this question, how we could tell students about it in the most engaging way, so we've already had tutors, so linking with tutors and academics to sign post. Are there any other ways that we could share information to students? Particularly homing in on the point that was made earlier about opportunities been spotted, but feeling they were just for the Business School students, so how could we tell students about enterprise modules in an engaging way so that we move away from that feeling, so that you don't feel like this is just for the Business School students?

Rosie: Maybe if there was a way for the other Schools to somehow incorporate it for something to do with that School umm and they could present it to students in that way, I can't think of like a concrete example of how that would work, but, then that would show that it is a worthwhile thing to do, even though you're not a business student.

Helen Hook: Okay. So, tailoring the comms to the subject discipline, or to the programme of study?

Rosie: Yes, so it would be specific for each School, that they would have to do something different to make it like fit for their School.

Helen Hook: Thank you.

Alex: What School subjects will these modules sit, would they be LANS [Liberal Arts and Natural Sciences] modules or…

Helen Hook: it could be for any college.

Alex: Okay, because it would be, if there was flexibility, I’m not sure if this would also be too much to ask, but if there was some level of flexibility within the module for the actual content to be somehow tailored towards different subjects as well. As because, like if you're a Bio or Biology student thinking about like entrepreneurship, you're probably thinking of developing very different sorts of ideas. So, if you're like, I don't know, like a computer science, or just like a like a business student.

Helen Hook: Yeah, so having the option to take parts of the content and then do that contextualise piece?

Alex: Yeah.

Helen Hook: So, it feels more in tune with a student, for example studying biology, or it could be a student studying media, for example, so having that tailored approach?

Alex: Yeah, if there was staff or even contacts in different Schools, like, for instance, if you had like some sort of drug development proposal, it would be potentially like approach it in a different way to if you have like a product either. Like if you did some research and then wanted to like paid for some scientific idea then it will be different.

Helen Hook: Good idea. OK. Anything else for this question?

Victor: Yeah, just have to add something I was thinking, if we can have something like in the library as soon as you enter the library. I’ve seen like many people advertise here. So, it could reach, potentially reach more people than it will reach. Yeah, that might be intriguing to me.

Helen Hook: Okay, yeah, so just having more visibility? Yes, I can sign it around campus.

Victor: Yeah, yeah.

Helen Hook: Yeah, that's a good point. I think sometimes going old school isn't it? Just posters and pop up things like that? Yeah, thank you that's a good really good point. Okay anything else before we move on to the next slide? OK, so, if you were asked to talk about your Enterprise and Entrepreneurship skills and the experience at an interview what kind of things, do you think you might say?

**Question: If you were asked to talk about your Enterprise and Entrepreneurship skills and the experience at an interview what kind of things, do you think you might say?**

Alex: Probably just like go through sort of specific things I’ve done and say yeah, then just walk them through like certain things I’ve done and then wait for them to ask questions they're interested in specific things I’d said.

Helen Hook: Yeah. And can you think in your mind at the moment, one of those specific things might be? Would it be the project from research to policy for example?

Alex: Yeah, I’d probably bring in. Umm… I did also do a placement actually. Umm… when I deferred my year abroad, where I worked for a little start-up, and I had to do weekly presentations that were internal and also, external to like investors. Umm and then I then started, after the first six months I started leading my own projects, umm and I had my own interns. That I guess, yeah, I’d just talk about like different things I had to do and emphasise like skills that I’ve done.

Helen Hook: And what skills, would you decide that you gained?

Alex: Some leadership skills, teamwork skills, having to like communicate efficiently and effectively to meet tight deadlines umm, presentation skills, getting very comfortable with speaking to internal and external people, Umm, I guess.

Helen Hook: OK. Anybody else, so those that feel they have had either an enterprise or an entrepreneurship experience, whether that be on a module or whether that be something outside the curriculum or even something umm you know, outside of university. What kind of things would you say at an interview what kind of skills might you, you mention that you'd developed?

Rosie: I only have a little bit of experience from the LANS module, but I think I’d definitely emphasise communication and presentation like Alex said. Also, ability to like respond to challenges and unexpected things going wrong umm in the process.

Helen Hook: Yeah, sort of that resilience that you've built?

Rosie: Yeah.

Helen Hook: Brilliant. Thank you. And Victor do you have anything that you can draw upon?

Victor: I don't have any, umm you know skills like entrepreneurship skills at the moment because of my course, but I do have some leadership skills that I might just throw in. So yeah, that’s the only thing I can say at the moment.

Helen Hook: Bob? Do you have anything you’d like to add in here Bob. Okay, no problem. So, we are actually at the end of the focus group so I’m going to stop sharing my screen and stop the recording.

# Student focus group 4: University of Birmingham students

**Introductory section:**

Mircea Scrob: Continuing with this call will be a confirmation that you agreed to have this conversation recorded, I should say that the recording is going to be audio only, we are not going to have video capturing and also, after the focus group is transcribed we are going to completely anonymize the data set. So you still have the possibility of withdrawing 10 days after this focus group; after 10 days, we are going to anonymize the data set so it will be impossible to take out what each of you individually, have said. I think that is about it from me at the moment I’m not sure if you have any questions, but if you have them, please fire away, I can try to answer them, as well as I can, so any questions? All right, if not, I guess, some introductions are in order and it could be helpful, so why not just say a couple of words about ourselves: what we do? What is our departmental affiliation?; What Year of Study are we in? And anything that you think might be important about yourself. And I might as well start so again, I am Mircea Scrob, I am a Lecturer in the Liberal Arts and Natural Sciences programme. That is a program that allows students to study across a wide range of disciplines from history to physics, for instance. And I am also the module lead for a string of modules that are called the entrepreneurial skills modules, these are offered to our final your students. To help them with their employability, so this is the angle of how I came into this research project because I’m one of the providers of entrepreneurial education at University of Birmingham. I have been in Birmingham for five years now; it feels like a lifetime - I think everything that happened before the pandemic feels like a lifetime. But I very much enjoyed it so, yeah, I’m very keen always to get the opinion of students about what we are doing in terms of educational provision. So that's about me who would want to go next?

Ella: I don’t mind. Yeah.

Mircea Scrob: Please.

Ella: So, I’ve just finished my third year in Sports Exercise Health Science. But I’m going to stay on at university of Birmingham to do a Masters. It's just a complete research-based Masters so lectures are finished hopefully, forever. And now just, yeah, I wasn't planning on doing a Masters, I was planning on doing a PE teaching course because we never really had much experience with the lab work and things like that, and then we got to do really interesting research projects, so I was like: ah, you know what, if I get a chance to do a masters then, I’ll take it. So yeah, I’m from Dudley, originally, so I’m not a Brummie but I am kind of from close to Birmingham.

Mircea Scrob: I think it’s as close as you can get, isn't it? So yeah, definitely so. All right, thank you very much, and good luck with the master of research - should be fun. Is it a one year or two year Master programme.

Ella: I think it's a one year because it's like funded by company because, so we just have to do one research project to prove something that, well, not prove. Just to see if what they want is the case, I guess. And then… So hopefully I can get it done in one year - that would be quite nice.

Mircea Scrob: Exciting stuff! Nice start! Good luck with it.

Adam: So, I’m a student, in Business Management, just finished my second year, um… and I found it really interesting along the way, and I have different passions as well. From the sub sections in business management and my ambition is to work in Finance in the future, after graduation, um just because I love it so much, I think, as a concept and yeah that's pretty much me summed up.

Mircea Scrob: All right, thanks, very much. Is it a three-year degree, I suppose, isn’t it?

Adam: It is a three-year degree, yeah.

Mircea Scrob: Alright, so going into the final year, that is going to be exciting as well.

Adam: Yeah. Yeah.

Mircea Scrob: All right, all right.

Adam: A bit nervous as well.

Mircea Scrob: It always is, it always is but yeah, I think, looking back it's not as scary as…as people often think about the final year, so, yeah, do to try to enjoy it as much as possible and it is going to be a bit of a challenge with juggling responsibilities with the final year and also looking for jobs, but, yeah, I think with a good plan all is well, so, yeah, all the best with finding the desired job.

Adam: Thank you, appreciate it.

**Question: Are you engaged in any way with enterprise or entrepreneurship opportunities, either in your studies or in your extracurricular activity?**

Mircea Scrob: All right, let's get on, then, with it. I realised that I may have forgot to move the slide. Just the next one, so this is the one about the focus group. It is going to be about the attitudes, practices and experiences with entrepreneurial education, so this is going back to one of the questions that were on a survey. And it had to do with whether you are engaged in any way with enterprise or entrepreneurship opportunities, so this has to be…. this can be either in your studies or in your extracurricular activity. Just to start the discussions and before we introduce the discussion of the terminology: what do you think about it, have you been engaged with anything that had to do with enterprise or entrepreneurship opportunities, just on the face with it?

Adam: Yeah. Yes

Mircea Scrob: Right, good. Ella what are your thoughts on this one?

Ella: I’m not too sure what would class as an entrepreneurship opportunity, really, so I might have taken part in it, but I’m not too sure.

Mircea Scrob: That’s fair; that is what we usually find out because enterprise & entrepreneurship can be so…cryptic the terminology that people usually find it hard to pinpoint whether they are doing it, and whether they are not doing it and it's not the label that it is important, it is the skills that you get with this kind of opportunity. So, I will come back in a moment with discussing the definitions for it and what kind of skills and practices are typical of enterprise and entrepreneurship opportunities and bearing those ones in mind, because we can come back to this question, then, when we have a clearer understanding of what is meant by these kinds of educational opportunities.

Adam, can I ask you, was it your studies that you have studied about entrepreneurship or enterprise education or was it your extracurricular activities? Or both?

Adam: Yeah, yeah, it was an extracurricular activity.

Mircea Scrob: All right, Okay, that is interesting and as part of your business studies, did you say that you were doing business and management? Did you have opportunities that dealt with entrepreneurship?

Adam: Honestly, no, not that I recall, um, or was aware of, to be fair, no, I would say no, yeah.

Mircea Scrob: All right, good so let's have a proper the proper look at what is meant by Enterprise and Entrepreneurship education and that one we can use to structure our discussions going forward. So again, you will have to bear with me for this one, because it will require me a bit of talking to be…to be done - so about five minutes of presenting the various definitions and again, because it is such an…an esoteric concept, it would be good to go through them at pace. Please feel free to stop me and ask any questions if you have them because it is better to have a clear understanding of these concepts, rather than me just going through the entire material that has to be delivered in this focus group. So entrepreneurial education is usually an umbrella term. If you look at the Quality Assurance Agency, they usually define entrepreneurial education as having two components: enterprise and entrepreneurship. Now, the reason why we asked students about Enterprise and Entrepreneurship and not about Entrepreneurial is because we find that there is this kind of migration. From entrepreneurship to entrepreneurial education: when people hear entrepreneurial education they immediately think of start-ups, they think of businesses, they think of everything else. But actually, entrepreneurial education has two components: Enterprise and Entrepreneurship and it's used to refer to both. So what is meant by enterprise education is the kind of processes and activities that are intended to make students develop those kinds of behaviours, ideas, attributes and competencies to make things happen, so this is something that can be nonspecific in terms of disciplines - it doesn't have to do with business, specifically, it can be anything that is problem based and everything that is very much oriented towards solving a problem. So some of the key competencies that are important in enterprise education is creative problem solving, is calculated risk taking, is critical thinking, is spotting opportunities, is adaptability, and it is reflection. And some of the formats and some of the practices that are used to deliver and to…nurture this kind of competencies is usually through experiential activities, so you can have simulations, you can have boot camps. You can have problem-based modules in which you are presented with a problem, like: *How to tackle food poverty in a certain Community?* and you have to come up with a certain plan and with a certain clear strategy for addressing the topic at hand. Some of the preferred methods of assessment are authentic assessments, so this can be White Papers, but it doesn't necessarily have to be only that - it can be, for instance, blog posts that are used to transform a scientific concept into something that can be easily understood by the public at large. The key thing is that they are always looking outside of the academia, the purpose is to get as much as possible, or as close as possible to the real world of practice; to develop those kinds of attributes, again, of making things happen. And much of the delivery of this kind of teaching or content is in small scale focused activity, so that is very much a lot of group work that is happening and, again, it is all driven by a problem. So enterprise education, in a nutshell, concerns all of these competencies and it is no subject specific: you can have it in History, and you can have it in Sciences and you can have it in Business as well. Now, entrepreneurship education, takes a little bit the discussion closer to business and economics, in a sense that it is intended at facilitating students starting their own start-ups, starting their own businesses or becoming self-employed. And very much a lot of the competencies that we just discussed under enterprise education, are still important for entrepreneurship education as well. The only difference is, is that a lot of the… or some of the competencies that are added, are more geared towards facilitating the starting of one’s on business, so you can have trainings into business and finance. You can have trainings into intellectual property and legal awareness, a lot of focus on digital marketing, Business management, negotiation skills and influencing and networking skills, just because of how important this is in the entrepreneurship world. And some of the preferred pedagogical practices in teaching for…for promoting this kind of educational opportunities is stand-alone modules - so you can have this kind of innovation on start-up modules in which you are taken through all stages of business creation, from ideation up to pitching to a panel of industry experts. So a lot of the modules that you're going to see or a lot of educational opportunities that are in entrepreneurship education are some of this kind of well rounded modules or offerings that take you through the entire cycle of business creation. So, in a nutshell, this is what entrepreneurial education is: it covers both Enterprise and Entrepreneurship education; so now with this discussion in mind; with some of the definitions that…we have just covered, what do you think going back to the original question: have you had any learning opportunities in your studies of engaging with Enterprise and Entrepreneurship education? It can be in your studies or extracurricular and then we can move into your studies specifically.

**Question: With the QAA definitions of enterprise and entrepreneurship education in mind, has your answer to the first question changed - have you engaged with enterprise or entrepreneurship education within your studies or extracurricular activites?**

Ella: Yes, seeing the definitions made me think yes, I definitely have now. Would it be possible to go back to the enterprise slide, so I can see the definitions again?

Mircea Scrob: Yes.

Ella: Thank you. Yeah, definitely Problem Solving, like we've had to design a study for a piece of course work. And, also, critical thinking when we critically evaluate a paper, I really think that that's changed the way I think a lot. And it's given me a new way of thinking and approach in a lot of things in my own life as well, but, um, and it's almost like I feel that…perhaps when we're told about it, it could be made more obvious how, how else it can be applied to different things because, like I sat here at the start of the call thinking: I’ve never done anything like this, but even I feel have come out of university as a different person. Yeah, I feel like the lecturers don't do what they're doing enough justice; they’re doing something really good for us and we don't even know it, so yeah.

Mircea Scrob: That's very interesting, so it is more with the enterprise education that you have engaged and can I ask about this module that you have just mentioned, what was the assessment, it was actually the research paper: was it assessed? and was it group work?

Ella: And so, one of them … there were two different assignments, one of them was critical evaluation of a paper, we could choose to work with a partner if we wanted to. I did. But it was in one of the earlier years, so it was one of those if… like my partner didn't actually do much of the work. But yeah and it really made me think about things, and because you’re taught to just, up until university just trust what's written in a textbook as well, and so to tear apart someone else’s paper…Another one was creative problem solving; oh so we would have to design say a training program for an athlete they, they give us a scenario; another one was to design…Often we'd have to write a method section - I can't remember what the method was for, but it was something more biological: doing a test in the lab for that and write an abstract for it or another assignment will be: write a discussion for something that's already been done as well, um, in which you'd have to relate it to like different, different papers and actually come up with an opinion; so that's quite good.

Mircea Scrob: All right, they do sound really, really good; and what do you think did the lecturers… At the moment, when you were doing, it was it clear the value that they provided -because you did say that the lecturers are perhaps not doing full justice to what they are offering; was it clear what, what was the importance of doing this kind of modules?

Ella: Um, that's, that was the thing: I think they were more trying to get across what the assignment was rather than why it's so valuable and…And yes, so I think a lot of people probably missed out on an opportunity, because they just see it as: ah, it is this task that I’ve got to get done to pass my degree and they focus on the fact that this is an assignment instead of finding it interesting and thinking: you know what? I’m in the real world now and it's time for me to form my own opinion. Yeah ,and I only just… I probably had that mindset until third year because the research…. what we were doing didn't seem real until we did our research project so, yeah.

Mircea Scrob: It's really interesting; that is really interesting and yeah I think that is the major challenge with, with the disconnect between what is taught and what is…the real world out there and the research project is a good opportunity for bridging the gap. Adam, what do you think about these, these definitions? Now thinking about these definitions…had you had opportunities…?

Adam: I still agree I had a lot of enterprise education. Before university as well, quite a lot: in sixth form school, it was really encouraged that we essentially, in a group, started our sort of own business. The proceeds of which went to charity, so the profit that we got went to charity work. Essentially all of competencies were required in this. So I mean, for instance spotting opportunities, I remember it was Summer and when we were given the task of initially setting up a charitable initiative. And immediately, we thought that, right, okay… so what was offered in the canteen where students eat? And what maybe could sort of…. what was essentially the gap what was something that they would be willing to pay for that's not being offered that we could potentially offer to them. So, then, we all came together, there was an ideation phase, where we had a board and we just got to brainstorm quite a few things so we had slush machines, we had an ice cream; that things that really, you know, that would really give us a proper outcome that, I mean, guarantee us some taking away quite a bit of profit, which in turn did happen in the end, so I mean, stuff like that, whilst, okay, on the ground, it may seem that, like, it was only a little, you know, studying activity set by the school, whatever, it required a lot of those competencies. Um, kind of which really, I guess, shape the way my future went myself anyway, it really did help inspire me into the world of business, entrepreneurship and enterprise. And I think those kinds of things when you're out there and it's all hands on, and I think that's better than any sort of textbook education. When you're actually doing something for real and kind of dealing with problems - that was quite a big one in there, there was different conflicts that were going on. And, at one point I was the leader at one of the charitable initiatives; and with my kind of achieved conflict manage, I guess, in that, to ensure that we kind of achieved a collective great outcome. Risk taking - we had that a lot as well because we were allocating funds, however, we needed to ensure that we were…. there was going to be a return from that; we were not just allocating funds into areas where they, they… I mean the, the outcome would be futile if students didn't prefer that sort of product that we were offering to them, or a certain service maybe. Critical thinking - again desperately was needed; Um you had to consider every element sort of many things, I mean if it was food that we were offering. I mean we were pretty much kids but we were already considering: the wider implications of all the different types of food, bringing in, bringing in a lot of kind of….. sort of… how could I explain this, um…. wider implications, I guess, into sort of…How it would be, because we had to be considered…. the school was concerned that…They didn't want the students just essentially spend their money on just sweets and ice cream and not actually eating real food. So, we had to think about a lot of things; it was quite, it was quite a diverse one, what we had… on the things that we had to consolidate. And then reflection again: we kept getting better and better at these charitable initiatives; which definitely demonstrated to us that we had all the other competencies and they were enhancing themselves with each charitable initiative we took. So I mean, now, as I said, I mean we did have that, I guess, experiential activity. Um… and I think it really worked – it did us the world of good. We understood sort of, how something can be come from nothing, and there was initiative at the start. It was just because of a lot of motivation, I guess, that we actually achieved something in the end, so I think, yeah, there's different types of enterprise education that can be given, but, in my context, it was just going out there, basically going into the playground, going in before school, after school, and making sales, generating enough sales to actually be recognized and then, um, just because it was the sake of the intention, it gave all us a chance. It was… for us it was about profit maximization as well, because we wanted to give more to charity. So like how would we manage our costs? what would be our profits? who are going to be our suppliers? which supermarkets are we going to? are we going to let… I mean we were considering quite little things: are we going to buy in bulk to reduce the cost per item. It was really good, I think. That, I think, just puts you in good stead because you're a child, you’re really going to take it in and then going into the future, if you can replicate that kind of behaviour on a wider scale. It can really help you make a successful business or, you know, go into the future with that sort of that mindset about okay, if there's an idea that I can spot, if there's a gap in the market, I can fulfil it and by using the same criteria that I was when I was doing the charitable initiative, I could potentially replicate success on a wider scale. So, and that's totally my experience of it, and I was all for it at the time as well.

Mircea Scrob: Good, good. I mean what I’m getting here is, is a sense that this is something that you have enjoyed both of you, and it is something that you would, you would like to see more of it and you would recommend. Um, can you see any barriers, let's say any drawbacks of this kind of education, these kinds of things that are very experiential just, just so that we see both sides of…of it. Or when you first did it did you opt into it, or were you rather thrown into it and then you realized the value of it?

**Question: Did you enjoy your entrepreneurial education experiences, and/or do you see any barriers or drawbacks to these kinds of educational experiences?**

Adam: No, I mean I opted into mine and in terms of drawbacks, if I’m honest, I don't see any but that may just be because the experience I was given was a really good one. There was a solid team, we did have a few teachers help us, kind of give us ideas, get us in the right direction. The way it was given to us, the variables that were set insured our success, basically, um, however, a potential drawback, maybe, if this enterprise education is given, but the wrong….ahhhh…it's hard to describe because I don't think you can potentially give the wrong information to someone, especially if they're doing an experiential activity. They're going to learn, even if the outcome isn't great and it's quite demotivating in the end, and maybe they didn't make a profit, they made a loss. Or they fell out with someone or of something in this business, umm, I think still there's not a drawback to. I think…it'd be a great lesson - like if my, for instance, experience hadn't gone so well, um I would have learned not what not to do next time, what I did in that experience that I shouldn't do again to ensure success. I mean I don't think there is, I think the best, as you mentioned, you, you kind of suggested that we would recommend it to…potential students and whatever, and I think I would - I’m all for it, and I think it's needed and it's needed, and this. Is needed, is needed all the time - I wouldn’t say more than, more now than ever, I think it's needed all the time. Because, for… I think there is great opportunities to be seen, and when you tap into talent that students have. That, that sets them as well, that helps them to, you know, understand where they fit in and maybe if they get a feel for it, they may follow that pursuit and think that alright, okay they may start their own businesses, they may start forming teams of people and understanding the way, okay, where gaps are in the market and start selling out - there's a lot of that happening as well, and a lot of people who may…for instance, not feel that a 9 to 5 job is for them a lot of them are given this a ball, yes, that is said that there's something like 90% of startups that do fail, but the 10% that do, maybe, they were given this education, who knows? that's a good question just as well.

Mircea Scrob: Good. Yes, Ella, please.

Ella: I think I might have like a slight drawback to this, this type of thing, because I think a lot of what we've been talking about it, it takes a lot of… you have to find motivation from somewhere and like, like. Um, like you really enjoyed doing, it sounds like a great project what you did with the charity and everything and, and you found…That you really enjoyed it - for so many people it's hard to, like you said, tap in and, and I think…and show people the value in it, because if you, if you aren't looking for what you can gain in in something. So say, if we aren't looking, oh, how does this apply to the real world in all of our lectures and how looking to find something interesting and it can be quite hard to motivate yourself and… which is where I think, that's perhaps, might, might be the way to improve the enterprise education, because, it's so hard to notice the opportunities. It's like every opportunity at the end of the lecture to ask questions - if you don't ask a question this, this person's like top in their field, because they're a lecturer and they've done so many papers and so many people don't have the confidence or belief in themselves to ask a question or think outside the box and find an interest in, in the subject just so they have motivation to do the assignment. And then they end up not being able to spot opportunities and, and, and say reflect on a, on a bad assignment and think how can I improve for the next one that they'll end up just thinking - oh, I’m bad at this and don't it find interesting and there's got to be a way that we could improve what we're putting across to help people find that motivation, because we can't just say: you've either got it in you or your haven’t to find those, yeah but I don't know how to do that.

Mircea Scrob: Now, that is, that is really, really important about, about motivation and I think some of the…Some of the benefits of this kind of educational opportunities is that you can find the motivation, as Adam was saying, once you get involved into the project you do it for its own sake, because they see the value of it, and you know that it is. It is something that you can find applicability to it, and as you were saying, Ella, as well, once you have done it and critiquing the paper in doing the kind of backstory of how science is done, you can get involved into it, because then you realize: Okay, this is something that is very immediate and meaningful, but I guess, this is, this is perhaps a question that…that is more about finding your perspective because it's not something that you may be able to answer straightforwardly because you are all both have said that you have engaged with enterprise education but according to the results of the survey - this is very preliminary data - 90% of the students, of the respondents have said that they have not engaged at all either with enterprise, or with entrepreneurship education in their education, and that is a massive number, even if we are generous because we conflated all the…all the other categories and we have used just the 90% of the ones who have said that they haven't engaged at all, either in curricular or extra-curricular activities. That's a massive number, so what do you think, what are some of the things that are keeping away people from engaging with this kind of, with these kinds of opportunities just out of your experience, maybe with friends and, again, is not the right…is maybe the question that is difficult to answer, because you have both engaged with enterprise education at a certain level.

**Question: What kinds of things do you think are putting students off engaging with entrepreneurial education opportunities?**

Ella: I think like education up until university was all pushed towards exam technique: pass the exam. And you don't really know why you're doing it, you’re just told you have to do it. So then, you might approach university well, I certainly did, with I’ve got to keep going now, keep… I’ve got to pass all these exams, I don't want to…, especially at University when you're paying money to go there, it's like you, you still got that school mindset in a way - that and then you don't realize it until something clicks and, and I think for the majority of people it won't click the value of what you're doing so, perhaps, the majority of the 90% of people in the survey thought, like myself at the start of this talk have done, they just don't realize it and they don't realize Oh wow, I’ve actually learned how to be more professional and how to carry myself - and that's another skill, which I came to University from like a working class background and everyone's really friendly but that might not necessarily be how to carry yourself in a professional manner as well. I had to learn a lot of skills, in that sense. Yeah, so I think it's a case of how can we show people that, that we're showing them more than just how to pass an exam at University.

Adam: I mean, I think, I agree with a lot of what Ella said, um, from a young age, I think, especially in the UK students are pushed to just succeed at exams.That being the primary focus, if…, I remember I’ve been told in an assembly hall once: you do well in your GCSEs, you're going to get a really nice car, you’re going to get a really nice house. Your life opportunities are so much better and if you don't, they used to threaten us and say that you wouldn't get any of those. And your job wouldn’t be stable, your income wouldn’t be stable, there'd be no opportunity for you, that's it! you're doomed if your GCSEs are bad. And I think that instilling that, that instilling that perspective into kids I don't think is something that works, is realistic either. And a lot of the time, I find that people are kind of moved away from enterprise education or, or are not given the confidence or not given the encouragement. I know myself, personally, I know quite a few younger people than myself, who actually took opportunities upon themselves as well, um, and I remember, there was, there was one that stood outside of petrol station, and it was, um, the air freshener that you have in cars, he was selling that and he was only a student himself. I think nine or something in secondary school. And a lot of people, a lot of people actually bought these products off him and he was showing consistent profits but the schools weren't accepting that he was going out of his way after school - they thought it gave a bad image on the school for him to be doing such a thing. I think that's not and I know and, in addition to that, I know plenty of people, who have, for instance, bought a lot of sweets, like a bulk amount of sweets or bulk amount of fizzy pop drinks, things that really appeal to kids in schools, knowing that they can make money off that and then reinvest that back in. Um, and it was quite a small-scale thing - it was really good, though, I like seeing that myself when I saw peers do that. But the school was against that, the school was like No, this is not what you come to school for Why are you doing this? And there was no bad intention behind it, these students were simply spotting opportunities, where they knew that other students may be in their commute to school, or pass a sweet shop or pass a drink shop. And they can sell for them, knowing that there's demand for it and, that that person will pay double or triple the price of what they've paid. But the school was all against that; the school was like, No, it's not why you come to school for, there will be repercussions, a detention of some sort, some punishment. I don't think it should be punished, personally, I don't think so, if you’re talented students, if you're giving that already to them, that…if you're given that discouragement to them, to them already, how are they going to follow on that? They may, if they've really got that entrepreneurial mindset in the future, now act on it, however, if you rather were to encourage them and think that oh that's a good thing, if it's in a controlled manner, and it's being more sweets or face masks or drinks. And then yeah! if there's nothing wrong with it, in my opinion, if people are willing to pay for as long as there's no cheating going on, or unfair, I don't know. Or unfair business practices going on, if the student is simply doing it to make a sustainable income out of it and thinking that okay. It is going to help them with, their behaviour mindset and they may have that confidence and be pushed in the future to start a bigger business with a wider scale, um. As I mentioned, I don't think simply telling kids that, oh, getting a great education and passing some tests is going to ensure success. I think, for some people, maybe they don't prefer test, maybe they don't prefer sitting down for hours and revising and they’re more creative, they they're just more willing to go to the end, I mean just invest and see where things go even if I know some people who have failed on their second or third businesses but they still come back on a forth. Maybe start a new clothing line and it actually works for them in the end, so they play around with the kind of the conditions and circumstances they're in. And a lot of the time I see great, greatest successes coming out of these people who had it from a young age, but I mean, as I said: discouraging it doesn't do anyone any good, I think, and if someone's doing something, and they’re minding their own business and they're just doing it for themselves and they're enjoying as well, they're not doing it, a lot of them aren't doing it, a lot of them actually that did have these business mindsets came from quite well-off families, and so, I mean if there's no kind of concerns about wellbeing either. I would happily support that myself as well.

Mircea Scrob: All right, I feel, for you, for both of you for what you were, for what you were saying about your experiences of school. Can I say, can I ask: did it change at University, do you feel that University became a little bit freer in the sense that you didn't have this kind of patterned things: you go to lectures, you have exams, you go to lectures, have exams, but you can actually have something that is with real impact into the real world and people can, people with different learning preferences can thrive at the University?

**Question: In comparison to school, at university do you feel you have had more freedom and you can engage with something that has real world impact?**

Ella: I think it's hard because say we've been at school, which is supposed… If you think of like your education and your life is like a tree, school is supposed to give you the roots, so that you can grow into something a lot bigger and find your own way and become unique but school tries to push people into a box, I think, um, because, um, say, you’re more taught: oh, you need to write in a certain way to get the marks, you need to you need to think what does the examiner want you to write? When rather they don't teach you that, no, we're just trying to help you understand an academic way of writing so that you put your point across in the best way. So, you don't think you’re learning a skill - you sort of resent what you've been told you have to do and, and then you don't understand why and what you’re learning so, yeah, so I feel like because I felt like I was just factory calling an exam and I have to write it down in Mr Smith's way, how they wanted me to write it down or something like that, and then I got to University and you think it's the same. Going to lectures and you, and you don't realize, because you haven't been prepared from a younger age to notice, there's so many there's so much more opportunities that you end up going to a lecture thinking it’s a class, revising as if it's a class and then whereas the lecturer wants to actually see your unique opinion when you do a piece of course work and you think, no, there's, there's a mark scheme. And then, when you don't get a good grade and you go to the lecturer, so why didn't I get a good grade? Is because you don't trust yourself to just go for it, and actually do your own research. So it's almost, it is it something that University has to get across to people that it's different or the schools need to change to prepare you better, don’t know, probably a bit of both, maybe. Yeah!

Adam: No, I think, university actually was different from school for me. I agree with Ella on taking lectures, taking classes and whatever, however, my course specifically, a lot of the modules that were taught were really related to enterprise, I think, some were directly related to enterprise and they were quite…informative, really helped me further my understanding of the world of business works, how start-ups manage themselves, and I think also, I do commend the University because…I mean, whatever said and done, they have offered quite a lot in terms of support for people starting up: I think there was a £500 bursary or something for people willing to start their own business. That I think, um, that, I think, really just something that… there's something that, that is quite amazing, that is quite something that takes me aback I think because, it shows the University has an interest. If they see that if the University themselves have been, part of the criteria was showing the University what the business was and how you would expect to yield profit, for them to understand whether it's viable to give you that £500. So I think that's really good, I think that's encouraging a lot of people to come up with their ideas, approach the University to say, okay we've got these ideas, and we think that we can make it into an actionable business. When in the long term we see profits and there's a demand for it, we've noticed the gap in the market and the university rewards that by giving this money. And I think, I think the university is doing a great job. Because I mean that emails come to me, probably quite a few times now. And, and they offered instead of like, Okay, if you have a business idea… and I don't think it's just for business students, I think they've offered that to every student, is like a bursary or something. They've said, if you have that, if you have an idea, and you think it's strong enough, please approach us, we will have a meeting, and we can offer you the support. And, aside from the £500, there's more mentoring support as well, and for these students, so I think that's great, I think the university is recognizing that, aside from getting a degree, getting that piece of paper, which of course is valuable and what we're all here for, they understand also that there's things that you can do on the side, maybe, that maybe could become your focus in future, but let's go give it a try. Okay if it fails, the University's not going to go punish you for that; they're just going to say Okay, we thought it was viable, but maybe just because you can never know the successful business and toys out there. So, even the University may get it wrong, however I’m glad that they're willing to take the risk as well. And in turn that just support all the students: they feel positive, they feel encouraged and I know quite a few students who’ve made quite good businesses, with the support of the University so...Um, I think the University providing enterprise education, I think, does it quite well, I think…if you're, if you're, if you're just going to come to the University just for lectures whatever, you may not see it, it may not be obvious to you, however, I have heard of certain little courses they do on the side, little modules, meetings, where they go through this and if you're interested then I’m sure there's different things you can do some – I think they all class as extracurricular, though. But in my course as a business management student, we were taught a lot about this. Risk taking, is a must element; opportunities - there's so much that goes into it, there's so many theories there's so many concepts, that does really help you. And then, when you wish to apply that, if you were to start your business, I think that all comes in to use, that knowledge, that knowledge isn't in vain, what you've been taught. Will really come into, into some form of use, once you do start this business, so I think, yeah, University did push to a certain degree, enterprise education, the competencies...

Mircea Scrob: Alright, Adam, if I can just follow up on this one. The one, the bursary, I think that you were mentioning is the B-enterprising scheme with the £500, and there is the Start-up society, and there are, there are good opportunities that are done by the Careers Network about this, but you were saying that, there is the extracurricular and the curricular one. In the curricular, you get the knowledge about risk taking, and about how to make a business and about everything else, but did you have this kind of modules that we were discussing, this kind of entrepreneurship education that is more… experiential and it goes back to your experience from sixth form in which you are, you are given a sort of a business task, and you are told, okay, develop everything around it, to see whether it is profitable, do this kind of market sizing, do a little bit of understanding, whether there is traction for it; was there anything provided in the in the business curriculum, in the business curricula, or in the curriculum of the Business School about this?

**Question: Are there experiential entrepreneurship education opportunities within the Business curriculum?**

Adam: Yeah, we had a, in the first year, we had a whole module dedicated to it: it was called organization and management of entrepreneurship, and I think all their skills listed and that really supported what has been shown on the screen right now and, and I think, it was quite thorough - the whole, the whole module was about entrepreneurship, essentially, and the management of businesses and their organization. And, personally, I think it was, it was very broad in terms of, it encompassed quite a lot in terms of the world of business, it wasn't focusing…Because my other modules they focus on a specific element of business: okay, economics finance, HR things like this, that are very niche, very specific, that comprise one module. This one really kind of took a wider view, a wider holistic view. We were given examples of businesses, different types of businesses, it could have been sole traders, it could have been public limited companies, private limited companies, partnerships - there was different, there was a range of things that were given to us and we were just, we just got our knowledge completely enhanced by what was given to us, through the materials. And yeah, we were given graphs, we were given proper demonstrations, and in terms of the different aspects of it we were shown, okay: and so, in terms of the finance of a business, we were shown like, okay, there was a graph showing that there's quite a dip initially because of the outflow, your expenditure and the cost and whatever. However, after doing this, after marketing a certain way, after generating enough attention, after sort of making, making a viable product that will sell, this is what's going to happen to your cash flow, and this is the…It was more of an estimate, it wasn't obviously the facts and figures, we were just going through a theoretical model. But it was showing that right, okay: if you do this, if you do this one way, if you work with the variables, if the financial climate is this, if your demographics are this, we were told, we were told of the different variables that affect the success of a business - I think, in that module that was really useful.

Mircea Scrob: Alright, thanks very much and that sounds really, really interesting. All right, thank you very much for sharing all of these thoughts. Let’s…I think now I went a little bit off of the discussion guide, so I have to see…yeah, I think we already covered these. So rather let's move to the interesting bit, to the final part of the, of the focus group, and these are some of the…educational opportunities that we would like to present with you and just ask you about some of your thoughts on some of these kinds of offerings: whether you would want to do them? What do you think is good about them? what do you think it's a drawback about them? and what do you think can be done in order to improve them?

**Question: Which of these examples of entrepreneurial education opportunities are more attractive and which are less attractive and why, and does anything about the ways in which they are communicated make them more or less appealing?**

So very quickly: these are the things that I have just said, so we can skip onto these slides - let's look at the first one, which is a standalone module, and this is an offering that is coming from entrepreneurship education. And again: this is modelled on something that is actually offered the University of Birmingham. These are Final Year modules called Entrepreneurial Start-up and the concept of it is that students work in groups to come up with an innovative, digital start-up, that is, taking…going through all stages from ideation up to pitching to a panel of industry experts and designing a line of products or services; the assessments are very much authentic in the sense that it is required: the business pitch, in front of a panel of industry experts; and there is a business, business plan - this is the kind of documents that you usually are required to produce, if you want to, um, to create a business; and there are mock job interviews, these are the kind of stand-ins for the usual reflective process in which the students are helped to systematize the learning on the module and easily retrieve it if they are ever asked, in an interview about, talking about one time that there was tension in a group. The problems are coming out of local areas, so these are problems that are provided by the Birmingham City Council: it has to do anything with housing, with improving the mental health or the physical health of people, with increasing socialization of the people; so it's usually it has this kind of social component, but again, the business side of it is paramount, because business will be required to provide, to get a profit. And again, also, all stages of the business cycle are covered: so you can do design thinking strategies for finding out what are some of the pain points of our users. Then you go into optimization - this is using business model canvas, that is: thinking about all of the configurations of your business in such a way that you can produce a profit at the end of year three. You are looking at intellectual property and patenting - that is about whether you need anything to copyright, trademark or patent. There is also rapid prototyping involved, you can use 3D printing if you have a physical product or you can use a mock-up for an app or a website, if it is a software. And you can engage also with digital marketing - that is having a sort of website - very basic of it, no coding required just using some of the third platform software's - that you can engage a little bit with the digital presence; and again, you get presentation skills with pitching very, being very different because you have to be very to the point and crisp in the way that you present your business. So what do you think about this kind of offerings? Would you take this kind of module if it was presented to you?

Ella: It sounds really wonderful – like, at first, I thought Oh, perhaps it doesn't apply to me so much because…my degrees based around the health sector, but then the problems like case studies, that you provided I think it could be really applicable to most degrees, so I think it provides a really great…just opportunity to learn different aspects and different skills and different ways of thinking, which is the hardest thing to show people. Um, but I think the…I don't know whether it would be better to let students, perhaps, pick their own group, because in, like…I know, when you’re put into a group with random people it's good, because you have to learn to work with different people, but I guess in reality you wouldn't be doing a start up with, with people you wouldn't want to work with as well. And, and people have got to be able to really love what they're doing and love the people who they're working with to create the best thing they possibly can, and that's, I think that’s would be great for students at the uni. Again, like I think it's just a way of presenting it to students to, in a way, to show them everything that, that it's not just an assignment, this is…this is so applicable to the real world and making it clear, this is nothing like what you've done before at school - we’re asking you to do something completely different and respecting you as individuals. We, you're, you're like going into the future now and we want to know what you have to offer and, yeah, just a way of presenting it would be the key one for this, because it's so, it's so valuable this type of module; I just hate it to be wasted in the way that quite a lot of our assignments have been wasted. And, yeah, perhaps choosing your own group might make - I picked a module this year because I could choose my own group (chuckles) - it is a module where we had to create, um, the training program for like a GB athlete so it was, um, yeah - those are perhaps the two things that would make it really successful. I guess.

Mircea Scrob: So it is… it is concerned with group work, with the group dynamics, right? And it's better to be able to opt in, which is not the case with this particular module - in this particular module, people are randomly allocated to their groups, but it is important to know that this is something that can…That can cause stress – and it does quite cause stress. And the other one is about framing it as being relevant to the disciplines that you are studying, so in this case, in this case with sports exercise, maybe billing it as…an opportunity to create a sports equipment or a training program or some application of artificial intelligence to understand what is the best way…that people can, that athletes can train and still frame it as a business, because you do need patenting, you need to do copyright, you do need ideation for it - so grounded a little bit more into the discipline would help?

Ella: Definitely. Because especially at a lot of our degree, because I think Loughborough is more athlete based, our University’s is more health based – so focuses on the aging population, because that seems to be the major growing issue at the moment with, like, neurological disease is on the rise, and, you know, severe muscle loss in older ages in and, and tackling issues like that seems so relevant and it's really eye opening, so perhaps approaching it from a different health perspective to athletes as well - just really shows you the potential of your degree, because people think of sports science as athletes and PE teachers so it just shows you just how powerful the degree can be, and the ways you can take it. Yeah!

Mircea Scrob: Alright! That sounds really good and it's, it's really good clarification as well because, yes, you have a certain understanding of sports exercise and one of the, one of the groups on the model did do wearable tech for the elderly, and it was specifically designed to, to deal with…with, with chronic diseases that come with old age, and that was something that was, was really well received. Alright, thank you! Adam, what do you think, I think, what do you think about this kind of offering?

Adam: I think it's a great opportunity in of itself and really like the way their assessments are. I mean, how the modules are marked I think that's really great because essentially there's no sort of essay, there's no sort of, you know, it's different, it's completely different, and it allows students to be an opportunity to replicate…is the closest you can get to the real thing, if they were to make the start-up. For myself, I probably wouldn't take it just because I’m not really that great or, I guess, digital side is not my strong suit. With AutoCAD and stuff like this, I just, I don't think I’ve been trained well enough in it to be confident enough to make it a module for my university, for my university course, upon which a grade is going to be, from which I need a grade for, essentially, because, yeah, because I’m just a bit weak on that side, I guess, but I think for anyone who does have knowledge of the IT, the digital side of things. I think it really is a great opportunity - I don't see why they'd be discouraged from picking it as an option, I think the way the assessments are, as I mentioned, I think…I mean that's pretty much the closest you can get to the real thing, so if that was to be put into, so put into, um, into an option for students, I think people will pick it; just not myself, because, as I mentioned, I’m not strong as, I as, I’m not that strong at IT and digital solution, digital aspects of things.

Mircea Scrob: Thank you - that's, that's a very interesting perspective, because we are running this, this module with students who do not have a background in business. And I think what is the two main barriers that people are see, are seeing is, as Ella was saying, that it is group work and you always wonder, well, groups can, group work can go either very well or it can go terrible, and when it goes terrible it's really terrible. Or the other one is the fact that people do not feel confident enough to take it, because they say, well, it's about business, it's about all sorts of things and am I, am I well equipped to do this kind of module, and always it has to be done, the kind of pre-empting by saying that it is very basic - it doesn't assume any knowledge and the module is an opportunity to learn, but these are the two barriers that usually come to mind. So yes, it is, it is interesting to see the kind of, the kind of barriers that are usually seen, that are usually seen with this kind of offerings. Thank you! Let's have another look at another option, and this one is different because it is contextualized, so it is a case of enterprise education that is contextualized within the discipline. That means that there isn't necessarily a business focus, but rather the busi… the discipline is paramount and it grows very much on disciplinary knowledge. So this is an example of a consultancy module - usually this kind of modules have an external partner, they set up a problem. And it's also someone that guides the learning process and helps with the learning process as such. So this is an example, please do not be bothered by the fact that it comes from a specific discipline - try to understand what is the usual framework for it and blueprint and see whether this is something that could be interesting for you. So this came from the College of Arts and Law, it was a second year professional research skills for linguists, and it was a collaboration with West Midlands police. Effectively, West Midlands police wanted to recruit more BAME candidates for their job posts, and they were struggling doing this. So they reached out to the people doing linguistics and they tasked them with coming out… with coming up with a recruitment method that would be more effective at attracting BAME candidates, so the linguist… the students studying linguistics had to think about ideation, had to think about Okay, what is the recruitment going to look like?; they had to think about Problem Solving - really understand what are some of the barriers and enablers for… the for people from certain communities to join the force; and they had to come to apply the linguistic data by framing, umm, recruitment advertisement that would resonate with the target audience.

So again, what is the crucial bit here is that it is very much problem solved, it is very much again looking to the real world. And there is a stakeholder involved, which can set up a project; again, in the case of sports science, it can be anything from: a charity organization or professional body setting up a problem or if it is a business, again, it can be a start-up that has a particular problem that it wants to solve and it tasks the students with doing so. Or it could be a corporation that wants to do similar recruitment processes or want to solve a problem, enter a new market and they task the students with doing this. And then you can bring in your discipline from either sports science of from business in applying it to a more real-world problem. So what do you think about this kind of modules? Would you do something like this if what, if it were offered to you?

Ella: Sounds really cool, actually. Just, just quickly on the last one, um, just before I say something about this one. But just about how, say, for people who like you said, Adam, that you weren't so confident in the digital side - I think that might be really adding to the value of if you were to choose your own group, perhaps you've got a really good idea, you don't know how to make it happen but you've got a friend that does have an interest in digital… and then you create your own team and then your team of passionate individuals that are really driven and you end up not only getting a good grade but getting a really good experience out of it. And that might persuade more people to be more confident as well. But, yeah, about this one yeah this is really cool because it's, it's actually a real-life problem something like West Midlands police like wow, this is a big organization and they're actually providing us with this issue, and they, they believe in us to solve it. Again, we need to get that across to people: this, this is real, this is something they're actually facing and perhaps a way to get that across to people, I don’t know, say that the top, the people who get top five they could actually say we will present these propositions to the organization and then it will make people think: you know what, this is real, this is more than just an assignment and they'll find the inspiration in it, then. Yeah, that's just an idea, I guess.

Mircea Scrob: Alright! Thank you very much.

Adam: yeah I think it's, I think it's really good…I think, um, I have a result as well if done successfully, which is obviously achieving what West Midlands police wants to have, where we reach out to this different members of the BAME community - I think it's quite useful because you'd be using, you'd be kind of (inaudible) benefiting of the knowledge of these people who take up this module and, yeah, make something actionable out of it. In possibly a way that the West Midlands police themselves can't do because, of course, these people have been studying at university: they've got the experience, they've got the knowledge they've got the right foundation, so I think…I think it's a win, win for both parties involved, really, and personally if I was someone in studying some module related to this, I would take it on as an opportunity. I think it's a really good cause, of course, we want a more diverse force and so I’d be more than happy to obviously assist in that, yeah.

**Question: What are the barriers or challenges to engaging with these kinds of entrepreneurial education opportunities, if there are any?**

Mircea Scrob: All right, brilliant, can I just ask about, about the barriers that you could, you could see with this kind of modules: what do you think is going to be some of the challenges with this kind of modules? Or some things that might be off putting? Anything at all…

Adam: If that person, if the said person in the second year has taken more modules - two or three more modules as well as this. It may just be that they might have to put more effort into this module, just because this is real life, and there is a… there is a result that they need to provide. Maybe West, West Midlands police are interested in what they've got and it just requires more effort and time than it would for any other module where maybe just simply, just doing any ordinary piece of course work or just any ordinary exam. This may be something that they have to go out for, meet with different people for, take time off their day – it’s essentially became their hobby I guess as well, maybe, actually are invested in it, but nonetheless it will require significant amount of dedication to get it right, you're going to have to do a lot more research, it's real, it's real life, a lot of times you can get secondary research. However, in this, it probably will be primary in that, okay, what are the statistics, what are the figures? how you're going to go about attracting more people? So I think, it’d just be the time and effort that, if those constraints aren't there, though, I think it's a great module nonetheless.

Ella: Yeah and, and also that, because it is like a real, serious issue with it the West Midlands police, they need to make it clear that this isn't some made-up case study and, you know, because otherwise students will just think: oh, they made a case-study that they've used like a really, like a sensitive subject, which is a real issue in today's society, so it might, it might actually seem if, if they don't realize, we could actually make a change here, they just think oh, this is a really heavy topic to put on an assignment that we're going to be judged on and because most people just think, oh I’m just being judged on this assignment and I’m going to get a good grade or a bad grade, so I think just really to make it clear, you can make a difference here and, then, that could that, that would hopefully reduce some of the barriers as well, so.

Mircea Scrob: Yeah, perfectly understandable, you did say Ella, also, that you had this experience with an external, with an external organization and you left it at they didn't do much work at the end, do you think that this is, this is a risk or this could be off-putting having external partners, and one of them being daunting to think, oh we have to go and talk to the West Midlands police. Are we qualified to do that, first of all? and there is this the idea of well, we rely on external partners, will we get enough support that we would need because we are still university students?

Ella: Yeah, I think that's, again, it's just a way of presenting it - if it's presented in a way that West Midlands police have come to us, they want to see our opinion and hopefully, because I’ve come to the end of my degree now, and I feel like it's almost like imposter syndrome and don't believe that you sort of qualified to have opinions on certain things in your field, even though you've been studying it for three years, so it's almost just key way of presenting it that, yes, they want to know your opinion and you're just basing your opinion on facts and it's okay to say that you're not too sure. And just giving people, actual student themselves to go out there and do that thing. And I think the assignment that you're referring to was, I think, what I meant was it was a pair assignment - so I worked with another student and she didn't do, yeah, it was like the night before, and she hadn't done her section at all so I was, ahhh! up till three o'clock in the morning doing that. Yes, it wasn't with, we haven't worked with any external… companies…I think you could choose to, if your research project if you wanted to, but I didn't want to, yeah.

Mircea Scrob: Makes sense, makes sense. Any other thoughts on any of these kinds of offerings or anything at all? Alright, if not let's look at the final option. And this is something, well, I forgot to present the assessment: this was a 50% group employer report with findings to research, and 50% individual digital presentation. But this ties in very much with the next topic which is the authentic assessments one, because those, those things were very authentic as well, you had to present a report to the police, that they can act upon. So the idea with authentic assessment is, that you can leave the modules as they are in most of the cases, they are very good in terms of the content and in terms of the knowledge that they are producing. What you can, you can add is a certain real-life element in terms of the assessments and because you have an assessment that is relevant for the world out there, the learning continues also during the assessment, because you have, you learn the conventions about how to write the report for one of the stakeholders, or a business plan going forward. And I will not ask you to read all of this information from, for this module – suffice it to say that it is, again, a module from the Arts and Law College, it was a second year, Global Enterprise project and in it, they had a stakeholder - the Department for International Trade -, they had to advise certain businesses about how to increase their exports to a certain culture. So what they had to produce is a White Paper report and consultancy about how they could actually do that; and again it tapped very much into the teaching that was done, because you had to understand the values and the culture that you are planning to export to, you had to understand the language, you had to understand what is the…You had to read documents that show you what is the market size in that particular country, but what is really important is…that the White Paper has been added on that; is again a document that is very much used in this kind of government advice about how to increase exports for a certain country. Now I realize that this might be a very specific case study, but if you can think of how authentic assessments as anything from these kinds of examples to, for instance: having one of the assignments on a science module [being] writing a blog post in which it will explain to a popular, to someone, to the lay public a very difficult concept from the science; again this is looking forward to the science communication bit or it could be…for instance, if you're studying film studies, curating a film exhibition: having everything like what are the entries that are going to be shown in a film festival, and how you are going to advertise it because, again, this is closer to the real world of work; so the authentic assessments can be something that can be slotted in into traditional modules, but it gives this kind of outward looking focus on real world applications.

**Question: Does this example of an educational experience involving authentic assessments appeal to you, and what are some of the barriers with this kind of offering?**

Ella: For me this is quite intimidating this one, but I think if it was really applied to my subject, it would probably again be quite cool to do. Yeah it seems it's really applied so…Um, it's a bit different because you're again, it's almost like…you have less freedom – you’re more like trying to explain to someone based on the facts of the real world, so I guess it would help you learn more about the real world and the best way to do things, but…I suppose it's less about coming up with your own idea, whereas the other one you're coming up with a start-up plan. And, I’m trying to remember the second one, completely now but… slipped my mind, but this one seems more and more niche. So, yeah. So I would prefer the other ones myself.

Adam: Personally, so, I think I would take this module on. Because I’m quite a lot of it I’m looking at is related to stuff that I’ve done before: Economics. My knowledge of Economics, probably would help most here. And, and yeah it looks quite interesting - the different things that would have to, um, gain understanding of, so I mean it is quite interesting yeah, I definitely quite enjoy the like so, like the kind of overall topics that've been discussed, and I think it would be something that I would put a lot of time and effort into just because of my interest in this area.

**Question: If you were given the freedom to design your own entrepreneurial education activity in a way that you felt would be appealing to both you and others, and how might it be most effectively communicated?**

Mircea Scrob: Alright, thanks, very much thanks, very much for all of these perspectives - one question last, and this is about engaging in… in a little bit of co-creation of educational opportunities: if you were to be asked to create an enterprise education opportunity that appeals to many undergraduate students as possible, what kinds of activities, how would you envision this kind of module, a module that would be linked to the real world practice - that will deliver on all the kind of good experiences that you were talking about, on all the kind of skills that you would like to have at graduation? How do you think: what, what, how, how would it look like, and you can take a couple of minutes, just to think two minutes, let's say, just to think about it. How would that module look like in terms of its basic features? in terms of what content will be delivered? what skills will be will be addressed? and what kind of assessments would you prefer to have on it? that you think it would be really valuable for you as an undergraduate student.

Adam: I think the template, personally, of the second module you showed was the most…I think would be potentially the most successful and just in my perspective, the one with the police. I think that that one would enable students actually go out and challenge themselves these competencies: problem-solving will be a massive one because there is, of course, a problem there. And then the other one falls into line as well. So, I think a module where it's more immersive and there's really a practical implication of what you're doing. Um, I think that kind of module will push students the most if you were to offer that to them, rather than a module that maybe is…like the third one whilst I said I was interested in it, a lot of students may just think: oh, it's just simply another module. That, in addition to what we normally do where we just have to find out, gain an understanding of something and then essentially, just describe our findings to the lecturer in the form of an essay; I think the second one, however, would be the most, one that's more popular. And the most engaging and would require students to kind of think beyond just the normal content, normal textbook responses or sort of… is beyond like I said at the start of this focus group, I said that essentially providing students with textbooks and then asking them to learn from that. It isn't the best way, in my opinion, to impart enterprise education. I think this that second opportunity you gave is a great [inaudible] to that in that…now there's something that they can really…. that they can make an impact, where they can contribute and make an impact. I think that's the best way, that's always the best way of imparting enterprise education, where that’s actually something, there's a degree of influence at the end upon how they find, how they make their findings, it could influence someone's life. In this case, providing more people, connecting the two communities, the BAME community and the police. And I think something like that of that nature, it doesn't exactly have to be the police case, it could be any other organization: charitable organization, corporate organization; anything of that sort, but giving students the opportunity to tackle something…that's actually occurring in real time while they're describing, right, okay, and get some findings that [inaudible] enterprise education, from textbooks or journal articles, I think the form was more, um…the form was better in terms of simply just giving enterprise education, allowing them to challenge their competencies. And, and understand what's needed - as I mentioned at the start, also if they were to fall short of success in that opportunity, specifically. Well, I wouldn't see that as failure - I’d see that as a learning curve whereby the next time they would understand what we did there, maybe there are things that we did wrong, that maybe we shouldn’t do next time, and what…. they would be able to highlight the positive results, when they take the next one, which may be outside of university, there's more chances of them succeeding than not, than there were had they not taken that module.

Ella: Yeah, I really agree with everything you just said, then, it's yeah, especially, but for me, actually, I think a combination of the first and second one would be really cool. So, if you involve a real-life company with a real-life problem into the first one, and then you're asked: what would you do about this problem? Because I guess, the West Midlands police one had something they wanted students to do, to find out, it was a really important issue - I really liked the first one, because you can: well what would you do about this issue? Instead of we want you to do this and tell us what you found. Yeah, it was, and I really liked the assessment and the way there was a wide variety and, and it was really related to the way you would almost have to go about it in real life - quite like that. So yeah and, and I think with that real life aspect, it would really provide motivation for people to go forward as a group, especially if we provide that opportunity at the end where, so, for me when I presented my poster at poster day, I was really nervous when I had to present to my assessor but then I stayed there for the rest of the poster session. And I love talking about my research to everybody else, because I knew they weren't judging me - this is something that I’m really proud of, so because I’m not going to get a grade for it, whereas the grade affects whether I pass university at the end. Yeah, so perhaps if they did the assessment and then had that opportunity to be selected to show like, their opinion on what they would do at the end to the company, then it would just give them so much more confidence in themselves and perhaps lead them down a path, or career path that they might not have had the confidence to do otherwise.

**Question: With regard to in-curricular entrepreneurial education opportunities, does real world impact matter to you?**

Mircea Scrob: This is really interesting, thank you, can I just ask one final thing: is it important if it will have… a finality? Let's say with this kind of modules in which you are presented with a problem, that you go back to the stakeholder and you offer them a solution, and that is acted upon? or can it stop with, okay, this is the problem, you come up with a solution, but it's not necessarily that it will have an effect into the real world?

Adam: No, no, I think the first option is better where there's a stakeholder that actually hears them out. Um, just because then their efforts are recognized, then they can actually see how that works practically, maybe that stakeholder can give them some advice, on how they did or how they think that that fits with their business objectives. And based on that sort of recommendation of how to now do it again, they can understand why, Okay, if we were to replicate that and do it again with a different company, a different organization, or maybe our own. They can work with an educated stakeholder who can tell them, right, okay, and what maybe you did last time, there were certain elements that probably weren't needed and certain elements that were right, okay, you can increase your focus on; give more attention to, and then, as I said before, so practice makes perfect in that they've tried it before, they've seen the results, the stakeholders actually calculated how they've done in terms of had their success, and now they can go ahead and do that, independently, the next time, um, with that advice and hopefully…hopefully, solve, get a better result, get a better outcome than had they not received that advice - I mean if you're going to tell students, do all that effort: if you can get the stakeholder engagement, then I think that's a positive for everyone.

Ella: yeah, totally agree, yeah. So, if you were to put it forward to the stakeholder and they, they can say, yeah, we're going to do it, or they could say Oh, we like this bit, but we can't do this bit, because of this real-life situation which you might not thought of, and, and it and yeah, so it's like the students are being heard and it's more than just assignments; yeah, it's great, and it teaches you to reflect as well. On what you've done - like if it's not being chosen, Oh, why, what perhaps didn't you think of that you can think of now? And in the future as well.

**Closing:**

Mircea Scrob: Thank you very much, both. This was really, really insightful so thank you, thank you for giving so freely your time, you will get a debriefing communication at the end of it. And, yes, also the Amazon voucher so thank you very much for, for taking the time to be here today and for sharing your thoughts. If you need to get in touch, you will have the debriefing email as well, but here is my email address as well, so yeah, take it easy! And do enjoy the time now that assessments are done, and again, thank you very much.

# Student focus group 5: University of Birmingham students

**Introductory section:**

Mircea Scrob: Staying on this call will be confirmation that you are fine with that, and please do not worry if you're put on the… on the spot now with making the decision about withdrawing from the study. You can still do this after the focus group is done: you're going to get the debriefing… information about how this is this is possible to be done, and you can still withdraw from the study and have everything deleted from this focus group up to the point, in which we anonymize the data - after that point, it will no longer be possible, because it will be impossible to link responses that you have given to, um, the data from the transcript. All right! I think this was much faster than I thought about, with the introductions, if I have missed something I will come back to it later. But up till now, I would just want to ask whether you have any questions, any concerns? whether you want to ask anything about the focus group today? Or about the research more generally?

Lea: I don't have any questions.

Amal: Me neither, I’m good to go.

Mircea Scrob: All right, good! Shall we start, then? Let's go! So, then - again this focus group is going to be on your attitudes, practices, and experience with entrepreneurial education. And, to start with, or rather - let's do some introduction; apologies for that - I got a little bit ahead of myself, because I already introduced myself. So let's do a little bit of introductions: if you can please say your preferred name, the department in which you are affiliated and your year of study; that would be fantastic. And I might as well start, so my name is Mircea and I am a Lecturer in the Liberal Arts and Natural Sciences program and, as I have said, I am teaching here on Research Methods module and modules that deal with entrepreneurship. Who would like to go next?

Lea: and

Amal: Go ahead, Lea.

Lea: No, it’s okay.

Amal: Oh hi! I’m Amal. I’m a fifth year Chemical Engineering student and… I haven't had much experience with entrepreneurship so it's gonna be an interesting experience.

Mircea Scrob: All right, good! Fifth year, is it final year?

Amal: Oh, yeah, basically I’m, I have graduated, but I still have my Uni email, and my graduation is in like a week. So I’m still a student.

Mircea Scrob: Congratulations! That must be exciting times.

Amal: Thank you very much, yes, it's exciting to be graduating but it's also a bit scary that now [inaudible]

Mircea Scrob: I know, I know it is a difficult one, with changing from being a student to whatever is out there, afterwards, so yeah but still congratulations! enjoy this moment.

Amal: Thank you so much!

Lea: Hi! My name is Lea. I’ve actually just finished my first year, so… Yeah, first year of Law. Um, yeah, just college of Law.

Amal: Okay, do you know [name] by any chance?

Lea: I really wish I did. But there's like 500-700 of us, so… in just one year… so I don’t know most people

Amal: Was it, did you…? Because I know that this year was kind of hybrid, how was Law for you?

Lea: Um, ours was all in person, which is probably the best thing, cuz I’m not a big fan of online learning.

Amal: I totally agree with that.

Mircea Scrob: Makes sense, and I think law, law was quite, quite a large one this year but still, first year! Then enjoy the journey and is it on a three-year degree or four-year degree with the year abroad?

Lea: Um, well I don't know if I’m going to do a year abroad just yet - I mean I can, if I wanted to, because the, I think it's like if you get to, above a 2:1 then you're fine you can do it, but I don't know yet but for now it’s three years.

Amal: If I was you, I totally go abroad, just because this is the, this is probably the cheapest way you could go abroad and just have some fun. So if I was you….

Amal: Yeah, honestly! I mean obviously there's tuition fees and stuff and I don't know how it works for home students but like that's, this is probably the safest way you're gonna move to a new country because you have a way to make friends, and you have a way to meet new people; so if I was you, just go on the year abroad.

Mircea Scrob: Yeah, look at tuition fees - I’m also the study abroad tutor in LANS [Liberal Arts and Natural Sciences]. And there are interesting ways about it because there are some deductions, to the, to the tuition fees. But anyhow, all good… doing… the remaining of the years and hopefully, it was a good first year here at the university and, yes, we have come back to something that is more resembling normal time since before the pandemic because last year was, was really, really difficult.

**Question: Have you engaged in any way within enterprise and entrepreneurship opportunities, either within your studies in through extracurricular activities?**

All right, so you have already touched upon this by saying that you may or may not have experience with Enterprise and Entrepreneurship and before we go into any definitions we would just like to put this question to you now. Just to see what, according, what, to your understanding, whether you have engaged within enterprise and entrepreneurship opportunities. You may remember this question from the survey as well, your answer might have changed in the meantime, but just please if you can say now whether you think you have engaged in any way within enterprise and entrepreneurship opportunities, it could be either one of them, or both.

Lea: Um, I haven’t….Not that I can think of. I mean I feel like if, if I had engaged it would be more like me starting up a business like we talked about before the recording. I have not started a business… I feel like it's something I will engage in just because, as a law student, like if you do want to…Um, in the future, like start up your own firm, that is something I would definitely end up engaging, but I have not engaged in anything, not that I can think of at least, right now.

Mircea Scrob: Alright, sounds good, thank you!

Amal: Um, in terms of just my experiences at uni… while, I’m sorry, I may have missed out on the definitions of enterprise and entrepreneurship, but I know that, like, at uni in the first year there was something called the Birmingham project. And while it isn't, you know, starting up and running your own company from scratch in, in, in concept theoretically does that, where you come up with a business plan and distribution plan and you work with key stakeholders - so that's something I’ve engaged in. Um, the thing is, because entrepreneurship or enterprise-s-e. Those words! Are, aren't necessarily, you know, ingrained into my like main course work. Because I’m an international student and it's really difficult to, a lot of time to things that are not education, and that don't show up on a mark script. Um, the more, the most, that, I’ve seen more opportunities at Uni – where, you know, there’s things, like, Enactus, where you, you take it one step forward, and you, you actually do run your business. And I have interacted with those kind of societies. I’m just on like an individual kind of basis, not that I do this like properly or not that I do this, um, like formally but, um, I do kind of do just like, um, portraits of people, like digital art portraits of people if they asked me to, and like it's usually as a favour [inaudible] so I don't know if that counts as entrepreneurship, but that's my experience with it.

Mircea Scrob: Very much, so, yes, thank you very much! And is very good that you mentioned the Birmingham Project, sorry….

Lea: Yeah cuz after that, as well, I didn't think you, we would… see like I don't know what the definition is so like I didn't know I could count it but I’ve just finished as well [i.e. the Birmingham Project] like a couple weeks ago.

Amal: Oh that's amazing, how did you find it?

Lea: Um, you know what, I feel like we weren't given enough information. Like we got given like loads of like packages and all that stuff but like it wasn't a lot of detail, so I felt like it was a struggle for like a minute. But I really enjoyed it because the group was really, it was really interesting like, because I do law and then everyone, I’m so used to being around people that do the same stuff as me and I was surrounded by like chemical engineers, I was surrounded by, um, physicists, yeah. I cannot remember - I think the other one was business management; yeah, so it was really interesting.

Amal: For sure, I think the thing is like, with your course – Law - you're kind of taught to, like, if not necessarily students are the same. You know students are the same course but you're kind of taught to deal with people, because eventually that's where your life or your career will kind of…have a level of interaction with people, whereas you know with like more science based courses. While there's more of an aspect of, we do learn about business, especially in chemical engineering we do learn about kind of the entrepreneurial side of things, where it's like: you might come up with the product or at the end of the day, you could have to do thing, you might have to do things like financial analysis of stuff. But we don't necessarily, apart from the very technical, like, Oh, like a reactor is burst somewhere, we need to, you know, take care of this. We don't really get a very social aspect of the course and so you'll probably see all of us, just like creeping out into different parts of the uni just because something, we want to see the world.

Lea: No, no, I, I do agree - that's actually one of the reasons why I did the project because I wanted, um, not only like engage with like learning how to work in a team in that sense, but also learning how to work with people that don’t have the same call, so don't have the same kind of….Um, general goals kind of thing, like we would have a common idea so, yeah, I do have a lot of engineering friends, though, so you guys do branch out.

Amal: We do, we do that, that's how we survive like, honestly, like you, you understand this yourself is probably loads and loads of reading, in law.

Lea: Oh gosh, yes. Yes!

**Question: Were there any group-based projects in your degree course?**

Mircea Scrob: Can I ask both of you, and maybe, Amal, to start, to start with you, so were there any group-based projects in mechanical engineering? Anything that had to be done even, even within the same group of people, let’s say with engineers, or with…even branching out more into the STEM projects, were there any group projects that you have done in the five years?

Amal: So for sure we definitely have group projects every single year, I think this is more so with chemical engineering, but the issue with my course specifically is that….we're very closed off in that the school of chemical engineering is different from the school of engineering. Which is very absurd, if you think about it, because I think mechanical, electrical and….civil they're all classed as just engineering, whereas biochemical and chemical are more classed with the school of chemistry, but as a school of engineering we’re completely separate. So we do have group projects within ourselves, but we don't have like the opportunity to interact with different schools - so I know that, like I’ve had friends in electrical engineering and mechanical engineering and they've got interdisciplinary, um, projects with mechanical engineers and Civil Engineers so they all get together and they do a massive project, whereas we're just put into groups of six just within our degree and, like, obviously, you get because we're such a massive cohort of about 200 students, you do get the chance to like meet, meet and speak to someone that you don't necessarily know but also eventually by the end of the three to four years you kind of know everybody, and so it's not necessarily… It, it puts - the workload in itself is stressful, so there's like, there's an aspect of, oh, this is amazing, we’re all suffering together and that's like the camaraderie you get, but in terms of group work, it's very kind of limited to just the work we do, as opposed to you know….interactive more fun stuff.

Mircea Scrob: Fair. And Lea, can I ask about, about the Birmingham Project, because now, I remember, back in the day, it was two weeks or something like that?

Lea: Yeah, it is, is two weeks, but I do, I do feel like they say it’s 2 weeks, but in reality is like eight days. Some of the days are just kind of like: celebration days, prize days, that kind of stuff but it's like eight intense days of like just working with your group. So the projects that I, the Birmingham project it was like six….Um, branches, like six topics, themes that you could choose and I choose, like, exploring technology and innovations. And our challenge was, hold on, how can immersive technology have positive impact, like social and environmental impact, and that's like a really difficult question, by the way. Because it's like you're talking about immersive technologies and then you decide to bring environment in and like, it's like immersive technologies are like basically escaping the environment, so it’s like….It was a really interesting question to….be given. Yeah, go on.

Amal: Sorry, what do you mean by escaping the environment?

Lea: No, so, um, it's not like, it's not saving the environment it's… oh sorry, escaping the environment! Yeah, oh so it's like you've got like…immersive technologies - this is something I had to be explained a good few times, so meaning like VR, so virtual reality, augmented reality. So that idea that you just put a headset on and… you kind of go into a virtual world so it's like you know how like you've got VR games?

Amal: yeah, yeah no I understand the concept, it's more so what you mean escaping…

Lea: so yeah, like you’re escaping so you're not really in your normal reality - you're in, you're probably in your living room, you know in actual like….the outside world, I don't know if that….

Amal: No, no, no, I understand that and that's fair I think - I’ll give you my perspective on what I understand from immersive technologies but are like applications of what I’ve seen it in. Normally, when, at least in like the engineering sense when we apply immersive technologies we kind of use it to remedy things that we can't easily access, if you get what I mean?, so like usually what happens at least what they’re trying to do, oh sorry, let me explain it to you….In, in, in the manufacturing sense, which is what I have most experience with. What a lot of people in the immersive technology kind of space do is they create models of all the equipment and all of the….Um, you know, reactors, machines, all of this stuff in the manufacturing space that you wouldn't necessarily easily have access to, and what they tried to do is it kind of create like a virtual model. That you can eventually, as you said, you, you're in your own environment. But you're able to virtually control something else, something that's far away and something that's difficult to access so while it seems like you know we're kind of just secluded to our, um…And, to be fair, like for normal consumers like you and I, when we think of VR, AR we think of things like gaming, shopping and stuff like that. Yeah, like in more of like a manufacturing or technologies sense even like in medicine and things like that, the virtual immersive technologies used to do things remotely, things that you can't access easily you know, for example, like how you've got your Google maps and stuff. They kind, they kind of do that for like manufacturing equipment and they sometimes even do that for….Um, I don't, I don't know if this is a thing it feel, I feel like there's a thing like this, but like people in medicine, they've got...they basically, for very small kind of micro, micro surgeries they have robots that are controlled virtually by them, that are used for like microsurgery so I know! completely off topic, but like….

Lea: No, no, that's kind of like what we, we had to do like a lot of reading on it, and that is like stuff that we did come across and that’s….

Amal: For sure, for sure… yeah I mean… and kind of what we wanted to move towards, the idea of immersing ourselves in….

Mircea Scrob: But who was your technology partner? Because I think that at one point…Yes, sorry…

Lea: Oh no, no, no, sorry, what did you want to say exactly?

Mircea Scrob: No, I just wanted to ask because usually they used to have stakeholders engaging with the Birmingham Project, and they will, I think it was [partner 1], at one point, and there was [partner 2] at another point so did you have a technology partner or a stakeholder that could guide you through the process?

Lea: Yeah, yeah, so we had, we did get… We were partnered with [partner 2]. That was a company that we were partnered with, and we obviously had like challenges team leads, and we had like teaching assistants that were helping us throughout. At the end it wasn't really interacting with as much as because - obviously, like they're a big company, and they are very busy people and they weren't really able, there was still, still provided the prize and, like, everything after the chat, like after the project but…

Amal: Did you, did you guys win?

Lea: It would have been quite nice if you've got given some of their guidance - we got from our challenge lead more than anything, really. And, I think, with the Birmingham Project like every single group gets given a different challenge, so it was it was a bit….

Amal: I think there's like a lag….

Lea: I’d say… because, like some groups got given questions that were easier to approach - like there was, one of the group where given a question based on like how ethical technologies can be, that kind of thing, how can we make it more ethically - feel like that was a different way of approaching technology compared to how we had to approach it and I think that's, the main challenge for us - by the way, we really enjoyed it.

Mircea Scrob: Yeah, if, you, if you both did the Birmingham Project, then I would say that that will qualify, I will not even put this, this other question now because it is about your studies, curricular or extracurricular, but yeah it's interesting that the Birmingham project is not really or necessarily considered an enterprise or entrepreneurship opportunity because I would say that that is something that I, I always think about as being one of the best examples of that. But yeah, maybe, maybe, let me, let me go through some of the definitions and that will clarify some of the things and once we have the definitions, we will have a common ground for what we are discussing about and I think that will, that will help focus the discussions even more. But very well done, if you have done, both of you, the Birmingham project and it's such, such an amazing opportunity, although yes, for two weeks, well actually eight days…including the days before the Birmingham Project, the actual boot camp starts, I think, yes, it is quite intense.

**Question: In the light of the QAA definitions of enterprise and entrepreneurship education, has your answer to the earlier question, about whether or not you are engaged in this, changed?**

Mircea Scrob: Right, I will be doing some talking now for around five minutes because I do have to go through all of the definitions and all of the… subtle differences between them, but if you wish, do stop me at any single point and I will be able to, um, to give clarification - so please ask me if there are any things that do not really add up, and I will be happy to explain some of the things. So, very much in the literature, what we are finding as a concept is entrepreneurial education, this is the thing that is usually used in the guidance as to the university. So, if you look at the quality assurance agency, this is the...the term that is usually used for any kinds of education that covers both enterprise and entrepreneurship. So entrepreneurial education is very much an umbrella term - it covers both enterprise and entrepreneurship and may be used to discuss the combination of both. But what is Enterprise and Entrepreneurship education after all? So enterprise education, usually refers to any kind of educational opportunity that is aimed at creating ideas, behaviours, attributes or competencies that will make things happen - so it's very much oriented towards making students have a more applied learning and making, well, effectively making things happen. And what is key about enterprise education is that this is non-specific for a certain discipline: it can be embedded into any discipline and it doesn't have to have a…focus on creating a business, but it is just loading on a specific discipline and giving it the more applied direction. So some of the competencies that are usually covered by enterprise education and are developed by it are: creative problem solving, so it can be design thinking or it can be anything about providing a problem or solution to a challenging problem; calculated risk taking, critical thinking, spotting opportunities, adaptability and reflection; so very high level, very generic skills that are intended to be developed by this kind of educational opportunities. And some of the ways of delivering it are very much experiential activities - so these are simulations, boot camps, the Birmingham project, I think it is, it is a very good example of that because it is very experiential, it is very problem based: you are given a problem, and you are tasked with coming up with a solution. Authentic assessments are a hallmark of it, so this is again geared towards the idea of making learning as applicable to the world out there as possible - so what are some of the typical methods of assessments: are white papers; Um, can be can be a policy report, or can be even something like writing a blog post that will explain a basic scientific concept to a lay audience, or it can be curating a film exhibition if you're coming from….from film studies. And what again is very central to this kind of educational opportunities is the idea of group work - we have already touched upon, because it's the idea of…getting to work with different personalities and learning styles and even better if you are being able to work across different disciplinary boundaries. Now with entrepreneurship education, what this is aimed at is basically taking some of the skills and practices from enterprise education and giving it a more applied direction towards building a business, starting a new business or becoming self-employed - so basically with starting up. So this very much touches upon all of the competencies that we have just discussed but adds some of them that are very much geared towards the business side of things: so you get training into business and finance, IP and legal awareness, digital marketing, risk management, negotiation skills and networking skills that are so important to the…to the self employed or the freelancing community. And some of the pedagogical practices that are most often used are standalone modules: so these are modules that can be for credit or outside of the…of the credit system, and they are providing a sort of a bird's eye view of all the stages of starting up a new business and they usually take a little bit of time and they are again very practical, very experiential because you are given a task and you're told to create a startup or a business around that kind of problem that has been identified. And we are going to look at some of the examples later on into this focus group. So all in all, what entrepreneurial education covers is both enterprise education and entrepreneurship education - entrepreneurship it is more business oriented whereas enterprise can be anything that it is very much applied, problem-based, experiential and has this innovative method of assessment. So now, if I were to ask you again if you had any experience of learning enterprise and entrepreneurship, what would be your answer? Did it change? Did the definitions make you to change a different perspective on the question?

Lea: Um, just need a minute to process it, to consider all the differences…

Mircea Scrob: Take your time, take your time and if there are any questions, please do ask.

Amal: Well, personally, for me, I think, when you kind of defined it as an application of this skills, um, application of the knowledge that you've learned, I think… Just specific to my course I have seen a lot of opportunities for that, but I know that… they, at least with chemical engineering they've tried to do that because we've got a very varied set of skills, and I mean varied set of skills that are very ambiguous just going into industry, so they try to equip you with… Um, as many skills as they can. Um, but I think just within the University, I think I can, would it be okay if I just listed off a couple of things?

Mircea Scrob: Please, yes, definitely.

Amal: Um, so I think just within my… course, not necessarily application, but more so giving us the knowledge about entrepreneurship, like if you, if you started off then - I know that with my course we've had a lot of, um… visiting kind of industry lecturers or industry links that kind of not necessarily teach you but inform you of the skills that you need to have, which I feel it's pretty useful and there you kind of get to apply your networking skills, because you know, it's after a lecture you walk up to the front of the lecture theatre and you introduce yourself, or you follow up and you send someone a LinkedIn message. So that's how it kind of starts within the course we have a lot of, as I said before, we've got…we've got mass, every single year in engineering, we have a very big technical project, so we have a module just assigned to a technical project. And even though it's completely theoretical where we're kind of using assumptions and from scratch building like a factory sizing equipment and, you know, doing costing, cost benefit analysis, return on investment analysis of things, that's how we kind of, at least theoretically apply our knowledge - it sometimes the essence of, you know, teamwork gets lost between the types of people that you come across and depend, and if it's, if it's very work and content heavy, because eventually in group projects there's an individual aspect to it as well, which is usually worth more marks and so people tend to, um, apply more of the effort there, but there is definitely like an aspect of applying the knowledge that you have. And at the end of my degree we have something called the design project, which uses concepts that you learn from Year 1 all the way to Year 3, so it's, it's a very steep learning curve, but it's also, it also kind of gives you a taste of what the real world is like, because if you go into the real world, yeah, you're going to be sizing a heat exchanger, that's just going to happen. And so, yeah, that, those are aspects that you have; and then while it's not directly just entrepreneurship, like I’m not always like coming up with the product and trying to sell it in my course, we do have the option to choose business-based modules, which I personally did cuz I enjoy that kind of thing. And there they have more interactive stuff, so that's quite interesting; something that the uni does, which I find really useful is the Careers Network, they have loads of, you know, networking events and even if I’m not selling a product I’m essentially selling myself to these recruiters so that I get a massive job with a really big paycheck at the end of it, which is, which is a big dream for all of us. Um, so while that isn't necessarily entrepreneurship it does mean I’m applying the skills of networking, it doesn't mean I’m applying the skills of negotiation. And, if nothing else I’m kind of also gaining knowledge of what the current job market looks like, of what the current skill sets that are more important look like. And, you know, there's a constant like risk of walking into these events where you could make the worst impression and ruin the rest of your career, but you do manage risk taking, and the type of talking you doing these events, if you get what I mean. So, yeah, I guess, I guess that's like… and there's also just within the University - people don't realize this - and like, to be fair, I was, I kind of focus more on my degree than I did the entrepreneurship, um, opportunities, but there are so many group project opportunities and there's so many ways you can interact with, um, there's so many project-based things that are extracurricular the uni offers that if you just Google it you'll find that people don't really know. Like there's, there's so many students I know that would have been interested in something like Birmingham Project, but nobody really knew that it was going on. The only reason I knew was because I’m an international student and I when I first came to the UK, I was like, I’ve got to look at all of these stalls that I’ve never had access to before and that's how you learn about the Birmingham Project - otherwise like nobody has an idea and nobody's doing any extra googling so…you know there's things like Vice-Chancellors project which, which is actually like an extended Birmingham Project, but you do get, I think, a cash prize at the end of it, which is fantastic; Um, there's, you know, opportunities called a business book or something where you can come up with your own business idea and try to sell it; there's Enactus where you can try and sell, try and do like…environmentally friendly businesses - so there is access to this kind of stuff; it's just people don't really know about it.

Mircea Scrob: Fair, yeah, no, that's a fair point that's, that's, that's exactly how it is, and yeah, there is also the Start-up society, and there is, there is also the Be-Enterprising project, so there are good. And it's always surprising with the Birmingham project, yes, how unaware some people are about, about it, which is such a shame; But can I ask about the, the design project that you mentioned and the module that was about designing a factory - is this a mandatory module on the course, or is it optional?

Amal: It's mandatory; it's like the design project is kind of like, well it's the equivalent of a thesis almost. It's about 45 to 60 pages, depending on how much work you've actually done, but it's like at some points - the thing is, that because of Covid the University has changed the structure so that, I mean the structure of courses and we've obviously got semesterization now; in the past, pre-Covid, pre-semesterization, the design project in your third year would run from the beginning of the year to the end of the year. Um, where you're kind of, while you have miniature deadlines in between, it's kind of complete…, there's so many aspects and there's so much research and going on, that it does take up a massive chunk of you year, to the point where nobody's actually studying for their any other, um, modules - because mostly a lot of modules were exam-based, so nobody would study for modules until they would finished their design project by March, and then they only, they study the 11 subjects that they've also got in the Easter period - that's how intensive it is, yep, it's, it is compulsory.

Mircea Scrob: Oh, thank you very much, interesting, really interesting. Lea, what was your experience?

Lea: Um, Amal has named quite a lot of things that I have never actually heard about, so it goes back to the point that we don't actually know a lot about them, opportunities that the university provides at least; never mind all the other opportunities that we can get outside of it. But in terms of like, group projects because I feel like that's probably where you would start with the idea of like gaining enterprise skills, you want to work in a group and we don't actually have a lot of group work, um, in my course which is…quite surprising, you would probably say, um, but I think we've only had like one group project altogether and I don't, I don't think they plan to do any more, mainly because it's quite independent. Like our course, but then… in terms of like self, like, self-employment or like opportunities that you kind of create yourself, create an idea and all that stuff, I feel like that's quite difficult. Um, currently, as a student - for law students, I’m just going to speak for the stuff I actually know. Because I can tell that, like, Chemical Engineering, have a lot of opportunities - that you guys create stuff and all these projects that you guys have them, the main stuff that we really have is like pro bono group societies. And I feel like that some…opportunities are, at least as a first-year student that we are aware of, like joining a society, joining the [inaudible] and then you know, sustaining that existing business, in a way, because you are providing a service for all the students that are joining, really, and…I don't mean - like Birmingham Project is the one that I can name; a lot of the skills that we gain about entrepreneurship like negotiation skill, for example, networking; all that kind of stuff comes in, like, work experience for us. That's where we really gain all of these skills and, and again, they're so hard to get for first year student; that's really, that's another barrier for us just because it's like we're so new to it that's really hard to gain those skills for us. Or to even like get the opportunity to expand on them on your first year, at least. I do know that, like, in your second year you get a lot more opportunities. Because a lot of the stuff that - like when you're reading the work experience stuff, it just says: mainly for penultimate years or final year students and I think that's kind of where it makes it difficult for availability for first year students at least. But second year I do think there's going to be a lot more… Yeah, I don’t know, because I feel like Amal's in the fifth year, so she’s lot more knowledge that I will.

Amal: No, that, that's the thing that's unfortunate at the uni - needs to kind of push more is just that knowledge that, like. If, you…

Lea: Lots of opportunities, I know there are, because they get lots of like Canvas notifications… saying that you… can do this, you can… like if you already have a business as well, you can like… this… the university does support it – there are lots of schemes for that kind of stuff. And another one is the Careers Network are really, really helpful with that kind of… the skills that you need to start a business, they do provide all the help but…

Amal: it's, it's not just that it's not, sorry to interrupt, it's not just, it's not just that, it's just that the, the uni that needs to push the mindset forward that it's not like - needs to put the mindset forward that… people aren't only like, people aren't faffing around in their first year, there are driven students, like you, that want opportunities that, that's the issue with the like, the thing is the current job market doesn't explain to you that…Amal: all of your other experiences that you've had getting into uni are just as useful - you just need to know how to talk about them. So like I don't know about you, but I came, I came from a completely different education system: I’m from India, I was raised in Dubai. I’m totally far removed from all of the extracurricular activities that people in this country have access to, so I remember in the first in, at the end of first year - the beginning of second year, I was applying to get into placements and everybody around me had [intelligible], they were going to scout. And you know I come from a very conservative Muslim background, so I didn't have access to like music classes or dance classes or things like that, and like I, I was also like pretty ill growing up, so I wasn't doing any sports. So I got to like, I got to uni and I realized, I have no other skills, apart from the fact that I’ve like consistently just been able to go to school and do my exams. And, you know, in that space you're just like: oh yeah, we don't have any skills and we don't have the opportunities to move forward. People just don't realize that it's about how you talk about yourself that gets you the opportunity - and a good introduction from the Uni, or from like, doing networking helps; like don't feel discouraged that, you know, you're kind of early on and that you're not getting opportunities - if you, if you're confident enough to do your networking right, just put yourself forward and be like: Hi! I’m a first-year student,

Lea: I have, I have done that, to be fair, I have like… I’ve joined the pro-bono group, which is actually like quite difficult to join in, and I think, they do quite purposely like give it, um, second years, just because the students won’t really be able to provide… so pro bono is group is free legal advice for, for a specific project that you get put yourself into; like you can choose, if you want to join, this project or not, and I think that's where you kind of start building on the enterprise skills really like critical thinking and like creative problem solving; that's really where all of our skills are in terms of universities, but I have like done stuff like…before university really - the head girl, so that's where I started really joining, um, I think my, by the way, my Internet might disconnect a bit because it's quite unstable but… I have like lead student meetings at my sixth form school, um… I have joined, like, a lot of, I say important meeting in terms of my school, but then again it's quite small scale, because it's like secondary school, sixth form, so I have like had opportunities before university, I would say, and I also, like, was part of like…The NCS regional youth board so it's…where you kind of come together…After you've done and you work on a project. I think that's where I also built my enterprise skills, because you all came together trying to find solutions to like… A project that we decided - so we chose like period poverty. So they have been like opportunities before university, but going to University, I think, a lot of our mindset of focusing on enterprise skills, I think for us it's more like having to… just kind of get an idea of what's really happening and what the long-term goals are. Because we've decided that we want to do, study whatever degree we want, but in terms of like enterprise skills it's like, it's something that you start thinking about a bit like in your second semester you kind of, oh, maybe I should have done this, maybe I should have applied for this, maybe into this skill. Um, but yeah, I do think that there was a lot of stuff available but it's not something that, um, issues that they really talk about, they're just kind of like, you just study, you don't need to worry about all this stuff right now. Even though I think there's a lot of students that are like well capable of learning more about enterprise, and I do think a lot of us would benefit from it. Um, some more education on this stuff.

Mircea Scrob: I mean, can I, can I ask about this one, let me, let me just bring in this, this other this other slide and I think we can both agree that. You both, and I see the value of enterprise and entrepreneurship and why it should be done; but now it's, it's do you think it's more of a problem of making students aware and informed about the opportunities of doing this? And that's the reason why people don't engage with it, necessarily, because they don't know about it? Or do you think it is a step even further and making students aware that this is important to be done, even in the first year or in the second year, and it is, it is definitely something that needs to be had? So basically do you think that students are aware of the fact that it is important to do this kind of educational opportunities and they are just not informed? Or they don't really think that this is important for themselves?

**Question: Is it lack of awareness of the availability of entrepreneurial education opportunities at university, or lack of awareness of or belief in the importance of them, that is more of a barrier to student engagement in these opportunities?**

Lea: Um, I think, from my perspective, I do think it is important, but a lot of us don't know why it's important; like we kind of, we don't know why we need to be, um…Why we need to be educated on enterprise, at least; because we know we're going to work for a firm and, and there is like a lot of push of like you're going to work for someone and it's not like a push of like you can, you know you can create your own ideas? And if you want you kind of, you can create your own projects kind of thing and there's not a lot of push for like that self-employment, I would say. So I think that's also a reason why they've probably, what we don't need to worry about that, because we're going to end up working for a firm, for God knows how long. And then afterwards we'll worry about it, when we've got the skills, so I do think there is like you do need to remind them. How it's important or how it really applies to each student, because it will apply quite differently to each person, I would say, not every person, I’d say like course, I do think it applies differently. Yeah, I think that's, I do, I do find it quite [inaudible] because I have thought about like self-employment, you know starting my own business in terms of like my own firm but that's really ambitious and it's really hard to like even think about; it's like something you keep in the back of your head, really. Yeah, it doesn't seem quite possible, so maybe that's something that we should be educated on as well.

Amal: Um, I’m definitely in agreement with some of the stuff Lea said; I feel like, um, I feel like people do kind of overlook this kind of stuff because at the end of the day, we're all…kind of trained into the idea of it's easier to work for someone than it is to work for yourself; I feel like…if there was anything that could have been done to make entre, enterprises and entrepreneurship more appealing for me is - I think I’ve mentioned this before - it's important for me to…do something that has a direct effect on me; you know it's very easy for people to be like, oh, yeah, holistically, you know, altruistically we're going to do this extra thing that's going to enrich our lives, but in the reality of, the reality of the situation is…you’re already burnt out and you're already kind of extremely tired from the work that you're already doing that all of this extra stuff is just more stuff that you're having to schedule in and, you know, logistically put into your life and it's really difficult. And, like, if I, if there was something that could have been done, which I mean I’m quite lucky that my course does it, but it needs to be something that is marked, something that is…not necessarily taught but has a direct implication on your degree, so that it…you know, people are motivated to do it more - because the thing is, some students like I’m, I’m quite lucky that, you know, when I was joining Uni I had family that was in….well, not, well not necessarily in a company, but like you know, I was able to get some sort of guidance of like Oh, these are the opportunities, you need to be looking out for. And these are the types of skills that you need to think about, whereas there's so many people that come from different backgrounds that just don't…know any of those things; there are like if you're coming from a family that's working you know…A job like, like these people have been working retail jobs for their entire lives and they, that's how they're doing it, hand to mouth and they don't have access to…you know all of these fantastic jobs, they're not going to know the kind of skills that you need and the way the things that you need to, you know,…either; oh sorry, they don't know this types of skills that you need or the types of opportunities that you need to look out for, and so it needs to be made, like a compulsory part of their education.

Mircea Scrob: That's good, that's interesting, yes; and do you think? When you, when you said that it has to be marked or assessed, do you mean that it has to be, well, to have this kind of finality or input? Or does it have to be for credit? It actually has to be credit bearing, so I think the Birmingham Project is not credit bearing, is it? And do you…you think it will make a difference if it would be credit bearing and counting towards the degree?

**Question: Does whether the entrepreneurial education opportunity is credit bearing or not make a difference to its value?**

Lea: In my perspective, I don't think… Credit really… this, genuinely, this is my perspective, I can't speak for everyone, I do you think… if it was credit bearing people would obviously do, but even if it wasn't, I do think there's a lot like, if someone wants to expand their skills, they would, they would join in that thing. Because I have, like, a lot of the people that were… in the group, I kind I did speak and like network quite a bit in the Birmingham project and a lot of people were saying that they initially did it…Not even because they wanted to create an idea or something, but it was genuine because they wanted to learn more skills they wanted to…engage more with, like, teamwork - something to write on their CV and, and I do think there is a push of like, if I can do something and I can write it in my CV and I can talk about it, I will do it. And it's like because a degree it's like, it's just one section of your whole CV, right? Like it's just education, and I think the experience aspect of it like, if there's a way of people writing that we have these enterprise skills, I think more people would genuinely be engaged with it.

Amal: I definitely agree with what you're saying, but I think that also needs to be an aspect of, you know, while there's a lot of learning by doing, there's also a certain aspect of things that you need to be taught certain things, that need to be explicitly explained and while like things at Birmingham project they do give you some sort of coaching and they do give you, um, access to resources like that, I feel like there are some things that you need a starting point of, and if you kind of make it compulsory at just within your degree, you're giving everyone an opportunity to kind of level the playing field, if you get what I mean.

Lea: Yeah, that’s a good point, yeah.

Mircea Scrob: Alright! All interesting perspectives, thank you very much for sharing them; let's make a move, also, to some to some explicit scenarios because…yeah, we have half an hour to go, and I would be keen to get your perspective on this kind of educational opportunities that are offered at University of Birmingham. So quite a good number of them are already taught here, and I think what would be good, is just to have a bit of a discussion about what is provided, what do you think of this kind of educational opportunities, whether you would do them or not, why yes, why not, and how they could be improved?

**Question: What do you think of these entrepreneurial education opportunities and how could they be improved?**

Mircea Scrob: So the first one is an example of enterprise and entrepreneurship education opportuni… opportunity that is a standalone module, so this is credit bearing, it's taken by final year students in the Liberal Arts and Natural Sciences department, this is a standalone entrepreneurial module, and the concept for it is that the students work in groups to come up with a line of products or services from ideation up to pitching to a panel of industry experts, so we very much have collaborations with external partners on the module and the assessments are authentic - again, these are the outputs that are very much sought after in the world of work: if you were to start the business, this is what you would have to present, a business pitch, a business plan, and then a mock job interview in which you are asked a combination of strength based and competency-based questions. The problems - they do come from the local areas; so it's Digital Birmingham that usually provide this kind of problems to be tackled: it has to do with social isolation, with housing, with health, what have you - whatever is important in the local area. And the idea is to cover all stages of the business creation cycle so everything from ideation, which touches upon design thinking strategies, optimization, in which you look at business model canvas and also at costing your proposed service or product, IP and patenting; there was another entry here that, unfortunately, I have deleted because I thought that that is perhaps too ‘sciencey’. But there is also rapid prototyping involved, and that is doing 3D printing and engaging a little bit with 3D printing and using AutoCAD. There is digital marketing as well, so designing a website and doing some online advertising and, at the end, you get some presentation skills by doing a pitch and getting acquainted, also, with the format for the business plan.

Lea: In my perspective…And, again, this is like, for my module, like a module I would do my degree, I think…The possible problem - I don't think, because I have like…I want to start with the, the main problem that I’m thinking: it's like, like you said, it might be a bit too sciency…For like…like a degree like mine, but I will say I have recently like spoken to a few, like, solicitors. And they have said that, like any kind of knowledge you can gain, in terms of, like, regardless of how sciency or how law-related it is, it's always relevant. Because you, there's always going to be like a business approaching you and you will need to understand their business and any knowledge is good knowledge. For my degree, I would say so. But in terms of like wanting people to actually, like, participate in this and, like, actually people getting engaged and getting something out of it. I do think it's like the, the part where it's like solutions, like problem statements, that kind of stuff. And like business pitch, having a plan, like figuring out how you can expand, I guess, like just putting, contextualizing it in Law, I would say: how can a firm expand and how can a firm grow in a specific area? I would say that kind of stuff would genuinely be beneficial, that’s people, people would engage with it because it's something that they can actually talk about and be like, you know, I took this module and it taught me how can I expand your business? How, how am I a good addition to your firm? And I’m, like, you're, you're more conscious of like what works well for a firm and what doesn't work for a firm, but I think that's where it starts - like you have to make sure that each module is…designed for each course; because, yeah, like the 3D printing, like, I love the idea but I really don't know how…we would find it beneficial in terms of talking about it in an interview, let's say, or how we would be able to use it. I’m not, I’m not killing the dream. I’m just saying. In general, like, that's a feedback, really, but I do think, like, the idea of, like, how…providing solutions to problems - that's genuinely something that people would benefit from knowing about.

Mircea Scrob: Right, I see, so it is important to be tailored to your, to your interest on law, to your law degree - so these models have to be adapted to the specializations that the students are doing, is it?

Lea: Yeah, but then I feel like you could, you could talk about in any course really, like, I cannot think of any course because I feel like all the engineering probably love this stuff. I don't know, it's like…

Mircea Scrob: Can I ask, actually? If this would be, if this would be - sorry about that - if this would be law, let's say it's, it’s application of artificial intelligence to, yeah, to law, for instance - let's say it's, it's a start-up that looks at automating some of the, some of the searches in case law and coming up with, with a database that it is perhaps a little bit more sifted - you don't have to go through the entire database…yourself, you have this artificial intelligence that kind of predefines somethings, finds some of the case law, trawls some of the case law, and perhaps even predefines some of the contracts or whatever it is, it's helping people around? I’m sorry?

Lea: That would be of a lot of interest, because we do have like modules that are a lot commercial based like I, like you said, the artificial intelligence. Um, yeah, I think, that thing…genuinely… really like, case analysis or else… we have to read so many pages - I do think like if you had a whole module that taught you how you can be more efficient, with your…studies and research and all that kind of stuff I do… Yeah, that would be really cool.

Mircea Scrob: Alright, sounds good, sounds interesting; by the way I did want to mention, I think there is a module similar to this one, not quite, but it is more about law. I think it might be a second year - Enterprising law or something like that it is called?

Lea: Um, I don't remember all of the optional; I think this is third year, like all the commercial aspect of it, because I think second year it's more like land law, property law, legal solutions.

Mircea Scrob: It might be. I will have, I will have a look and share with you, just in case it is still running, as part of, of sharing the voucher but, yeah, I had to, I had to say it now, before it slips my mind. Amal, what do you think about this kind of offerings? Would it be appealing to you? Why? Why not?

Amal: Um, so I have done this as part of my courses, this isn't something new to me at least personally; Um, I am, would be, and was interested in it, I think my only issue with this is when they've introduced this module - so you mentioned that it was in third year; Personally, in my opinion, that should be something that happens in the first year because students are a lot more abstract in first year, they are able to be a lot more creative in the first year because, by the time you get to third year, you've listened to and kind of understood, a concept and a way of thinking so much that it… sometimes, it kind of limits the way you think; so, I feel like if students were introduced to something like this in their first year. Again, with things with like widening horizons modules, I don't think stud… I don't think that module could have been done at any other point of their degree, except for the first year because students coming in…This is such a, this is a very pessimistic point of view, but like that's when they have the most life and the most ability to learn, because you've just come from a very intense, you know, regimented learning experience to…a slightly less intense, but in terms of different ways, um learning experience and so…I love the concept of it, love the aspects of it, the only thing would be: it should, I would rather have it in the first year in than in the third year because then, when I get to in the third year, while I have more knowledge, I have less…of like a wider outlook, if that makes sense.

Mircea Scrob: Makes sense.

Lea: I just have put in the chat all of the options that we have in the 3rd year. Just in case you would like to check, yeah, well we don't get to do all of them.

Mircea Scrob: Still I don't think I’ve seen this one, I will check, because I know the name of the lecturer and I will check and I will share it because it's a new, it's a new module that has been made available, just because of this issue of… of tackling the issue of enterprising, entrepreneurship, employability and it is made again on the, on the ideation stage, stage of finding a problem but it's very much embedded into, into law. And actually, this is the second example that that I would like to present, so this module that is very standalone this is nonspecific it can be…applied in any discipline and it can be tailored to any discipline but it doesn't necessarily have to be so; it can be about just finding a problem and commercializing it and it can be this kind of wide social issues. That you just bring your knowledge to the table, but it doesn't have to be grounded in the discipline. The other example of enterprise education is very much so, is very much grounded in the disciplines that are being discussed. And this is a particular example of a consultancy model, so it's a partnership between academia and industry projects in which…we have partners that come, as with the Birmingham project, to give a problem and provide some support for it, but again, it is embedded in the curriculum because you're earning credits for it and you have also taught… sessions on it. And the module does come from the College of Arts and Law but it's not important the specific module that you are discussing; try to think about the principles behind it and how they might apply to your own discipline. And whether it would be appealing or not - so this specific example is a professional, is a second-year module, professional research skills for linguists, so it comes from English and Linguistics. And what did they do, what they did, is that they had a partner West Midlands police who came and presented them with a problem, and the problem was how to rebrand the West Midlands police in such a way that it will appeal to BAME communities, because they were looking to recruit, they had a shortage of staff on these communities and they were looking into bringing in more applicants, for officers in West Midlands. So here what was important was that this problem, was set up by the, by the external partner, and they had to use Problem Solving, they had to use design thinking methodology to come up with a solution, but very much so it was grounded in the discipline, because the students had to look at linguistic techniques…for making the announcements more appealing, more inclusive, so they had to think about how to frame the announcements, they had to do a sort of linguistic analysis of the announcements that were made before and why they were not working. And what would be some of the solutions that they would make these kinds of job announcements more inclusive and attract more, more applicants from the desired communities. So the question is, what do you think about this module? Do you find it….e rather one final thing about the assessments: 50% was an employer report that was presented to the employers with the findings of the research and 50% was an individual digital presentation about the contribution of each of the group members to the group project. So again, as before, what do you think about this kind of module and again think about the principles, about the partnership with industry, about the problem-based side of things, about being grounded in a specific discipline; is this something that would appeal to you, and why, why not?

Lea: Actually, like as soon as he said, like, problem-solutions, I think we actually do have a module next year: Legal Solutions, that's literally that. So, yes, it is given to us (chuckles). Because it is already like embedded into our course next year. It is Legal Solutions, I just thought of it, as soon as you started saying …it started to ring a bell; It’s next year that, that's probably the reason why I didn't remember it very well. I do, I do like the part where it's like employer report; I think that's where it's like, makes it really, really different from anything we would probably do; it’s like…we don’t get enough like…I say I feel like you have like academics reviewing your work and they usually review based on like research or, um, how, um, yeah, like they will focus on the research aspect of it, but I do think that the employer aspect to it - that's what will differentiate it and that's what will make it a lot, a lot more helpful in the sense of that you gain some real advice from people that are currently…having these problems, you probably would say, even if they don’t, like, that's something that they come up with, and they say… they're coming to you. Similar to like the pro bono group that I mentioned earlier - we provide legal advice, and indeed the reports that we get comes from, like, solicitors, comes from…Police Officers probably, I haven't obviously, it’s next year. We have been told that‘s like it comes from real people. In the sense of like, when it comes to, like, your lectures, you kind of just think they're there, they're there to just help you learn, but when it comes to like employers, they help you understand the real world kind of thing. I don’t know… So yes, that…module appeal to a lot of us, even though there's a lot of language that that would definitely need to be explained in the module. Yeah, like design thinking methodology - you'd lose me with those words.

Mircea Scrob: Fair enough, yeah.

Lea: Yeah, that's just my answer to it - what I could say about this.

Mircea Scrob: Yeah, no, that makes sense - there are some technical terms like the design thinking bit, is something that is, that IBM is doing very well so yeah, yeah, it is something that was done at one point on the Birmingham project, but they…must have…moved away, moved away from it, but yeah, very interesting thoughts, thank you, thank you. Amal, what do you think about it?

Amal: Well, I think, quite simply about it in that because it has an industry partner, it makes it a very, very interesting opportunity for a lot of students. I agree with it being placed in second year, that's good. Um, yeah, I mean I, I think…I think I would have… I feel like this module would need a lot of support, especially because it's a…how is it? linguistic research skills…, I suppose this would be fine for the people doing the course; for me it's a bit…because I’m a little bit far removed from it, there are some things that I would need more support on. But I’m assuming because it's placed in second year, it kind of builds on the first year skills that the students on this degree would have gotten; so, yeah, I think it's pretty good, it's kind of structured the way some of my modules have been in my University so for my third year they do a massive design project where….50% of it would be a group project and 50% of it was an individual digital, not digital presentation, but an individual project and so… I’m familiar with the structure of the module and, yeah, it seems like a pretty decent module to have. I feel like the one difficulty something a module like this would have is if everybody's doing the same… same project, people may struggle with individuality, because now you're just, you're either… you know a lot of people might have the same idea; people think that everybody's creative we're not really…Unless… it's um… I think… The thing is, it would be really difficult to get the kind of engagement from your industry partners, and so you’d need a lot more industry partners to make something like this more possible so that you have a wide range of projects and a wide range of…interest that cater to different students but, yeah, the way this module is structured out it's pretty useful, I’d say.

Lea: Um, sorry… You mentioned, like the part that you'd have to have a lot, a lot of… industry… based like people that are going to be basically reviewing our work, really, they're going to be marking us, they’re going to be assessing us. I do think that that aspect of it might make it more difficult in terms of the assessment aspect of it, like, we all do it. And I do think quite a lot of people will engage with it, as long as there's a lot of like support with it in terms of like explaining the purpose, explaining the language of it, and its application, um…With given that support, people would, students, in my opinion, at least, would engage with it, of course, but…but bringing in like industry, like, employers that might be the difficult part of it, like they might, they might give different feedback to every student; they might have the same exact idea, but then the feedback will definitely be a lot different, I guess. That's where you might want to bring a little more of, like, um, the employers having an agreement of how, how they assess it - like similar to how academics do it, I guess. But I don’t know…. I still think, I still think it's a good, because we are doing that, we are going to be doing Legal Solutions, but I do think the employer report is what differentiates it and the fact that it is… based on like design thinking and in… That’s definitely something that would differentiate it and the linguistic part.

Mircea Scrob: It makes sense. This is, this is the crucial bit, I think, with, with finding enough partners and then with how do you integrate the partners in, in providing the feedback, so I think what, what we usually find is that…that one of the off-putting bits can be because it is such flexible, so flexible and because we have more partners, and because the marking criteria has to be flexible enough, that it will… it will do justice to all of the possible projects that will be developed, it's a little bit vague. So do you think that the students might find it as a risk, well, what happens if the partners are not really that involved? What happens if the marking criteria is not that clear and maybe I will get feedback that is so different, just because the partners are different? Will be, will the students be instrumental, will you be instrumental, rather?

**Question: Do you think students will see the involvement of partners in entrepreneurial education opportunities as a risk?**

Lea: That’s kind of what happened with the Birmingham project, really - the employers weren’t as engaged - this was for just, I think this was just for our theme, like, I spoken to the other themes, and they said that everyone was very engaged, especially like the [partner 4], um, oh what was it called? Um, I can’t remember…The [partner 4], yeah.

Mircea Scrob: [Partner 4] I think it was, yeah.

Lea: Yeah, so, they were really engaged with their groups, but unfortunately they were not so….Like [partner 2] were not so engaged with us, I mean, obviously we did really, we couldn't really say anything and because it's, is optional, and we signed up for it - is a lot more volunteering aspect to it, so we understood that part and they still provided the prize…But I think it terms, like, the employer report…even if they don't assess it, I still think the guidance that they would get, like, as long as they provide the guidance, I think…it would still be beneficial, even if they don't mark it, I still think, because you know the academics know what they’re doing - I’m not saying that the academic are not…they have just as much as knowledge as the employers, but I think that the, yeah, the guidance that they give is something that the students would definitely…want to engage with more - so, like if you had, let's say, West Midlands Police, an official come to the lecture and explaining to us and the purpose of things and really guide as to how we can differentiate each idea to the other. Um, yeah! And how to, you know, lead a group, even if, you know, not everyone can lead a group, you know.

Mircea Scrob: So it would be good to have the feedback from… the, from the employer, from the partners - is going to be, you’re having some finality for it, yeah.

Lea: Yeah that's, I think, the feedback I would give… We still have that so I’m not really complaining. Even if you bought it in I don't think, um, there will be a lot of… people thinking that, oh, my God, I hate this module – like, it's already there and I think that's like a level of, because it's like it's more, sorry, my voice broke. It builds on those enterprise skills, you know, if an employer tells you how you, your ideas, can be better than someone else's or how you can manage those risks that comes with each idea or how you can, like, that's what you, basically, enterprise education, that's where you’re building on those different skills that you'd get - if a lecturer told you, a lecturer will tell you: you know, research it, read into it, you know. And I think, having an employer tell you, this is what makes it different, because it probably won't tell you to research it, just listen to what I’m saying! Yeah!

Mircea Scrob: All right! Amal, anything to add, or should we move to the last slide?

Amal: The last slide is good. I’m fine…

Mircea Scrob: This is about authentic assessment, and there is a lot of text here but we don’t have necessarily to read. Because this one is all about principles so: one example that, that, that we are usually using is still from the Arts and Law College, Modern Language - it's a second year, Global Enterprise projects so here…students have to advise businesses in the UK, about how best to expand into a new market, into a market overseas so…just one of the assessments that is used… This is a White Paper, 75% of the grade and what it is important is that you have to come up with a proper plan for the business to take forward. And again… this draws very much on the models that the students are doing, because the students have to use their knowledge of that culture…to understand the opportunities of the market; have to draw on their knowledge of the language to do the market research, so they basically work as consultants for that firm and they produce a White Paper. But this doesn't necessarily have to be just this particular example - examples of authentic assessments can be just turning…again, a concept, scientific concept, or a law concept even…into a blog post, so that you can make it more accessible to the lay people - and especially with law, it can be quite counterintuitive some of the terminology that it is used and people may not be aware of it. Or it could be something like submitting a proposal for a patent - so going through the entire process as part of a module that is on design, you also take a look on the other issue of…of law and IP law and you submit a patent and you go through the entire process. So the idea behind, behind authentic assessment is to give it a little bit of a more broader relevance - is not just having…an exam that is very much specific to that particular setting but make it more relevant to the world out there and to the kind of challenges that you will encounter in the world of work. So what do you think about these kinds of opportunities? About authentic assessment? Is something that would appeal to you? Why, why not? What are some of the problems that you can see with it?

Amal: Well…, so I, I don't know if I’ve heard you say, if I’ve missed out on the concept of what this exam is, but is it your entire degree amounts to this, or is it just a module?

Mircea Scrob: No, it’s just a module, it is just a second-year module.

Amal: And it's a massive part of the module and that's what makes it important.

Mircea Scrob: 75%, yes.

Amal: Um, I… don't know. The thing is, it depends on how much the module is credited for - I feel like with things like these different… Actually, to be fair, a lot of this stuff is pretty…Um, how do you say, it's pretty standard in the sense of like the types of skills you use to complete it, as opposed to the type of skills that you develop during it. That's the thing, right, when you do something like, entrepreneur and entrepreneurial/enterprise skills, you can't, while I said before, that you know you have to give it some sort of great importance it's also that, because people learn at different stages and in different ways. It's difficult when you give something too much of a stake because, then, you're also putting their degree at risk; I think this is pretty useful in that there are different aspects that can be supported academically so that they can develop on. It's just a little… I think, I think when I see 75% of the overall grade, I get a bit deterred just thinking, whoa, that's a lot of, that's a massive chunk of my grades, if you get what I mean, um.

Lea: Sorry, the grade it’s just for a module, right? Oh, that's pretty normal for us.

Mircea Scrob: It differs, yeah, from department to department – some are going for very, very large chunks; some of them have it more, more spread out.

Lea: We have, like, this… we have like most of our modules like one exam, 100% grade. So 75% it’s still giving us something more...I still… I really like the idea, sorry I didn't mean to interrupt… I really do like it. I think that's what makes it so much more different from all the other modules and that's what makes it real, like that's what makes it like you will have to do that, and I do remember...that not everyone will be, like, interested in, like, commercial law, but I do think that is a big chunk of what, what you will be doing, like in the real world, and I think, yeah, I like the idea, I really do – in case you couldn’t tell, I really do. Because I have spoken to like, again I have speaking like, networking and like when I go to these open days and let people tell you like a lot of what we do is like…making sure that your…whatever contract document you're creating goes through every single possible situation and, and I feel like these kind of, like, market research, E-commerce, language, financial, those are all the things that we would…I mean I don't know if we would but, I from as far as I’ve been told, these are all things that you already have to think about when you're putting together…a contract. And, yeah, I think that's, yeah, that's good. I like it! It's real, like, it's…what we would be doing, you have to know your….by looking to do market research - that's something that I don't think most of us have done yet in our first year; like to do I don't think most of us know how to even do market research, but we know how to do research, we know how to do a reading, you know how to read cases. But, again, this goes back to like, like commercial awareness, which is something that they are constantly shoving into our heads - it's like, they're like: you need to be commercially aware, you need to know this stuff, and this module would really push…A lot of students to…be able to leave the University with a degree that's like meaningful and you can talk about…in like interviews… Yeah, I really like it.

Mircea Scrob: One last question, and maybe, maybe, yeah, quick answer if it's, if it's not too much to ask, because I wouldn't want to keep you more than, more than, the stated timeline: can you please say, I mean, with this authentic assessment and I’m doing something similar as well, it's always difficult to mark, because there is… you have to see how well the market research has been done, and there is a lot of subjectivity that can come into play; would people be a little bit off-put by this as opposed to a multiple choice exams where… everybody gets the same question; you either get the answer well or you do not, and there is no question about subjectivity coming into play, and whether the assessment was fair or not, or all sorts of other things; is that something that would be important for you?

**Question: Would the subjectivity of the marking of authentic assessments be important to you?**

Amal: Yes [chuckles]. Quite straightforward, I mean let's be honest, at the end of the day, everything just becomes a… statistic. Whether or not you have the soft skills or not, when you're trying to get into a job or a company. That's the thing, right: when you say entrepreneurial, enterprise, that's very freelancy, that's very, you know, self-dependent, very…you push what you can, but when you come from like a school of thought, like I do, where I kind of need…Um, I’d rather prefer to do a job for someone, to get into through that door I need my GPA to be above a certain point. And if suddenly I’ve gone from like a 2:1 to a 2:2 because of just one random module thank; like hopefully that's not what happens, but like… If, if it's going to affect my mark that drastically I want there to be some consistency that is not affected by, you know, my access or my understanding of things because… that's the thing, right? If this is all very independent, then what's the support aspect? How, how are students being support to learn, if that makes sense?

Mircea Scrob: Yes, it does, no, it does.

Lea: I think, I think most of us, students, have kind of have given up even thinking about the multiple choice; we don't get them; we know we won't get them. So it’s like…no… we got given one year and it was as soon as I finished that exam I said, yeah, this is the last time I’m going to do an easy exam; is the last time, I just give up hope. And, yeah, but you did phrase a good point, like, we need to… if you're going to do like such a… meaningful, like, real-life kind of module, I do think the support needs to be so much more than, so maybe even consider this being… like… a third year kind of thing, me being like a second year, by the way, but I’m saying like the kind of support that you'd want to give a student, um… As a third year I do feel like there's a lot less people in a specific module, as far as I know, like since there's so many options, there will be less students compared to like the 700 of us that are… So this might be a bit more doable in that sense, something that, um… You can push for more but I still… I do think this is something that will benefit, um…It would mean a lot more support than normal modules, because in normal modules they'd probably just give you more papers to read or they kind of give you… you'd have like contac… we don't even get many contact hours as law students… I do think the contact hours would have to increase with… with the module being so… being so… different to the other modules, I’d probably say, because you have legal solutions, but then you have to consider this is like market research, something that a lot of us are not familiar with. On the get go, unlike the kind of language of…the class if you have to do, like that's not something that we're familiar… Obviously, that's the, that's the part where you learn, and you grow. But, yeah, the support needs to be there - like a lot more contact hours per term.

Mircea Scrob: Thank you - that's what we found out, yes, it's always difficult on the, on the educational, on us offering this kind of modules as well, because it is much more work than the traditional modules as well, and that has to change… university wide, it has to be recognized, more generally, that this kind of models do require more work… it's not, it's not the same amount as the ones that were a little bit more traditional in their… in their teaching.

**Closing:**

Mirce Scrob: But thank you very much, both! I would just skip to the end and give you again my contact details, this was really, really interesting and thank you very much for sharing your thoughts!

Lea: Thanks.

Amal: Thanks for having us.

Mircea Scrob: And I will be sending the voucher by the end of today and also the debriefing about how the data is being used and how you can withdraw from… the from the focus group. All right! Enjoy the summer, thank you very much again.

Amal: Thank you, you too.

Mircea Scrob: Bye bye!